

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2016**

Item 9, Report No. 38, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on November 15, 2016.

**9                                    AWARD OF REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL RFP16-300  
ARCHITECTURAL SERVICES FOR THE RESTORATION AND RENOVATION OF  
KLEINBURG UNITED CHURCH  
WARD 1**

**The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the City Manager and the Director of Infrastructure Delivery, dated November 1, 2016:**

**Recommendation**

The City Manager and the Director of Infrastructure Delivery, in consultation with the Director of Financial Planning and Development Finance, and Deputy City Treasurer and the Director of Procurement Services, recommend:

1. That Request for Proposal RFP16-300, Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church be awarded to Lynch + Comisso Inc., in the amount of \$157,410.80 plus applicable taxes;
2. That a contingency allowance in the amount of \$31,000.00, plus applicable taxes, be approved within which the Deputy City Manager of Public Works or his designate is authorized to approve amendments to the contract;
3. That the amounts identified in the above recommendations, including all contingency allowances, applicable taxes and administration recovery, be funded from Capital Project BF-8479-15 Kleinburg United Church Renovation; and
4. That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to sign the appropriate documents.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

The proposed design for the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church will implement new building technologies and life safety systems that align with current Building Code standards, sustainability practices and provide high-performing building systems that will contribute to a healthier built environment.

The restoration and renovation of the structure will increase the level of service for the health and well-being of Vaughan's citizens. The restoration will maintain one of Vaughan's unique built heritage resources, while upgrading it to reduce energy consumption and perform at a higher environmental standard.

**Economic Impact**

**The restoration and renovation of Kleinburg United Church was approved as part of the 2015 Capital Budget**

The budget to fund the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church was approved as part of the 2015 Capital Budget. The original scope of work included building envelope restoration, regrading of the site to prevent water infiltration, and interior repairs to the main floor of the building, such as upgrades to the electrical, mechanical and life safety systems, and limited accessibility improvements.

## **CITY OF VAUGHAN**

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2016**

Item 9, CW Report No. 38 – Page 2

#### **A revised scope of work for the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church was approved by Council in May 2016**

As part of Item 23, Report No. 21, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by Council on May 17, 2016, the Pierre Berton Tribute Task Force put forward a recommendation to convert the Kleinburg United Church into a fully accessible public building, thus increasing the scope of work and complexity of the project. The conversion into a fully accessible, AODA compliant building will include, at a minimum, the renovation of the basement level, the addition of barrier-free washrooms, the installation of a lift between the main floor and the basement level, and improvements to the site to ensure barrier-free paths of travel to an accessible building entrance.

In addition, as recommended by the Pierre Berton Tribute Task Force, the completion date for the project was advanced from October to June 2018. At the Pierre Berton Task Force meeting held on May 25, 2016, staff advised that the June 2018 completion date may be impacted by a number of factors including the increased scope of work, discovery of unknown site conditions and challenges with unforeseen building conditions typically experienced during the restoration and renovation of a Heritage building. Through the development of the detailed design, staff will be better informed about the ability to achieve the compressed timelines for delivery of this project.

Lastly, staff was directed to investigate all funding opportunities to help pay for the increased scope of work. To accommodate the increase in scope and compressed project timelines, staff is seeking additional funding for approximately \$900,800 through the Canada 150 Community Infrastructure Program grant application. A capital project has been prepared and will be submitted for consideration as part of the 2017 Budget Deliberations.

The total cost of \$197,726.83 for Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church is available within current approved Capital Project BF-8479-15, Kleinburg United Church Renovation. A detailed description of the funding is provided in the

**Background - Analysis and Options** section of this report.

#### **Communications Plan**

Once the project is awarded, Staff will advise the Mayor and Members of Council and will distribute a newsletter to the Stakeholders as necessary.

#### **Purpose**

This report seeks Council approval to award Request for Proposal RFP-16-300, Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.

#### **Background – Analysis and Options**

#### **In 2010, the City of Vaughan purchased the Kleinburg United Church property located at 10418 Islington Avenue**

In 2010 the City of Vaughan purchased the Kleinburg United Church property, built in 1926, with the intention of housing a museum to honour the late Pierre Berton and create a multi-use facility that can be used by local community groups for meetings and activities. The existing structure, located at 10418 Islington Avenue in Kleinburg, is currently vacant and requires repair, restoration and life safety upgrade work in order to be fit for public use.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2016**

#### Item 9, CW Report No. 38 – Page 3

The scope of services for this contract includes the planning, design and contract administration oversight of the restoration and renovation work of the Kleinburg United Church project.

