

## **CITY OF VAUGHAN**

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015**

Item 5, Report No. 24, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on June 23, 2015.

#### **5      AWARD OF RFP-15-003 ARENA REFRIGERATION PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE AND DEMAND SERVICES FOR VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT THE CITY OF VAUGHAN**

The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the Acting Commissioner of Strategic & Corporate Services and the Director of Building & Facilities, dated June 2, 2015:

##### **Recommendation**

The Acting Commissioner of Strategic & Corporate Services and the Director of Building & Facilities, in consultation with the Director of Purchasing Services and the Director of Financial Planning & Analytics, recommend:

1. That RFP15-003 Arena Refrigeration Preventative Maintenance and Demand Services for Various Locations at the City of Vaughan be awarded to CIMCO Refrigeration in the amount of \$347,402.13 plus applicable taxes for a term ending April 30, 2018; and,
2. That a contingency allowance in the amount of \$104,220 be approved for emergency repairs and replacements required as a result of unforeseen mechanical failures or breakdowns during the term, within which the Director of Building & Facilities, or designate, is authorized to approve amendments to the contracts within this service; and,
3. That staff be authorized to extend the contract for two (2) additional one (1) year periods subject to satisfactory Contractor performance and availability of sufficient funds; and,
4. That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary documents.

##### **Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Objective 1.5:

- To reduce the amount of waste generated in City owned facilities and procure sustainable products for the City's use.

##### **Economic Impact**

Funds for the first year of the contract plus the contingency are available from the Building and Facilities 2015 Council approved operating budget. Funds for the remaining two year term and any unspent contingency will be accommodated in the respective budget years.

##### **Communications Plan**

N/A

##### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to award RFP15-003: Arena Refrigeration Preventative Maintenance and Demand Services for Various Locations at the City of Vaughan to CIMCO Refrigeration for the amount of \$451,622.13 plus applicable taxes, for a term ending April 30, 2018, with an option to extend the contract for two (2) additional one (1) year periods subject to satisfactory Contractor performance and availability of funds.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 5, CW Report No. 24 – Page 2

#### Background - Analysis and Options

RFP 15-003 was advertised on City Page, Biddingo and OPBA website on January 28, 2015, with a closing date of February 19, 2015. Two (2) Addenda were issued to answer questions received and the closing date was extended to Feb. 26, 2015. In response to the Request for Proposal, RFP documents were picked up by six (6) potential proponents, and upon closing, three (3) proposal submissions were received from the following proponents:

1. Carmichael Engineering Ltd.
2. Scotty's Refrigeration
3. Cimco Refrigeration

The RFP required a two envelope evaluation process with bidders submitting Envelope #1 – Technical Proposal, in which proponents provided sufficient information to demonstrate abilities, and Envelope #2 Proposal Fees, which contained all fees. If the Technical Proposal contained in Envelope #1 scored less than 60 points based on technical evaluation criteria, then the Proposal was not considered further and the 2nd sealed Envelope, #2, containing the Proposal Fees was not opened.

The two envelope process was used to ensure a fair evaluation of the proposals. The technical proposals were evaluated purely on the technical merits and the ability to meet the requirements set forth in the RFP without being unduly impacted by the financial proposals.

On March 26, 2015 the bids were evaluated by a team comprised of staff from Building & Facilities and IB Storey Engineering who provided independent project facilitation with Purchasing Services as the coordinator only. A standardized scoring system was used for the proposal as follows:

- 5 points available for Executive Summary;
- 25 points available for Organization and Industry Experience;
- 25 points available for Refrigeration System Service Contract Experience and Reference;
- 20 points available for Service Contract work Plan and Methodology;
- 5 points available for Documentation and Reporting;
- 5 points available for Submission Content;
- 15 points available for Proposal Fee.

Two out of the three proposal's technical submissions did not meet the required threshold of 60 points and hence their pricing envelopes were not opened. Only CIMCO met the threshold and as a result is recommended for award. The Proposal Fees submitted by CIMCO was \$642,908.88 plus applicable taxes. The amount recommended for award has been revised in accordance with the adjusted material requirement for the maintenance services.

The Proposal Fees submitted by CIMCO Refrigeration have been reviewed by Building & Facilities staff and found to be competitive and favourable when compared to the actual costs paid for these services in the last three years:

#### Cost Analysis

Operating Budget Year	Actual
2014 Operating Actual	\$178,068.82
2013 Operating Actual	\$161,065.38
2012 Operating Actual	\$185,155.45
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$524,289.65</b>

## **CITY OF VAUGHAN**

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015**

Item 5, CW Report No. 24 – Page 3

#### **Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan**

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the project will provide:

- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE:  
Management Excellence - Providing excellence in the management of our city.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE:  
Maintain Assets and Infrastructure to optimize existing infrastructure through sound asset management.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

#### **Regional Implications**

Not applicable.

#### **Conclusion**

The refrigeration plants are located at various community centres and are the operating system that provides and maintains artificial ice for the ten (10) rink pads (indoor and outdoor). Maintenance, service and regular upkeep of these plants is critical to maintaining ice standards without any negative impact on the scheduled programs and activities. CIMCO Refrigeration has provided the regular maintenance and service to the plants for many years. Building and Facilities staff have reviewed the bid submission and have determined that CIMCO Refrigeration has met the requirements of the bid specifications. Therefore, it is recommended that RFP15-003 be awarded to CIMCO Refrigeration for \$451,622.13 plus applicable taxes.

