

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE SEPTEMBER 11, 2013

4. HERITAGE REVIEW OF NEW DEVELOPMENT AT SW CORNER OF KEELE STREET AND MAJOR MACKENZIE DRIVE – WARD 1

Recommendation

Cultural Services recommends:

- 1) That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed demolition for 9964 Keele Street, 10 Church Street, 12 Church Street, 2285 Major Mackenzie, 2279 Major Mackenzie, 2273 Major Mackenzie, 2269 Major Mackenzie subject to the following condition:
 - a. That the demolition clearance be effective from the date of the Building Permit approval; and,
- 2) That Heritage Vaughan consider the information presented and the September 4 site visit for the proposed demolition of 8 Church Street and render a decision on the demolition request; and,
- 3) That Heritage Vaughan approve the elevation design of the proposed development subject to following conditions:
 - a. The list of revisions described in the section titled “Required Revisions” of this report be made to the elevations received July 31st, 2013; and,
 - b. The final building materials be reviewed and approved by Cultural Services staff.
- 4) That the applicant be advised that if there are any changes to the application (eg. coverage, height, building elevation, site plan) as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, and Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the proposed demolition of several heritage and non-heritage structures within the Maple Heritage Conservation District and review the proposed new development for the site.

Background - Analysis and Options

At the August 21, 2013 Heritage Vaughan meeting, this item was referred to this meeting pending a site meeting to 8 Church Street.

Location and surrounding context

The subject property is located at the southwest corner of the Keele Street and Major Mackenzie Drive and comprises a block bordered by Church Street, Jackson Street, Major Mackenzie Drive, and Keele Street. The 2 properties that are located immediately at the SW corner and the property on the east side of Jackson Street at Major Mackenzie are not part of the application.

Immediately at the southwest corner of Keele St and Major Mackenzie Dr are two properties – one a recently restored heritage building and the other a more recently built commercial building. The northwest corner of the intersection contains a recently built commercial store built to the corner, the northeast corner contains a single storey plaza setback from the street with parking at the front, and the southeast corner contains the Beaverbrook House – a Part IV designated building that is significant to Vaughan and Maple's history.

The area further south of the subject property along Keele Street includes several significant heritage resources – a cemetery, two churches, and single detached residences. The area west of the property, along Major Mackenzie Dr., is mostly low rise single detached residences, with many converted to commercial uses. The area to the southwest of the subject property is mostly low rise detached homes constructed in the 1960s or later.

Subject Property

The subject property contains 10 houses that are located within the Maple Heritage Conservation District, and as such, are designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act. 9 of these buildings are heritage style buildings, while one is a non-heritage style building. 2 of these buildings are listed on the City of Vaughan's Municipal Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value.

Address	Heritage style	Register	Part V
9980 Keele Street	Yes	Yes	Yes
9964 Keele Street	Yes	No	Yes
8 Church Street	Yes	No	Yes
10 Church Street	Yes	No	Yes
12 Church Street	No	No	Yes
1 Jackson Street	Yes	Yes	Yes
2285 Major Mackenzie	Yes	No	Yes
2279 Major Mackenzie	Yes	No	Yes
2273 Major Mackenzie	Yes	No	Yes
2269 Major Mackenzie	Yes	No	Yes

9980 Keele Street – Proposed preservation

Ontario Gothic brick building with a double bay window front façade.

9964 Keele Street – Built Heritage Evaluation Grade 57/100 (Modest significance)

Gothic Revival clapboard construction house in L-shape plan with rear extension. The house contains some original doors, windows, floorboards, trim, stone foundation, and interior banister. Later additions have occurred but original form is still quite evident. Many windows have been removed, the original cladding has been covered with aluminum cladding, the kitchen has been extensively redone, the verandah has been removed, and there has been water damage to the house and foundation. It is possible that the kitchen was actually the earliest structure, which functioned as a dwelling on its own, with the rest of the house being added later.

