

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 19, Report No. 26, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted, as amended, by the Council of the City of Vaughan on June 23, 2015, as follows:

By receiving the following Communications:

C8. *Frank & Caterina Principe, dated June 15, 2015; and*

C9. *Bill & Jana Manolakos, dated June 16, 2015.*

19 DEMOLITION REQUEST OF PART V DESIGNATED BUILDING – 9796 KEELE STREET WARD 1 – VICINITY OF KEELE STREET AND MERINO ROAD

The Committee of the Whole recommends:

- 1) That the following report of the Commissioner of Planning, Director of Development Planning, and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated June 16, 2015, be received; and
- 2) That Communication C5 from Ms. Caterina Facciolo, Brattys LLP, Keele Street, Vaughan, dated June 15, 2015, advising that the application for demolition has been withdrawn, be received.

Recommendation

The Commissioner of Planning, Director of Development Planning, and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT the proposed demolition of the building located at 9796 Keele Street, Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act, BE REFUSED.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 1: To significantly reduce our use of natural resources and the amount of waste we generate

Objective 1.6: "To continue to reduce the amount of waste generated by Vaughan citizens, businesses and institutions"

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

Items that require Council decisions are first brought to the Heritage Vaughan Committee as a Municipal Heritage Committee established under Section 28 of the Ontario Heritage Act to advise Council on heritage matters, as discussed in the "Process and Heritage Vaughan Referral" section of this report.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 19, CW Report No. 26 – Page 2

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek a Council decision on the demolition request for the Part V Designated building at 9796 Keele Street in the Maple Heritage Conservation District. The building is classified as a non-heritage building in the Village of Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines (2007), and therefore the Guideline's policies for non-heritage buildings apply. The City's Built Heritage Evaluation scores the building as "Significant", as the house is a unique residential expression of Edwardian Classicism with an Arts-and-Crafts influence, is in remarkable original condition, and architecturally contributes to the south end of the village. Given that the building is supportive of the overall heritage character of the District, Cultural Heritage staff's position is that any future redevelopment of the site should explore all opportunities to integrate the cultural heritage asset into the design.

Background - Analysis and Options

Location	The subject property is located on the west side of Keele Street, south of Major Mackenzie Drive, specifically at the northwest corner of Keele Street and Merino Road at 9796 Keele Street in the Maple Heritage Conservation District as shown in Attachment #1.
Heritage Status and Building Information	<p>Designated Part V, Ontario Heritage Act, Maple Heritage Conservation District.</p> <p>The building is likely constructed in the early 1900s and moved to its current location circa 1972 by the Stong family, who owned property in both North York and Vaughan, as is evident from the newer foundation. The architecture is an interpretation of Edwardian Classicism with Arts-and-Crafts influence.</p> <p>The building is identified as a non-heritage building on Map 4 of the Village of Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines (2007) and therefore the following policies apply:</p> <p>2.4.3 Objectives for Non-Heritage Buildings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• To retain and enhance complementary characteristics of non-heritage buildings.• To encourage improvements to non-complementary buildings so that they further enhance the heritage character of the District. <p>4.3.3 Demolition of Non-Heritage Buildings</p> <p>Generally, the demolition of a Non-Heritage building is not supported, if the building is supportive of the overall heritage character of the District.</p>
Consultant Heritage Evaluation	<p>The Applicant has submitted a Heritage Impact Assessment shown in Attachment #3, written by a qualified heritage consultant, and recommends demolition of the building on the subject property.</p> <p>Cultural Heritage staff notes that the Heritage Impact Assessment submitted by the Applicant refers to the criteria of Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act - Criteria For Determining Cultural Heritage Value Or Interest - which is used to determine if property may be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. The building is currently Designated Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.</p>

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 19, CW Report No. 26 – Page 3