#### **On August 11, 2016, proposals were received for RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church**

A Request for Proposal for Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church was advertised on the City of Vaughan Website, Bidding and Ontario Public Buyers Association (OPBA) website on July 22, 2016. In response to the RFP, sixteen (16) RFP packages were picked up from the Procurement Services Department. Upon closing on August 11, 2016, three (3) proposal submissions were received. One (1) proposal submission was received after the submission deadline and was deemed non-compliant.

In response to the RFP, two (2) compliant submissions were received from the following:

1. Black & Moffat Architects
2. Lynch + Comisso Inc.

A technical evaluation meeting was held on August 24, 2016 with the evaluation committee comprising of representatives from Infrastructure Delivery, Facilities Maintenance Services and Procurement Services.

As outlined in the RFP, the following scoring and ranking system was used to evaluate the proposals:

- Technical Evaluation – 70 points:
  - Understanding of the Project Requirement, Project Plan and Schedule – 20 points;
  - Qualifications and Experience – 25 points;
  - Proposed Personnel – 25 points;
- Interview Evaluation – 10 points;
- Financial Proposal – 20 points.

Based on the requirements outlined in the RFP, a minimum cumulative score of 75% was required to be achieved by each Proponent for the technical evaluation and interview evaluation before the financial proposals could be opened.

Interviews were held on September 1, 2016 for Black & Moffat Architects and Lynch + Comisso Inc. and each Proponent was scored accordingly. The technical evaluation and interview evaluation scores of both Proponents met the RFP cumulative requirement of 75% or above, and therefore both Proponents qualified for the opening of the financial proposals.

Black & Moffat Architects amended their financial proposal form and did not comply with the Mandatory Requirements outlined in Document I – Instructions to Proponents of the RFP. Black & Moffat Architects were subsequently disqualified. Lynch + Comisso Inc. submitted a financial proposal form that met the RFP requirements that can be accommodated within the budget of Capital Project BF-8479-15. It is recommended that the proposal from Lynch + Comisso Inc. be accepted and that an Agreement be executed.

The total estimated cost for professional design services for this project, including a contingency allowance, applicable taxes, and administration recovery is calculated as follows:

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2016**

Item 9, CW Report No. 38 – Page 4

<b>TABLE 1: ESTIMATED CONSULTANT COSTS</b>	
	<b>\$</b>
Lynch + Comisso Inc. Proposal Price (excluding H.S.T.)	157,410.80
Contingency Amount (approx. 20%)	31,000.00
<b>Sub-Total</b>	<b>188,410.80</b>
H.S.T. (1.76%, Not Recoverable)	3,316.03
<b>Total</b>	<b>191,726.83</b>
Administration Recovery (3%)	5,751.80
<b>Net Total Cost</b>	<b>197,478.63</b>
<b>ROUNDED      \$ 198,000.00</b>	

<b>TABLE 2: PROJECT FUNDING POSITION SUMMARY</b>	
<b>Capital Project BF-8479-15</b>	<b>\$</b>
Approved Budget	980,200.00
Less: Expenses/Commitments To Date	(22,223.25)
<b>Current Funds Remaining</b>	<b>954,976.75</b>
Less: Net Total Cost	(197,726.83)
<b>Budget Remaining</b>	<b>757,249.92</b>

This project is considered high in complexity with multiple uncertainties. Currently only a preliminary budget cost estimate is available and there is a high probability for changes due to unforeseen work related to restoring and renovating a heritage building. In accordance with the Contingency Cost Matrix (identified in Appendix 1 of the Capital Project Financial Administration and Reporting Policy), a contingency allowance of 20% has been identified as an appropriate amount to address any unforeseen work in completing the design assignment. The remaining balance in the project will be used toward the construction phase of the project.

**Based on the evaluation of the Proposals, it is appropriate to award RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.**

Staff have reviewed the submitted Proposals and deemed Lynch + Comisso Inc. as qualified to undertake this project. It is appropriate to award RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

In consideration of the strategic priorities set within the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map, the recommendations in this report support the priority to invest, renew and manage infrastructure assets.

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2016**

Item 9, CW Report No. 38 – Page 5

**Regional Implications**

Not Applicable.

**Conclusion**

It is recommended that RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church be awarded to Lynch + Comisso Inc. in the amount of \$157,410.80, plus applicable taxes. Sufficient funding is available in Capital Project BF-8479-15 Kleinburg United Church Renovation to award this contract.

**Attachments**

Not Applicable.