8 Church Street – Grade 71/100 (Significant)

Vernacular “loyalist” cottage (Georgian style) in side gable plan with verandah and rear extension. The building is in its original form, with a rubble stone foundation, original wood siding, and mostly unchanged interior trim. Windows were replaced in the early 1900s while the window surrounds remain original. The building was constructed circa 1860, with the kitchen likely being an earlier structure, and is one of the earliest building in the Maple HCD. With its proximity to the main intersection of the Maple HCD, its contextual value is as equally significant as its architectural and historical value. Wooden joists in basement have been subject to some rotting, *but damage is not as extensive as other homes within this development.*

10 Church Street – Grade 54/100 (Modest significance)

One and a half storey Vernacular Homestead detached building, built circa 1900, constructed with dark grey insul brick. Building has a poured concrete foundation and its form and massing has largely remained unchanged. The front porch is a later addition from the 1900s but posts are sympathetic. Some doors, baseboards, hardwood flooring, hardware, window openings, and joists remain while many interior walls have **been broken or** re-clad and hardware has been removed or replaced. Damage has occurred to the concrete foundation of the building and is mostly water damage.

12 Church Street – N/A (non heritage style)

Single storey bungalow constructed in the 1980s. This building is a non-heritage style building.

1 Jackson Street – Proposed preservation

Gothic Revival L-shape building with di-chromatic brick.

2285 Major Mackenzie Drive – Grade 56/100 (Modest significance)

One and a half storey detached Vernacular Homestead, insul red brick atop clapboard, constructed circa 1880. The overall massing and appearance of the building has remained largely unchanged and the building strongly contributes to the historical streetscape of Major Mackenzie Drive in the Maple HCD. Some elements and interior features remain (hardware, windows, etc.) while most of the building has been covered with vinyl and carpet. Stone foundation is in need of major repairs in some areas.

This building and 2279 Major Mackenzie Drive, were likely workers cottages and were moved from Patterson Village near Bathurst Street and Major Mackenzie Drive.

2279 Major Mackenzie Drive – Grade 54/100 (Modest significance)

One and a half storey detached Vernacular Homestead, insul grey brick atop clapboard, constructed circa 1880. The overall massing and appearance of the building has remained largely unchanged and the building strongly contributes to the historical streetscape of Major Mackenzie Drive in the Maple HCD. Front porch is a later, early 1900s addition. While the window openings and window surrounds have remained, all the windows have been replaced and most of the interior has been replaced or covered with vinyl, carpet, hardwood, and wood panels – nonetheless, some original hardware and trim remains.

2273 Major Mackenzie Drive – Grade 56/100 (Modest significance)

One and a half storey detached Vernacular Homestead, wood frame with brick cladding, constructed circa 1880. The overall massing and appearance of the building has remained largely unchanged and the building strongly contributes to the historical streetscape of Major Mackenzie Drive in the Maple HCD. A later front porch addition has covered the square bay window at the right side of the elevation, but this can be easily removed. Several elements have been removed from the interior including the front door, banister, and some hardware. Basement has been subject to flooding and leaking and cement blocks have been placed to support the basement beams and replace the rotting wood logs. Many cracks along the exterior are visible but these cracks occur in the mortar areas due to poor maintenance and repair of the exterior brick.

2269 Major Mackenzie – Grade 26/100 (Little or no significance)

One storey commercial building, circa 1880s, that has been significantly altered. Historical photographs indicate that this building was at one time a boomtown storefront building and strongly contributed to the streetscape of Maple along Major Mackenzie Drive, but it no longer contributes in this way. Building is clad in brick with a stone foundation and later, unsympathetic windows.

Proposal

The applicant is proposing to demolish 8 of the homes on the subject property, while preserving 2 and integrating them into the new development. The 2 homes that will be preserved are 1 Jackson Street and 9980 Keele Street. 7 of the homes proposed for demolition are heritage style homes.

The applicant had originally submitted a Heritage Impact Report for this proposal on May 4, 2012. This report assessed all of the buildings included on the subject property and contained the following conclusion:

While demolition of seven listed heritage dwellings is not entirely consistent with the District Guidelines, it should be noted that in view of their extensive alterations over time and present condition few of them have retained many of their original heritage attributes. In our opinion one of these homes (8 Church St.) (incorrect: actually 12 Church St.) is not a heritage building since it was constructed around 1980. The two homes proposed for retention represent by far the best examples of existing heritage resources within this block.

Staff conducted a site visit and Built Heritage Evaluations for all of the buildings proposed for demolition and requested that the applicant submit additional information for four of the buildings as Staff's findings had concluded that these buildings were either significant or very significant. These buildings are: 2273 Major Mackenzie, 8 Church Street, 10 Church Street, and 9964 Keele Street.

