

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 29, 2013**

Item 6, Report No. 1, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on January 29, 2013.

**6**

**RFPQ12-050**

**PRE-QUALIFICATION OF GENERAL LANDSCAPE CONTRACTORS**

**The Committee of the Whole recommends:**

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Commissioner of Community Services, dated January 15, 2013, be approved; and**
- 2) That Communication C12, submitted by Councillor Racco, be received.**

**Recommendation**

The Commissioner of Community Services, in consultation with Purchasing Services, recommends:

- 1) That the list of pre-qualified contractors as shown on Attachment 1 be approved for the duration of two years with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period, as per the requirements of the RFPQ for Landscape General Contractors for the construction and renovation of various parks and open spaces in the City of Vaughan.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

Not applicable.

**Economic Impact**

Not applicable.

**Communications Plan**

All proponents will be notified of the City's acceptance or non-acceptance of their respective proposals through the Purchasing Services Department, in accordance with standard procedure.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to update Council regarding the outcome of the Landscape General Contractor Pre-Qualification process for Parks Development and seek approval of the attached list of pre-qualified general landscape contractors.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

On December 13, 2011, Council directed staff to review the existing pre-qualification criteria and revise where necessary to address items and concerns that had been noted during the previous pre-qualification term. Any revisions were to form the basis of the pre-qualification process for landscape general contractors to bid on the construction and renovation of various parks and open spaces in the City of Vaughan.

Staff reviewed previous projects and identified concerns that had been noted during the previous term of landscape general contractor pre-qualification. These concerns were brought forward at a Committee of the Whole (Working Session) on February 14, 2012 for discussion. The following three points were identified and the Bid document was revised to address these concerns:

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 29, 2013**

#### Item 6, CW Report No. 1 – Page 2

- Contractors during pre-qualification period had difficulty with completing projects within timelines in accordance with the contract documents; and,
- Contractors during pre-qualification period had difficulty in providing skilled personnel and equipment required for the performance of work; and,
- In addition, staff spent time and effort enforcing City of Vaughan standards and workmanship specified in the contract documents.

The following revised criteria formed the basis of the pre-qualification process in order to address the issues that had been identified in the previous term of pre-qualification of landscape general contractors:

1. Pre-qualified landscape general contractors are required to update their company qualification statement promptly after any significant changes to the company during and prior to the optional extension period for this pre-qualification, and will be reviewed by committee members to ensure the general contractor maintains a minimum score as noted in the mandatory pre-qualification criteria; and,
2. Clarifications had been made to the mandatory submission requirements for park project type and scope that were acceptable to be submitted in the CCDC-11 document (as per appendix A and B) in order to better evaluate the general contractors ability and experience to construct park projects of similar size and scope; which may be tendered during this pre-qualification term; and,
3. References were only checked for projects that were substantially completed; and,
4. Changes were made to the reference section of the scoring criteria in order to capture and address potential concerns and performance issues that could impact the success of a construction project; and,
5. References by respondents were expanded to include projects completed with the City of Vaughan, for City departments other than Parks Development; and,
6. Adding mandatory minimum scoring requirements under section one and two of the Landscape General Contractor Evaluation and Reference criteria required the respondents to achieve a minimum score in each scoring section in order for the respondent to be considered successful in this bid call for pre-qualified Landscape General Contractors.

In addition, to the revised criteria, the following has also been added to the pre-qualification document as follows:

1. Upon completion of, or at any time during the contract, the Owner may complete an evaluation of the Contractor's Performance. A copy of this evaluation may be given to the Contractor. The evaluation shall be placed on file. This information may be made available to persons requesting Owner references for the contract and also may be reviewed and may form part of criteria when awarding future bids by the Owner; and,
2. The City reserves the right to remove a contractor from the pre-qualification list if performance evaluations are not satisfactory, based on the City of Vaughan's sole discretion.

The pre-qualification of general landscape contractors will be for a duration of two (2) years from the date of notification from the City of Vaughan with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period and would be applied to various construction and renovation works included under the

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 29, 2013**

#### Item 6, CW Report No. 1 – Page 3

Parks and Open Space Capital Projects for Parks Development, valued between \$100,000.00 and \$5 million. The City will reserve the right to use the services of other contractors, independent of the request for pre-qualifications, for individual projects which have a scope or size that is unique and requires a very specific skill set.