**Report prepared by:**

Adriana Tantalo, Project Manager, Infrastructure Delivery, ext. 8745

Wei Chiao, Manager, Design & Construction, ext. 8101

**AWARD OF REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL RFP16-300  
ARCHITECTURAL SERVICES FOR THE RESTORATION AND RENOVATION OF  
KLEINBURG UNITED CHURCH  
WARD 1**

**Recommendation**

The City Manager and the Director of Infrastructure Delivery, in consultation with the Director of Financial Planning and Development Finance, and Deputy City Treasurer and the Director of Procurement Services, recommend:

1. That Request for Proposal RFP16-300, Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church be awarded to Lynch + Comisso Inc., in the amount of \$157,410.80 plus applicable taxes;
2. That a contingency allowance in the amount of \$31,000.00, plus applicable taxes, be approved within which the Deputy City Manager of Public Works or his designate is authorized to approve amendments to the contract;
3. That the amounts identified in the above recommendations, including all contingency allowances, applicable taxes and administration recovery, be funded from Capital Project BF-8479-15 Kleinburg United Church Renovation; and
4. That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to sign the appropriate documents.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

The proposed design for the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church will implement new building technologies and life safety systems that align with current Building Code standards, sustainability practices and provide high-performing building systems that will contribute to a healthier built environment.

The restoration and renovation of the structure will increase the level of service for the health and well-being of Vaughan's citizens. The restoration will maintain one of Vaughan's unique built heritage resources, while upgrading it to reduce energy consumption and perform at a higher environmental standard.

**Economic Impact**

**The restoration and renovation of Kleinburg United Church was approved as part of the 2015 Capital Budget**

The budget to fund the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church was approved as part of the 2015 Capital Budget. The original scope of work included building envelope restoration, regrading of the site to prevent water infiltration, and interior repairs to the main floor of the building, such as upgrades to the electrical, mechanical and life safety systems, and limited accessibility improvements.

**A revised scope of work for the restoration and renovation of the Kleinburg United Church was approved by Council in May 2016**

As part of Item 23, Report No. 21, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by Council on May 17, 2016, the Pierre Berton Tribute Task Force put forward a recommendation to convert the Kleinburg United Church into a fully accessible public building,

thus increasing the scope of work and complexity of the project. The conversion into a fully accessible, AODA compliant building will include, at a minimum, the renovation of the basement level, the addition of barrier-free washrooms, the installation of a lift between the main floor and the basement level, and improvements to the site to ensure barrier-free paths of travel to an accessible building entrance.

In addition, as recommended by the Pierre Berton Tribute Task Force, the completion date for the project was advanced from October to June 2018. At the Pierre Berton Task Force meeting held on May 25, 2016, staff advised that the June 2018 completion date may be impacted by a number of factors including the increased scope of work, discovery of unknown site conditions and challenges with unforeseen building conditions typically experienced during the restoration and renovation of a Heritage building. Through the development of the detailed design, staff will be better informed about the ability to achieve the compressed timelines for delivery of this project.

Lastly, staff was directed to investigate all funding opportunities to help pay for the increased scope of work. To accommodate the increase in scope and compressed project timelines, staff is seeking additional funding for approximately \$900,800 through the Canada 150 Community Infrastructure Program grant application. A capital project has been prepared and will be submitted for consideration as part of the 2017 Budget Deliberations.

The total cost of \$197,726.83 for Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church is available within current approved Capital Project BF-8479-15, Kleinburg United Church Renovation. A detailed description of the funding is provided in the **Background - Analysis and Options** section of this report.

#### **Communications Plan**

Once the project is awarded, Staff will advise the Mayor and Members of Council and will distribute a newsletter to the Stakeholders as necessary.

#### **Purpose**

This report seeks Council approval to award Request for Proposal RFP-16-300, Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.

#### **Background – Analysis and Options**

**In 2010, the City of Vaughan purchased the Kleinburg United Church property located at 10418 Islington Avenue**

In 2010 the City of Vaughan purchased the Kleinburg United Church property, built in 1926, with the intention of housing a museum to honour the late Pierre Berton and create a multi-use facility that can be used by local community groups for meetings and activities. The existing structure, located at 10418 Islington Avenue in Kleinburg, is currently vacant and requires repair, restoration and life safety upgrade work in order to be fit for public use.

The scope of services for this contract includes the planning, design and contract administration oversight of the restoration and renovation work of the Kleinburg United Church project.

**On August 11, 2016, proposals were received for RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church**

A Request for Proposal for Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church was advertised on the City of Vaughan Website, Bidding and Ontario Public Buyers Association (OPBA) website on July 22, 2016. In response to the RFP, sixteen (16) RFP

packages were picked up from the Procurement Services Department. Upon closing on August 11, 2016, three (3) proposal submissions were received. One (1) proposal submission was received after the submission deadline and was deemed non-compliant.