City Built Heritage Evaluation	<p>The City of Vaughan Built Heritage Evaluation of the subject property scored a rating of 69/100 which is a “B – Significant” grade shown in Attachment #2. The City’s evaluation of the heritage resource concludes that the architecture is supportive of the overall heritage character of the District.</p> <p>Heritage architectural details noted in the City of Vaughan Built Heritage Evaluation and the Record of the District’s Built Form published as Volume 1 of the Village of Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan, include: a front door framed by classically-inspired, gabled aedicule, arched windows with decorative brick arches and concrete sills, Edwardian-style projecting bay window with stain glass, classically-inspired, dentilled wooden cornice around entire building at eaves height, bell-fry on roof, and small verandah with ornate gingerbread above.</p>
Ontario Regulation 9/06 Evaluation	<p>As the Applicant conducted an evaluation of the property using Ontario Regulation 9/06, staff conducted the same exercise.</p> <p>A property may be designated Part IV, Section 29 if one or more of the following three criteria are met:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The property has design value or physical value because it,<ol style="list-style-type: none">i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, oriii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,<ol style="list-style-type: none">i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, oriii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.3. The property has contextual value because it,<ol style="list-style-type: none">i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, oriii. is a landmark. O. Reg. 9/06, s. 1 (2).

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 19, CW Report No. 26 – Page 4

	<p>Staff Evaluation</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The property has design value and physical value. This unassuming and modest house is representative of early 1900s architecture, as a residential expression of Edwardian Classicism with Arts and Crafts influence. The building demonstrates a high quality of craftsmanship, with ornate detailing throughout the interior and exterior of the building. 2. The property is associated with the Stong family, a significant family in the development of Toronto and Vaughan. Several earlier Stong buildings, some moved from Vaughan, are now open to the public as part of the Black Creek Pioneer Village. The house was moved from its original location in North York to the current site in Maple, demonstrating the period of suburbanization as the area grew from a modest village to a residential, commercial, and industrial centre. 3. The property has contextual value by maintaining and supporting the character of the Maple Heritage Conservation District as a collection of buildings, streets and open spaces. The Village of Maple was originally a 19th century settlement, and contains a wealth of 19th and early 20th century buildings of varied types and styles, such as the Beaverbrook House at 9995 Keele Street in the Georgian style, the Victorian Vernacular House at 9986 Keele Street from the 1800's, as well as later buildings from the early to mid-1900s, such as the Queen Anne home at 10084 Keele Street (c. 1910) and the houses at 10114, 10122, and 10128 Keele Street all constructed in the Arts and Crafts style circa 1920.
<p>Process and Heritage Vaughan refusal</p>	<p>The Owner submitted an application on April 30, 2015 under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act to demolish the building on the subject property which is Designated Part V as per the Ontario Heritage Act.</p> <p>Staff reviewed the application and deemed it complete on May 7, 2015. As per the Ontario Heritage Act, Council has 90 days from that date to give the Applicant:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the permit applied for; (b) notice that the council is refusing the application for the permit; or (c) the permit applied for, with terms and conditions attached. 2005, c. 6, s. 32 (3). <p>On May 13, 2015, Heritage Vaughan Committee reviewed this application prior to it being brought to Council and recommended to Council that the demolition request be refused. The following was the recommendation:</p>

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JUNE 23, 2015

Item 19, CW Report No. 26 – Page 5

	<p><u>Recommendation</u></p> <p><i>The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:</i></p> <p>1. <i>THAT the proposed demolition of the building located at 9796 Keele Street, Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act, BE REFUSED</i></p> <p>The Applicant has the option to appeal Council's decision to the Ontario Municipal Board as per Section 42 (6) of the Ontario Heritage Act.</p>
Opportunities	<p>Cultural Heritage staff encourages the Applicant to explore options to incorporate the subject building into any future proposed redevelopment of the site. Staff will work together with the Owner of the cultural heritage resource to support an active and engaged approach to heritage <i>conservation</i> and interpretation that maximizes awareness and education and encourages innovation in the use and <i>conservation</i> of heritage resources (VOP2010 Section 6.1.1.2.).</p>

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture –
 - i) The proposed new construction conforms to the District and will be a contributing built form asset in the Maple Heritage Conservation District

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

It is recommended that Council refuse the demolition request for the building located at 9796 Keele Street because the building is supportive and contributing to the overall heritage character of the Maple Heritage Conservation District protected under Part V Designation as per the Ontario Heritage Act.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Context Map
3. City of Vaughan Built Heritage Evaluation dated April 23, 2015
4. Heritage Impact Assessment dated November 12, 2014

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)