Through the request for proposal process, Landscape General Contractor Pre-qualification were required to complete the standard document of the CCDC 11-1996 (R2006), in addition landscape general contractors were asked to provide the additional mandatory information as follows:

- Number of years in business; and,
- Workplace Injury Summary Report (WSIR); and,
- Proponents Health and Safety policies; and,
- Company financial information authorization letter; and,
- Insurance coverage; and,
- Bonding capacity.

All respondents who did not provide completed documentation or comply with the mandatory pre-qualification criteria documentation are deemed to be non-compliant.

In March, 2012, Parks Development staff issued a Request for Pre-qualification ("RFPQ12-050") inviting Contractors to submit proposals for the provision of park and open space construction. RFPQ12-050 was advertised on the Daily Commercial News (DCN), on OPBA, Bidding and the City Web Page, and had a closing date of April 17, 2012. Forty-Five (45) Proponents picked up the RFPQ documents from the Purchasing Services Department. One addendum was issued on April 12, 2012 to clarify Purchasing Services mandatory insurance requirements. Thirty Four (34) submissions were received upon opening of the bid. After further review of the bids six (6) proponents had been deemed non-compliant, the following twenty-eight (28) submissions were provided by Purchasing Services to the Evaluation Committee.

1. Aldershot Landscape Contractors LP
2. Bruce Wilson Landscaping Limited
3. Cambium Site Contracting Inc.
4. Cedar Spring Landscape Group Ltd.
5. Davan Landscape Design/Build Inc.
6. Dol Turf Restoration Ltd.
7. Forest Contractors Ltd.
8. Four Seasons Site Development Ltd.
9. 002274084 Ontario Ltd o/a GMP Contracting Ltd.
10. Hawkins Contracting services Limited
11. Hermanns Contracting Limited.
12. Laven Associates Limited.
13. Lomco Limited.
14. Marnix Infrastructure Inc.
15. Melfer Construction Inc.
16. MTM Landscaping Contractors Inc.
17. Pacific Paving Limited.
18. Patterned Concrete Ont. Inc.
19. Pine Valley Enterprises Inc.
20. 560789 Ontario Limited o/a R & M Construction
21. Royal Crest Paving & Contracting Ltd.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 29, 2013**

#### Item 6, CW Report No. 1 – Page 4

22. Roma Building Restoration Ltd.
23. Rutherford Contracting Ltd.
24. Tanebaum Landscape & Design Inc.
25. TBG Landscape Inc.
26. UCC Group Inc.
27. Vivid Construction Inc.
28. Wyndale Paving Co. Ltd.

Responses to RFPQ12-050 were evaluated by an Evaluation Committee based on criteria established in the RFPQ document. A minimum score of 51 was required on section one in order for the contractor to move on to section two, references. In total, 100 points were available, as follows:

#### Section 1 CCDC Evaluation (70 points)

Number of Years in business	5 Points
Total value of annual construction between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	5 Points
Public Park Projects substantially completed between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	25 Points
Projects substantially completed of similar scope and complexity between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	15 Points
Qualifications and Experience of Project Manager(s) and Site Supervisors(s) to be assigned as part of this pre-qualification cycle	20 Points

#### Section Two- References (30 points)

Landscape General Contractors were required to score a minimum score of 20 points in section two.

Upon review of 28 submissions by the evaluation committee, submissions from seven general contractors listed on attachment 1 met the minimum evaluation scoring criteria and are recommended for the pre-qualified list of landscape general contractors.

As per the recommendations of the February 14, 2012 report to the Committee of the Whole Working Session, this item is being brought back to Council for approval of the list that identifies the pre-qualified landscape general contractors that would be used for a duration of two (2) years from the date of notification from the City of Vaughan with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period and would be applied to various construction and renovation works included under the Parks and Open Space Capital Projects for Parks Development, valued between \$100,000.00 and \$5 million.

#### **Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan**

This report seeks to ensure the most cost effective procurement of quality contractor services in support of the City's strategic objective of pursuing excellence in service delivery, as well as in support of strategic initiatives to enhance productivity, cost effectiveness and innovation, and to ensure financial stability.

#### **Regional Implications**

Not Applicable.

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 29, 2013**

Item 6, CW Report No. 1 – Page 5

**Conclusion**

That Council approves this item for the use of the Landscape General Contractors that have satisfied the criteria of the Contractor Pre-Qualification process, which will help to ensure that qualified companies take on capital projects for the City of Vaughan Parks Development Department through a competitive bid process.

