

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 23, Report No. 31, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on September 20, 2016.

**23 DEMOLITION OF A SINGLE DETACHED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING
AND NEW DEVELOPMENT
10316 KEELE STREET- MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
WARD 1 – WEST SIDE OF KEELE STREET AND NORTH OF MCNAUGHTON ROAD**

The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated September 7, 2016:

Recommendation

The City Clerk, on behalf of the Heritage Vaughan Committee, forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of July 20, 2016 (Item 2, Report No. 5) for Council's consideration:

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommends:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Richard Domes, Gagnon & Law Urban Planners Ltd., Keele Street, Vaughan, be received.

Report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed demolition under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for a single detached dwelling at 10316 Keele Street, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) that the property owner recycle the rubblestone from the dwelling foundation into a retaining wall or entry feature on the site;
 - b) that the interior woodwork, including the original and/or vintage panelled doors, transom, baseboard, panelled dado or wainscot, moulded door and window trim, and similar components, be examined to determine the potential for salvage and reuse. If it is determined not suitable for reuse in the proposed development, they should first be made available to the City as repair materials for heritage buildings elsewhere in Vaughan;
 - c) the examination to determine potential for salvage or reuse shall be done for the original 4 to 6 inch wide, tongue and groove floorboards.
2. That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the elevation design of the proposed development subject to following conditions:
 - a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 23, CW Report No. 31 – Page 2

- b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
- d) that the proponent commemorate the history of the site by developing signage for within the adjacent McNaughton Park;
- e) that the proponent submit a Tree Inventory/Assessment, and Tree Preservation/Remediation Plan, prepared by licensed arborist which specifically describes and identifies significant cultural heritage trees and existing specific trees for preservation through detailed inventory, evaluation and analysis of the possible impact the proposed development will have on existing trees on and adjacent to the subject property.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the demolition of a single detached house at 10316 Keele Street and the proposed new development within the Maple Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis

The subject property is known municipally as 10316 Keele Street. It is part of the North Gateway to the Maple Heritage Conservation District (see Maple Heritage Conservation District Study, Volume 2), located just before the intersection at McNaughton, marked by a treeline and heritage buildings on the west and is bordered by a stormwater pond to the north.

The Maple HCD is divided into distinct areas and the subject property falls within a "Residential Village" area. As such, those policies within the Guidelines will apply.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 23, CW Report No. 31 – Page 3

The existing built heritage house on the property is thought to be have been built in the 1870's and is therefore one of the older properties in The Village of Maple. The rural nature of the property and its location is the "start of the downslope to the main crossroads creates a sense of entry to the district". (Section 5.2 – Volume 2 of Maple Heritage Conservation District Study)

The existing landscape has a rural character with mature trees on an undulating terrain is bordered on the north side of the property by a swale and stormwater pond that further contributes to the rural feel of the property. The house is located near the Keele Street frontage on a small hill which is supported by a stone retaining wall. The stone wall is a recent construction, possibly installed in the 1990's.

As demolition is proposed of the existing building, policies in Section 4, regarding the demolition and salvage of heritage properties should be considered.

The new development should be considered under the Policies of Section 4, including:

4.4.1 Design Approach

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time, but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by: being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*
- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law New Development, of the Maple HCD Plan apply. Policies for the Residential Area are included in Section 9.5.2.*

Section 9 Guidelines include:

- Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.
- Site new house to preserve existing mature trees.
- Design house to reflect one of the local heritage architectural styles.
- New buildings should be designed to preserve and contribute to the scale and pattern of the historic District.

The existing proponent has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), submitted on June 20, 2016. The CHIA provided a detailed history of the property which dates to the early 19th century of settlement of Vaughan Township and is associated with the McQuarrie and McNaughton families, to its more recent history as a rental property.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 23, CW Report No. 31 – Page 4

The existing Georgian Revival style dwelling on the property is in a state of physical deterioration so advanced that it is not reasonable to retain the structure, although several elements of it may be salvaged for potential use. A full review of the state of the property is included in the attached CHIA, as well as identification of possible salvage features.

Regarding the impact to the streetscape, the CHIA argues that the area of the subject property has already evolved from an agricultural landscape to one of the new and large scale residential, commercial and light industrial built form and use. It argues that there is a minimal perception of this area being the prelude to the Heritage Conservation District due to this evolution.

Cultural Heritage staff has accepted this Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment and has found that it meets the City of Vaughan Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment Terms of Reference. A copy of it is attached to this report.

Proposed New Development

The proponent is proposing a development of 4 townhouse blocks fronting on to a common element Condominium Road and Keele Street with a total of 19 units built in a Second Empire style. Two 3 unit townhouse blocks face onto Keele Street with a height of 8.477 metres from finished grade which integrates into the existing scale of the Maple streetscape. Behind the townhouse blocks which face onto Keele Street, are two townhouse blocks with 6 and 7 units, also built in the Second Empire style. These properties are 3 stories, with a rooftop terrace and a total height of 11 metres.

The development is set back a minimum 4.5 metres from the proposed Keele Street road widening boundary, which ensures an appropriate streetscape setback in the Heritage Conservation District should York Region move forward with widening this section of Keele Street. This will allow the development to retain some of the village character.

The proposed development will also be utilizing salvage mitigation from the existing structure by recycling rubblestone from the foundation into the entry feature and salvaging interior woodwork and floorboards for possible reuse. The proponent will be responsible for historical commemoration of the farmstead in nearby McNaughton Park, in consultation with staff. McNaughton Park already commemorates one family by its name and the plaque will be able to commemorate both founding families.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on **July 5, 2016** and must be deliberated upon by Council by **October 4, 2016** to meet the 90 day timeline.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 23, CW Report No. 31 – Page 5

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the proposed application and determines that the proposed new development at 10316 Keele Street is consistent with the Maple Conservation District Plan. Should the Committee concur, the recommendations in this report may be adjusted.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Current Condition
3. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
4.
 - a) Site Plan
 - b) Elevations - North, East, West, South
 - c) Colour Elevations of Block 3
 - d) Colour Elevations of Block 4
 - e) Type A - Floor Plans and Sections
 - f) Type B - Floor Plans and Sections
 - g) Type C and E - Floor Plans
 - h) Type C and E - Sections
 - i) Type D and F - Floor Plans
 - j) Type D and F - Sections
 - k) Landscape Plan
 - l) Coloured Landscape Plan
 - m) Landscape Details
5. Renderings
 - a) View from Keele Street
 - b) Block 4 - West Face (Facing Keele Street)
6. Proposed Materials

Report prepared by:

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Moir Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext.8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)