The applicant submitted an additional Heritage Impact Report and Structural Assessment for these four properties.

The Heritage Impact Report, dated March 22, received April 5, 2013 concluded the following:

While there may exist some limited opportunities for salvage, reclamation and recycling of some minor interior elements of these houses, it is our opinion that each house has undergone significant alteration over the years and that none of these houses retain significant amounts of original design and character and that there is nothing of any historic relevance or significance in these houses worthy of preservation.

The Structural Assessment report, received April 5, 2013 concluded the following:

Based on the state of the structural support system and various defects observed at each building, to upgrade building will not be viable, and will not add any value to these buildings.

These buildings are not fit for continuous human occupancy, and long term use. The repairs will not add/replace the structural properties to the various failing components. These buildings should be demolished.

Cultural Services staff conducted several site visits and conducted its own built heritage evaluation and arrived at the same conclusions with the exception of 8 Church Street. As such, Cultural Services is requesting Heritage Vaughan render a decision regarding the proposed demolition of this building.

With respect to the new development, the applicant is proposing to preserve two of the heritage buildings in situ, incorporating them into the design, and constructing 45 townhouse units. The townhouse units will be arranged in 8 blocks around the site – 6 of these blocks will front onto Jackson Street, Church Street, Major Mackenzie Drive, and Keele Street while 2 blocks will be located off the interior street. 9980 Keele Street, will be separated from the development by a 1.5metre wide walkway and 1 Jackson Street will have a side yard setback of 0.71metres.

This application has been largely changed from earlier submissions and the current proposal is a 3-storey Second Empire townhouse design – a design that is recognized in the Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines. The applicant is proposing two basic models that will be repeated throughout the site – the same model will not be repeated on the same block twice.

Zoning Bylaw Amendment

The applicant is submitting a Zoning Bylaw amendment through the Development Planning Department to amend a previous site specific Zoning Bylaw Amendment- Bylaw 145-2010. This Zoning Bylaw Amendment displays the building envelopes for 7 buildings and two existing heritage buildings (1 Jackson Street and 9980 Keele Street). The proposed Zoning Bylaw Amendment will amend the existing site specific Zoning Bylaw with respect to the setbacks, envelopes, and number of units set out in schedule E-1469A (see attachment 104). It should also be noted that a 0.71metre setback is proposed between Jackson Street and Block 8, whereas a 3metre setback was established through ZBLA 145-2010.

Analysis of relevant Policies from the Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines

Policies	Comments
9.1 Architectural Style	Second Empire is a recognized style in the Maple HCD Guidelines
9.2 Heritage Design and Details	Details should be consistent with precedent style
9.3 Existing Heritage Buildings <i>-New construction should not damage or conceal heritage features</i>	Proper buffering should be provided between the heritage structures and the new development – specifically Block 8
9.5.3 New Development – Commercial Core <i>-Preserve existing heritage buildings</i> <i>-Ensure that new development respects and enhances existing heritage character and resources</i>	Two very significant heritage buildings are being preserved while one (8 Church St) is being proposed for demolition. The new development will be a welcome addition to the main intersection of the Maple HCD
9.5.3.5 Site Plan Guidelines <i>-All existing heritage buildings should be conserved</i> <i>- The Zoning By-law for Maple should be revised to ensure that developments which include or abut existing heritage buildings respect, give prominence to, and not overwhelm the heritage buildings. Consideration should be given to the use of angular planes, related to the heritage building height, for adjacent new construction.</i> <i>-Variety in front-yard setbacks should be employed.</i> <i>-Developments with substantial frontages should be designed to provide a variety of setbacks, at the village scale, on the site.</i>	Block 5 abuts 9980 Keele Street and is separated by a 1.5metre walkway, while Blocks 8 abuts 1 Jackson Street and is separated by 0.71metres (2.33 feet). The difference in height between 1 Jackson and Block 8 is acceptable, but a greater setback is required in order to not overwhelm the heritage resource. The current Zoning Bylaw (145-2010) provides a 3metres setback between 1 Jackson Street and the neighbouring building. The blocks are generally comprised of 3 to 5 units and do not provide substantial variations in setbacks, however, the architectural detailing and features of the buildings provide some varied setbacks. The blocks that are proposed are a major deviation from what is currently there – single detached 1.5 storey residential dwellings.
9.5.3.6 Scale and Massing <i>-Maximum height of 11.8metres with a maximum 3 storey façade</i>	Development conforms

Additional Policies

Policies	Comments
9.5.1 Commercial Core Overview <i>The overall heritage character of the District is composed of buildings, streetscapes,</i>	All four streetscapes of this development will be changed significantly through this proposal.

