

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 22, Report No. 31, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on September 20, 2016.

**22 NEW CONSTRUCTION AND DEMOLITION OF EXISTING DETACHED RESIDENCE
 5 ELIZABETH STREET
 THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
 WARD 5 - VICINITY OF YONGE STREET AND CENTRE STREET**

The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated September 7, 2016:

Recommendation

The City Clerk, on behalf of the Heritage Vaughan Committee, forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of July 20, 2016 (Item 1, Report No. 5) for Council's consideration:

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommends:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. David Brown, David Small Designs, Hurontario Street, Mississauga, be received.

Report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

1. THAT Council approve the proposed demolition of an existing residence and detached garage and new construction of a single detached house at 5 Elizabeth Street under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
 - b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and,
 - c) the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 22, CW Report No. 31 – Page 2

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: “To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage”

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval of the recommendations for the proposed demolition of an existing residential dwelling and detached garage and proposed new construction of a dwelling with an attached garage at 5 Elizabeth Street in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Location, Heritage Status, and Policies

The property, municipally known as 5 Elizabeth Street, is located on the east side of Elizabeth Street, south of Centre Street, at the edge of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD). The subject property is Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act. The subject property is located within the Residential Area of the Thornhill HCD and is part of a cluster of historical properties within a grid pattern of streets along Centre Street, Old Jane Street, Brooke Street, and Elizabeth Street.

The existing detached dwelling at 5 Elizabeth Street is an interpretation of a Georgian Revival style home. The Thornhill inventory notes its construction as 1950s but the submitted Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) provides further clarification on this construction date. The existing building is a 2-storey structure clad with white aluminum siding, has multi-pane hung windows with shutters, a hipped roof, and a symmetrical layout with a central doorway.

As demolition is proposed of the existing building, policies in Section 9.5, New Development, of the Thornhill HCD Plan apply. Policies for the Residential Area are included in Section 9.5.2. .

Guidelines include:

- Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.
- Site new house to preserve existing mature trees.
- Design house to reflect one of the local heritage architectural styles.
- New buildings should be designed to preserve and contribute to the scale and pattern of the historic District.

Existing Building – Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) submitted

A Heritage Impact Assessment was submitted, as the existing structure relates to one of the heritage styles noted in Section 9.1 of the Thornhill HCD Plan. The heritage consultant

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 22, CW Report No. 31 – Page 3

determined that a smaller brick clad dwelling was constructed on the property in the 1940s. The original house was completely enclosed by a 1976 renovation, and then further enlarged in 2004.

The Georgian Revival style is a product of the 1976 and 2004 renovations. The HIA writes that “A 1976 Building Permit indicates the 1940s dwelling was fully encased within the north part of a larger and completely remodeled dwelling. The interior was gutted and the exterior remodeled into the pseudo Georgian Revival style dwelling now on site”. The detached garage was also constructed at this time. The original house was built by the Weldricks between 1940 and 1947.

The HIA finds that the existing building does not contain sufficient Cultural Heritage value for conservation and that the proposed new construction will contribute to the District and conforms to the Thornhill HCD Plan.

Staff has reviewed the HIA and has found it acceptable. A copy of the HIA report will be available at the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting.

Proposed New Construction

The proposed new construction is a 2 storey detached dwelling in the Georgian style with a central gable. Details include board and batten wood siding, 4over4 hung windows, stone base, central doorway, and centre hall plan. The main focus of the residence is the central portion, accented by a porch, which is flanked on either side by wings that are stepped back. The right wing is the attached garage.

Landscape

The applicant has submitted an arborist report which indicates that 10 trees on the subject property will be preserved while 6 trees on the property are recommended to be removed. The proposal does not impact neighbouring trees or trees on City property. The applicant will be planting 10 trees and providing cash-in-lieu to replace the 6 proposed to be removed.

The generous front yard setback allows for several trees in the front yard to remain. The proposed new dwelling will have a similar front yard setback as the existing dwelling in order to preserve the generous front yard character.

Analysis

The existing heritage-style building on the subject property does not contain sufficient cultural heritage value to warrant preservation. Its value is its architectural style and siting within the subject property. These characteristics can be present in a newly constructed dwelling on the subject site.

The proposed detached dwelling conforms to the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan in the following ways and conforms to the policies and guidelines in Section 4.4 and Section 9.5.2:

- Sited with similar front yard and side yard setbacks that are consistent with the village pattern
- Preserves existing mature trees in the front yard that maintain and define the streetscape of Elizabeth Street
- Is designed in an appropriate heritage style and employs appropriate heights and massing that contribute to the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District character

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

Item 22, CW Report No. 31 – Page 4

Variances Proposed

The applicant will be applying for relief from the City of Vaughan Zoning By-law 1-88 for the following:

Proposal:

1. To permit a maximum lot coverage of 24.58% (22.99% dwelling, 1.59% covered porch).
2. To permit a minimum interior side yard setback of 1.0 metres to the air conditioning unit.
3. To permit a building height of 3.03 metres to the accessory building (shed).
4. To permit a minimum interior side yard setback of 0.53 metres to the accessory building (shed).

By-Law Requirements:

1. A maximum lot coverage of 20% is permitted.
2. A minimum of 1.2 metres is required to the air conditioning unit.
3. A maximum building height of 2.5 metres is required.
4. A minimum interior side yard setback of 0.60 metres is required.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Director of Development Planning recommends that Council approve the proposed demolition and new construction as it has been determined to conform to the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Subject Property and Context Photos
3. Proposed Streetscape Rendering
4. Proposed Site Plan and Elevations

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112
Maira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)