Additional clauses have been added to the pre-qualification documents and Bid Documents which will allow staff to monitor and evaluate the performance of the pre-qualified landscape general contractors during the duration of the pre-qualification term. A contractor with an unsatisfactory performance may be removed from the list during the term.

**Attachments**

Attachment 1 – List of Successfully Pre-Qualified Contractors

**Report prepared by:**

Melanie Morris, Construction Coordinator, Ext. 8058  
Martin Tavares, Construction Coordinator, Ext. 8882

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

c 12  
 Communication  
 CW: Jan 15/13  
 Item: 6

Submitted by Councillor Parr

Melfer Construction Inc.						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Sylvan Brook Parkette	WP8	not tracked	0	50 days	July 30 2010	6-7 weeks
Hillside Park	UV1-N8	not tracked	20.5+	70 days	Nov 24 2010	12 weeks
Eagles Landing Park	UV2-N6	not tracked	30	June 30 2011	Oct 14 2011	12 weeks
Gateman Milloy Inc						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Davos Park	UV1-N12	not tracked	8+	August 22 2008	Sept 30 2008	Approx 4 weeks
Sonoma Heights Artificial Turf	WEA-D1	not tracked	6	Aug 1 2011	Aug 11 2011	on schedule
Pheasant Hollow Park	UV2-N7	not tracked	4	July 31 2012	September 21 2012	approx 6 weeks
Mopal Construction Ltd.						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Rainbow Creek Park Improvements	WN1	not tracked	0	July 19 2010	Aug 31 2010	6 weeks
Village Green Parks	UV1-N2	not tracked	1.5 +	110 days	NA	under construction and on schedule
Woodrose Park	UV2-N13	not tracked	34	100 days	NA	under construction and on schedule
Pine Valley Enterprises Inc.						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Carrville Mill Park	UV2-N16	not tracked	20	Aug 31 2011	Dec 15 2011	10 weeks
West Wind Park	UV1-N5	not tracked	36	Aug 20 2012	December 4 2012	10 weeks
Bindertwine Tennis reconstruction	KN1	8	16.5	60 days	NA	Under construction, over schedule
Bartley Smith Greenway phase 2		not tracked	21	45 days	NA	Under Construction several weeks over schedule
Forest Contractors Ltd.						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Bartley Smith Greenway Phase 1		not tracked	20	July 1 2010	September 29 2010	approx 8 weeks
Twelve Oaks Park	UV2-N17	not tracked	56	Aug 15 2010	August 26 2011	27 weeks
Venice Gate	UV10N6	2	26	May 30 2011	Sept 16 2011	8 weeks
North gate Farms Ltd						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
Julliard Park	VCC-N2	not tracked	17	July 31 2008	June 8 2009	20 -22 weeks
MNR Trails phase 1	UV2-OS11	not tracked	not tracked	October 31 2009	May 19 2010	10 - 12 weeks
MNR Quonset	UV2-OS11	not tracked	not tracked	March 31 2010	June 18 2010	8 weeks
Rutherford Contractors Lts						
Park Name	Park NO.	Non performance days tracked	Rain days	Tender completion	Substantial completion	days over schedule
McNaughton Park Artificial Soccer	MN10	not tracked	37+	December 1 2008	September 14 2009	30 weeks
Freedom Trail Park	UV2-N21	not tracked	7	July 30 2010	July 16 2010	completed early
Don and Humber Trail repair and bridge ISF		not tracked	Not tracked	November 15 2009	September 22 2010	40 weeks

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – JANUARY 15, 2013**

### **RFPQ12-050**

### **PRE-QUALIFICATION OF GENERAL LANDSCAPE CONTRACTORS**

#### **Recommendation**

The Commissioner of Community Services, in consultation with Purchasing Services, recommends:

- 1) That the list of pre-qualified contractors as shown on Attachment 1 be approved for the duration of two years with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period, as per the requirements of the RFPQ for Landscape General Contractors for the construction and renovation of various parks and open spaces in the City of Vaughan.

#### **Contribution to Sustainability**

Not applicable.

#### **Economic Impact**

Not applicable.

#### **Communications Plan**

All proponents will be notified of the City's acceptance or non-acceptance of their respective proposals through the Purchasing Services Department, in accordance with standard procedure.

#### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to update Council regarding the outcome of the Landscape General Contractor Pre-Qualification process for Parks Development and seek approval of the attached list of pre-qualified general landscape contractors.

#### **Background - Analysis and Options**

On December 13, 2011, Council directed staff to review the existing pre-qualification criteria and revise where necessary to address items and concerns that had been noted during the previous pre-qualification term. Any revisions were to form the basis of the pre-qualification process for landscape general contractors to bid on the construction and renovation of various parks and open spaces in the City of Vaughan.

Staff reviewed previous projects and identified concerns that had been noted during the previous term of landscape general contractor pre-qualification. These concerns were brought forward at a Committee of the Whole (Working Session) on February 14, 2012 for discussion. The following three points were identified and the Bid document was revised to address these concerns:

- Contractors during pre-qualification period had difficulty with completing projects within timelines in accordance with the contract documents; and,
- Contractors during pre-qualification period had difficulty in providing skilled personnel and equipment required for the performance of work; and,
- In addition, staff spent time and effort enforcing City of Vaughan standards and workmanship specified in the contract documents.

The following revised criteria formed the basis of the pre-qualification process in order to address the issues that had been identified in the previous term of pre-qualification of landscape general contractors:

1. Pre-qualified landscape general contractors are required to update their company qualification statement promptly after any significant changes to the company during and prior to the optional extension period for this pre-qualification, and will be reviewed by committee members to ensure the general contractor maintains a minimum score as noted in the mandatory pre-qualification criteria; and,
2. Clarifications had been made to the mandatory submission requirements for park project type and scope that were acceptable to be submitted in the CCDC-11 document (as per appendix A and B) in order to better evaluate the general contractors ability and experience to construct park projects of similar size and scope; which may be tendered during this pre-qualification term; and,
3. References were only checked for projects that were substantially completed; and,
4. Changes were made to the reference section of the scoring criteria in order to capture and address potential concerns and performance issues that could impact the success of a construction project; and,
5. References by respondents were expanded to include projects completed with the City of Vaughan, for City departments other than Parks Development; and,
6. Adding mandatory minimum scoring requirements under section one and two of the Landscape General Contractor Evaluation and Reference criteria required the respondents to achieve a minimum score in each scoring section in order for the respondent to be considered successful in this bid call for pre-qualified Landscape General Contractors.

In addition, to the revised criteria, the following has also been added to the pre-qualification document as follows:

1. Upon completion of, or at any time during the contract, the Owner may complete an evaluation of the Contractor's Performance. A copy of this evaluation may be given to the Contractor. The evaluation shall be placed on file. This information may be made available to persons requesting Owner references for the contract and also may be reviewed and may form part of criteria when awarding future bids by the Owner; and,
2. The City reserves the right to remove a contractor from the pre-qualification list if performance evaluations are not satisfactory, based on the City of Vaughan's sole discretion.

The pre-qualification of general landscape contractors will be for a duration of two (2) years from the date of notification from the City of Vaughan with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period and would be applied to various construction and renovation works included under the Parks and Open Space Capital Projects for Parks Development, valued between \$100,000.00 and \$5 million. The City will reserve the right to use the services of other contractors, independent of the request for pre-qualifications, for individual projects which have a scope or size that is unique and requires a very specific skill set.

Through the request for proposal process, Landscape General Contractor Pre-qualification were required to complete the standard document of the CCDC 11-1996 (R2006), in addition landscape general contractors were asked to provide the additional mandatory information as follows:

- Number of years in business; and,
- Workplace Injury Summary Report (WSIR); and,
- Proponents Health and Safety policies; and,



- Company financial information authorization letter; and,
- Insurance coverage; and,
- Bonding capacity.

All respondents who did not provide completed documentation or comply with the mandatory pre-qualification criteria documentation are deemed to be non-compliant.

In March, 2012, Parks Development staff issued a Request for Pre-qualification ("RFPQ12-050") inviting Contractors to submit proposals for the provision of park and open space construction. RFPQ12-050 was advertised on the Daily Commercial News (DCN), on OPBA, Biddingo and the City Web Page, and had a closing date of April 17, 2012. Forty-Five (45) Proponents picked up the RFPQ documents from the Purchasing Services Department. One addendum was issued on April 12, 2012 to clarify Purchasing Services mandatory insurance requirements. Thirty Four (34) submissions were received upon opening of the bid. After further review of the bids six (6) proponents had been deemed non-compliant, the following twenty-eight (28) submissions were provided by Purchasing Services to the Evaluation Committee.