<i>landscapes, and vistas. This overall character has more significance than any individual building, even if it is one of the finest.</i>	The proposed development will create townhouse dwellings in a heritage precedent style along these streets, but they will be a major deviation from the single detached homes that are currently there.
9.5.3.2 Objectives for guidelines for new development <i>The use of on-street parking, grassed boulevards, co-operative connected parking arrangements and access, and connected pathways and open spaces between and at the rear of building are all supported in site planning of new developments.</i>	While on-street parking is supported in the guidelines, this and other transportation matters will be reviewed by other departments and York Region.
9.5.3.3 Pedestrian Amenity <i>The village form, with its front yards and varied setbacks, provides the opportunity for pedestrian-oriented spaces, away from the busy street. These spaces are vital elements in the creation of a pedestrian-friendly environment.</i>	The development offers a central amenity space, away from busy traffic, that is connected by an east-west walkway through the site.
9.5.3.4 Site Plan Characteristics <i>New developments should be designed to respect and mimic the traditional village form.</i>	As mentioned earlier, this development of 3-storey townhouse blocks is a major deviation from the single detached homes that are currently located on the subject property. The proposed height and massing of the blocks and the setbacks are major deviations from what is currently there. It should be noted the comments are pending from other City Departments

Required Revisions to the Proposal:

The following are changes to the elevations, received July 31, 2013, that will ensure the design of the development conforms to the Maple Heritage Conservation District:

General

- An improved buffer/transition between heritage homes being retained on the site and the new development.
- The applicant look at creating an adequate transition in scale of the proposed new development in relation to the existing residential area along Church Street, the corner of Church and Keele Street, and Church and Jackson Street.

Type A – Block 1, Block 4, Block 5, and Block 7

- Doors on third floor/attic not appropriate as there is no historic precedent for this detail – need to be removed or replaced with windows
- Window coverage should be between 15-20%. Please confirm number and/or revise (p.82 of Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines)
- On the window surround of the dormers, remove the raised panels on the right and left sides of the window and shrink this area slightly so that the eaves will project out further and then sill will extend out beyond the window left and right.

- The lintels with a second projecting piece at the top should be altered to create single piece lintels – for example, the lintel above the rightmost window on the first storey of Block 7, front elevation.

Type B – Block 2, Block 3, Block 6, Block 8

- Doors on third floor/attic not appropriate as there is no historic precedent for this detail – need to be removed or replaced with windows
- On Block 2, 3, 6, 8: Stone work surrounding the first storey windows are not appropriate
- Window coverage should be between 15-20%. Please confirm number and/or revise (p.82 of Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines)

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, however the necessary resources have not been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please also refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachments

1. Location Map
- 2 – 5. Streetscapes and nearby properties – July 2012
6. Examples of Second Empire buildings from *Ontario Architecture*, John Blumenson (1990)
- 7 - 11. Heritage Impact Report – Received April 5, 2013 – select pages
- 12 - 24. Structural Assessment – Received April 5, 2013 – select pages
- 25 - 34. 9964 Keele Street BHE
- 35 - 46. 8 Church Street BHE
- 47 - 57. 10 Church Street BHE
- 58 - 65. 2285 Major Mackenzie BHE
- 66 - 74. 2279 Major Mackenzie Drive BHE
- 75 - 82. 2269 Major Mackenzie Drive BHE
- 83 - 93. 2273 Major Mackenzie Drive BHE
94. Site Plan (layers removed and cropped for visibility purposes) – Received July 31, 2013
- 95 - 102. Elevations – Received July 31, 2013
103. Schedule E-1469A from Bylaw 145-2010

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende
Cultural Heritage Coordinator

Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services
Recreation and Culture Department