

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE APRIL 17, 2013

10360 AND 10384 ISLINGTON AVENUE – PROPOSED NEW CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT – WARD 1

Recommendation

- 1). That Heritage Vaughan approves the drawings as presented, for the new construction of the condominium development at 10360 and 10384 Islington Avenue with the following conditions:
 - i) That the applicant submits material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available; and,
 - ii) That the applicant work with Cultural Services in the finalization of the design of the two glass links and that architectural design detailed drawings of the same be submitted to Cultural Services for review and approval, and;
 - iii) That the owner obtain approval from all other City departments, and;
 - iv) That the applicant be advised that Heritage Vaughan Committee approvals do not constitute specific support for any variances, permits or requirements by other City reviewing bodies, that may be sought in the future by the applicant in relation to the proposal reviewed under this item, and;
 - v) That the applicant is advised that if design changes occur to the current drawings as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, and Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To consider the background and analysis portions of this report in order to review the request for construction of a condominium development within the subject lands of the Part IV designated Martin Smith house and within Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Both subject properties within the proposal are Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act as they are located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

10384 Islington Avenue is designate Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act and contains the Martin Smith house. The City of Vaughan has a heritage easement on this property. 10360 Islington Avenue contains no structures on it.

All new construction proposed to Part IV designated properties require the review and approval of a Heritage Permit.

All new construction, additions, demolitions and changes to the exterior of buildings within the subject properties will require approval of a Heritage Permit application, with Heritage Vaughan Committee review and approval, in addition to other City permits such as Building Permits or Planning Application approvals. Proposed changes to properties designated within heritage conservation districts must be in keeping with the heritage character of the building, the historical streetscape and must be in conformance with the heritage district plan and design guidelines.

The properties were subject to an OMB decision that resulted in the approval of a zoning by-law amendment to permit the development of the site within the parameters set therein, the restoration of the Martin Smith house and an easement agreement to be registered on title of the property containing the Martin Smith house at 10384 Islington Avenue.

The applicant has submitted a Zoning Amendment and Site Plan application to deal with some variations between the zoning by-law for this site and the proposed and a new design respectively. Cultural Services Division is required to comment on development applications, triggering the Heritage Review Process with Heritage Vaughan Committee Review.

The applicant has indicated that they would like to proceed to the Heritage Vaughan Committee for review with the understanding that if there are any changes to the design as a result of other City approvals, any approval granted in the review of the drawings attached to this agenda item, may be considered null.

Analysis

The applicant has been working with his architect and has consulted Cultural Services staff in the design of three buildings within the subject property, basing the design on typical historic Ontario settlement architectural precedents. These include the Georgian/Neo-classical Inn, the vernacular/Georgian mill, and the Italianate style inspired manor. These styles are identified within the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District Guidelines as heritage styles.

The Guidelines require that any new construction adhere to one clear heritage style. The proposed is in accordance with the Nashville-Kleinburg Guidelines in this respect.

The general size of the development is allowed by the OMB decision related to the subject properties which will also be reviewed by all other pertinent departments. As mentioned in the background of this report, the applicant has submitted a planning application in order to deal with minor changes to the zoning by-law. The proposal appears to correspond closely to the heights given in the OMB related zoning by-law amendment, and to the setbacks stipulated in the same, save and except for minor adjustments. This is currently under review by zoning staff as well as other pertinent departments.

In addition, the proposed design incorporates the following design features that differ from the version reviewed at the OMB:

- i) Reduction of the link between the Inn building and the Manor, from the 3 storeys approved by the OMB to an understated 2 storey design
- ii) Simplification of the building footprints and hip and gabled roofs: in line with historic precedents
- iii) Understated, one storey enclosed glass link between the Martin Smith house's existing rear porch and the Mill building. This is not included in the OMB approval. Cultural Services recommends that the glass link be designed in a minimalist way so as to diminish the visual impact as much as possible.

- iv) Site Plan is laid out to be parallel to the front of the Inn building with the property line and therefore allow a more organic retention of the grassy knoll on the front and side of the Martin Smith house, as well as setting the Inn farther away from the historic resource.

The proposed adjustments, as presented, do not have a negative impact on the Martin Smith house or the Heritage Conservation District.

In general, the design approach for the site plan and elevations is well researched by the consultant and sensitively adapted to a contemporary condominium development. The overall design approach achieves a complex of buildings, inspired on the traditional farm, mill or hotel complex layouts of the 19th century, that included a home and other complementary buildings with various types of outdoor spaces separating them, including gardens and yards for different purposes. The architectural historic precedents clearly have a link to the heritage styles identified in the Heritage Conservation District Guidelines in form, general material choices and architectural composition in its elevations and site plan.

Based on the above, Cultural Services supports the proposed application and recommends approval with conditions. Please refer to the Recommendation section of this report.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, however the necessary resources have not been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The report recommends that the proposed design be approved with the conditions as set out in the recommendation section of this report. Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Attachments

1. Location Map and Proposed Concept Rendering
2. Proposed Site Plan
3. Massing Study
- 4 and 5. Landscape Plan and Landscape Pergola, Fence and Signage
- 6 to 8. Proposed Elevations (as labeled)
- 9 to 13. Applicable Zoning By-law amendment
- 14 to 19. Context Photographs

Report prepared by:

Cecilia Nin Hernandez, M.Arch.
Cultural Heritage Coordinator, Ext. 8115

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services, Ext. 8139