1. Aldershot Landscape Contractors LP
2. Bruce Wilson Landscaping Limited
3. Cambium Site Contracting Inc.
4. Cedar Spring Landscape Group Ltd.
5. Davan Landscape Design/Build Inc.
6. Dol Turf Restoration Ltd.
7. Forest Contractors Ltd.
8. Four Seasons Site Development Ltd.
9. 002274084 Ontario Ltd o/a GMP Contracting Ltd.
10. Hawkins Contracting services Limited
11. Hermanns Contracting Limited.
12. Laven Associates Limited.
13. Lomco Limited.
14. Marnix Infrastructure Inc.
15. Melfer Construction Inc.
16. MTM Landscaping Contractors Inc.
17. Pacific Paving Limited.
18. Patterned Concrete Ont. Inc.
19. Pine Valley Enterprises Inc.
20. 560789 Ontario Limited o/a R & M Construction
21. Royal Crest Paving & Contracting Ltd.
22. Roma Building Restoration Ltd.
23. Rutherford Contracting Ltd.
24. Tanebaum Landscape & Design Inc.
25. TBG Landscape Inc.
26. UCC Group Inc.
27. Vivid Construction Inc.
28. Wyndale Paving Co. Ltd.

Responses to RFPQ12-050 were evaluated by an Evaluation Committee based on criteria established in the RFPQ document. A minimum score of 51 was required on section one in order for the contractor to move on to section two, references. In total, 100 points were available, as follows:

Section 1 CCDC Evaluation (70 points)

Number of Years in business	5 Points
Total value of annual construction between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	5 Points
Public Park Projects substantially completed between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	25 Points
Projects substantially completed of similar scope and complexity between and inclusive of 2007 and 2011	15 Points
Qualifications and Experience of Project Manager(s) and Site Supervisors(s) to be assigned as part of this pre-qualification cycle	20 Points

Section Two- References (30 points)

Landscape General Contractors were required to score a minimum score of 20 points in section two.

Upon review of 28 submissions by the evaluation committee, submissions from seven general contractors listed on attachment 1 met the minimum evaluation scoring criteria and are recommended for the pre-qualified list of landscape general contractors.

As per the recommendations of the February 14, 2012 report to the Committee of the Whole Working Session, this item is being brought back to Council for approval of the list that identifies the pre-qualified landscape general contractors that would be used for a duration of two (2) years from the date of notification from the City of Vaughan with the option of one (1) two (2) year extension period and would be applied to various construction and renovation works included under the Parks and Open Space Capital Projects for Parks Development, valued between \$100,000.00 and \$5 million.

**Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan**

This report seeks to ensure the most cost effective procurement of quality contractor services in support of the City's strategic objective of pursuing excellence in service delivery, as well as in support of strategic initiatives to enhance productivity, cost effectiveness and innovation, and to ensure financial stability.

**Regional Implications**

Not Applicable.

**Conclusion**

That Council approves this item for the use of the Landscape General Contractors that have satisfied the criteria of the Contractor Pre-Qualification process, which will help to ensure that qualified companies take on capital projects for the City of Vaughan Parks Development Department through a competitive bid process.

Additional clauses have been added to the pre-qualification documents and Bid Documents which will allow staff to monitor and evaluate the performance of the pre-qualified landscape general contractors during the duration of the pre-qualification term. A contractor with an unsatisfactory performance may be removed from the list during the term.

**Attachments**

Attachment 1 – List of Successfully Pre-Qualified Contractors

**Report prepared by:**

Melanie Morris, Construction Coordinator, Ext. 8058  
Martin Tavares, Construction Coordinator, Ext. 8882

Respectfully submitted,

Marlon Kallideen,  
Commissioner of Community Services

## **ATTACHMENT 1:**

### **List of Successful Proponents for RFP12-050 Pre-qualified Contractors:**

- 1. Bruce Wilson Landscaping**
- 2. Cambium Site Contracting Inc.**
- 3. Dol Turf Restoration Ltd.**
- 4. Forest Contractors Ltd.**
- 5. Melfer Construction Inc.**
- 6. Pine Valley Enterprises Inc.**
- 7. UCC Group**