In response to the RFP, two (2) compliant submissions were received from the following:

1. Black & Moffat Architects
2. Lynch + Comisso Inc.

A technical evaluation meeting was held on August 24, 2016 with the evaluation committee comprising of representatives from Infrastructure Delivery, Facilities Maintenance Services and Procurement Services.

As outlined in the RFP, the following scoring and ranking system was used to evaluate the proposals:

- Technical Evaluation – 70 points:
  - Understanding of the Project Requirement, Project Plan and Schedule – 20 points;
  - Qualifications and Experience – 25 points;
  - Proposed Personnel – 25 points;
- Interview Evaluation – 10 points;
- Financial Proposal – 20 points.

Based on the requirements outlined in the RFP, a minimum cumulative score of 75% was required to be achieved by each Proponent for the technical evaluation and interview evaluation before the financial proposals could be opened.

Interviews were held on September 1, 2016 for Black & Moffat Architects and Lynch + Comisso Inc. and each Proponent was scored accordingly. The technical evaluation and interview evaluation scores of both Proponents met the RFP cumulative requirement of 75% or above, and therefore both Proponents qualified for the opening of the financial proposals.

Black & Moffat Architects amended their financial proposal form and did not comply with the Mandatory Requirements outlined in Document I – Instructions to Proponents of the RFP. Black & Moffat Architects were subsequently disqualified. Lynch + Comisso Inc. submitted a financial proposal form that met the RFP requirements that can be accommodated within the budget of Capital Project BF-8479-15. It is recommended that the proposal from Lynch + Comisso Inc. be accepted and that an Agreement be executed.



The total estimated cost for professional design services for this project, including a contingency allowance, applicable taxes, and administration recovery is calculated as follows:

<b>TABLE 1: ESTIMATED CONSULTANT COSTS</b>	
	<b>\$</b>
Lynch + Comisso Inc. Proposal Price (excluding H.S.T.)	157,410.80
Contingency Amount (approx. 20%)	31,000.00
<b>Sub-Total</b>	<b>188,410.80</b>
H.S.T. (1.76%, Not Recoverable)	3,316.03
<b>Total</b>	<b>191,726.83</b>
Administration Recovery (3%)	5,751.80
<b>Net Total Cost</b>	<b>197,478.63</b>
<b>ROUNDED      \$ 198,000.00</b>	

<b>TABLE 2: PROJECT FUNDING POSITION SUMMARY</b>	
<b>Capital Project BF-8479-15</b>	<b>\$</b>
Approved Budget	980,200.00
Less: Expenses/Commitments To Date	(22,223.25)
<b>Current Funds Remaining</b>	<b>954,976.75</b>
Less: Net Total Cost	(197,726.83)
<b>Budget Remaining</b>	<b>757,249.92</b>

This project is considered high in complexity with multiple uncertainties. Currently only a preliminary budget cost estimate is available and there is a high probability for changes due to unforeseen work related to restoring and renovating a heritage building. In accordance with the Contingency Cost Matrix (identified in Appendix 1 of the Capital Project Financial Administration and Reporting Policy), a contingency allowance of 20% has been identified as an appropriate amount to address any unforeseen work in completing the design assignment. The remaining balance in the project will be used toward the construction phase of the project.

**Based on the evaluation of the Proposals, it is appropriate to award RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.**

Staff have reviewed the submitted Proposals and deemed Lynch + Comisso Inc. as qualified to undertake this project. It is appropriate to award RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church to Lynch + Comisso Inc.

### **Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

In consideration of the strategic priorities set within the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map, the recommendations in this report support the priority to invest, renew and manage infrastructure assets.

### **Regional Implications**

Not Applicable.

### **Conclusion**

It is recommended that RFP16-300 Architectural Services for the Restoration and Renovation of Kleinburg United Church be awarded to Lynch + Comisso Inc. in the amount of \$157,410.80, plus applicable taxes. Sufficient funding is available in Capital Project BF-8479-15 Kleinburg United Church Renovation to award this contract.

### **Attachments**

Not Applicable.

### **Report prepared by:**

Adriana Tantalo, Project Manager, Infrastructure Delivery, ext. 8745  
Wei Chiao, Manager, Design & Construction, ext. 8101

Respectfully submitted,

Daniel Kostopoulos  
City Manager

Jack Graziosi  
Director of Infrastructure Delivery