#### **Attachments**

N/A

#### **Report prepared by:**

Dave Merriman, Manager of Facilities, Ext. 8296

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – JUNE 2, 2015**

### **AWARD OF RFP-15-003 ARENA REFRIGERATION PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE AND DEMAND SERVICES FOR VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT THE CITY OF VAUGHAN**

#### **Recommendations**

The Acting Commissioner of Strategic & Corporate Services and the Director of Building & Facilities, in consultation with the Director of Purchasing Services and the Director of Financial Planning & Analytics, recommend:

1. That RFP15-003 Arena Refrigeration Preventative Maintenance and Demand Services for Various Locations at the City of Vaughan be awarded to CIMCO Refrigeration in the amount of \$347,402.13 plus applicable taxes for a term ending April 30, 2018; and,
2. That a contingency allowance in the amount of \$104,220 be approved for emergency repairs and replacements required as a result of unforeseen mechanical failures or breakdowns during the term, within which the Director of Building & Facilities, or designate, is authorized to approve amendments to the contracts within this service; and,
3. That staff be authorized to extend the contract for two (2) additional one (1) year periods subject to satisfactory Contractor performance and availability of sufficient funds; and,
4. That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary documents.

#### **Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Objective 1.5:

- To reduce the amount of waste generated in City owned facilities and procure sustainable products for the City's use.

#### **Economic Impact**

Funds for the first year of the contract plus the contingency are available from the Building and Facilities 2015 Council approved operating budget. Funds for the remaining two year term and any unspent contingency will be accommodated in the respective budget years.

#### **Communications Plan**

N/A

#### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to award RFP15-003: Arena Refrigeration Preventative Maintenance and Demand Services for Various Locations at the City of Vaughan to CIMCO Refrigeration for the amount of \$451,622.13 plus applicable taxes, for a term ending April 30, 2018, with an option to extend the contract for two (2) additional one (1) year periods subject to satisfactory Contractor performance and availability of funds.

#### **Background - Analysis and Options**

RFP 15-003 was advertised on City Page, Biddingo and OPBA website on January 28, 2015, with a closing date of February 19, 2015. Two (2) Addenda were issued to answer questions received and the closing date was extended to Feb. 26, 2015. In response to the Request for Proposal, RFP documents were picked up by six (6) potential proponents, and upon closing, three (3) proposal submissions were received from the following proponents:

1. Carmichael Engineering Ltd.
2. Scotty's Refrigeration
3. Cimco Refrigeration

The RFP required a two envelope evaluation process with bidders submitting Envelope #1 – Technical Proposal, in which proponents provided sufficient information to demonstrate abilities, and Envelope #2 Proposal Fees, which contained all fees. If the Technical Proposal contained in Envelope #1 scored less than 60 points based on technical evaluation criteria, then the Proposal was not considered further and the 2nd sealed Envelope, #2, containing the Proposal Fees was not opened.

The two envelope process was used to ensure a fair evaluation of the proposals. The technical proposals were evaluated purely on the technical merits and the ability to meet the requirements set forth in the RFP without being unduly impacted by the financial proposals.

On March 26, 2015 the bids were evaluated by a team comprised of staff from Building & Facilities and IB Storey Engineering who provided independent project facilitation with Purchasing Services as the coordinator only. A standardized scoring system was used for the proposal as follows:

- 5 points available for Executive Summary;
- 25 points available for Organization and Industry Experience;
- 25 points available for Refrigeration System Service Contract Experience and Reference;
- 20 points available for Service Contract work Plan and Methodology;
- 5 points available for Documentation and Reporting;
- 5 points available for Submission Content;
- 15 points available for Proposal Fee.

Two out of the three proposal's technical submissions did not meet the required threshold of 60 points and hence their pricing envelopes were not opened. Only CIMCO met the threshold and as a result is recommended for award. The Proposal Fees submitted by CIMCO was \$642,908.88 plus applicable taxes. The amount recommended for award has been revised in accordance with the adjusted material requirement for the maintenance services.

The Proposal Fees submitted by CIMCO Refrigeration have been reviewed by Building & Facilities staff and found to be competitive and favourable when compared to the actual costs paid for these service in the last three years:

#### **Cost Analysis**

<b>Operating Budget Year</b>	<b>Actual</b>
2014 Operating Actual	\$178,068.82
2013 Operating Actual	\$161,065.38
2012 Operating Actual	\$185,155.45
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$524,289.65</b>

#### **Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan**

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the project will provide:

- **STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE:**  
Management Excellence - Providing excellence in the management of our city.

- **STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE:**  
Maintain Assets and Infrastructure to optimize existing infrastructure through sound asset management.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

**Regional Implications**

Not applicable.

**Conclusion**

The refrigeration plants are located at various community centres and are the operating system that provides and maintains artificial ice for the ten (10) rink pads (indoor and outdoor). Maintenance, service and regular upkeep of these plants is critical to maintaining ice standards without any negative impact on the scheduled programs and activities. CIMCO Refrigeration has provided the regular maintenance and service to the plants for many years. Building and Facilities staff have reviewed the bid submission and have determined that CIMCO Refrigeration has met the requirements of the bid specifications. Therefore, it is recommended that RFP15-003 be awarded to CIMCO Refrigeration for \$451,622.13 plus applicable taxes.

**Attachments**

N/A

**Report prepared by:**

Dave Merriman, Manager of Facilities, Ext. 8296

---

Michael Shatil  
Director of Building & Facilities

---

Dimitri Yampolsky  
Acting Commissioner of Strategic & Corporate  
Services