

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017**

Item 28, Report No. 13, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on April 19, 2017.

**28**

**RELOCATION OF VAUGHAN GLEN HOUSE  
REGISTERED SECTION 27 ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT  
9000 BATHURST STREET  
WARD 4 - VICINITY OF BATHURST STREET AND RUTHERFORD ROAD**

**The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the City Clerk, dated April 4, 2017:**

**Recommendation**

The City Clerk, on behalf of the Heritage Vaughan Committee, forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of March 22, 2017 (Item 1, Report No. 2) for Council's consideration:

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommends:

- 1) That Council approve the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated March 22, 2017.

Report of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated March 22, 2017

**Recommendation**

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee recommend that Vaughan Council approve the proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House at 9000 Bathurst Street, as shown on Attachment #2, under Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
  - a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning in consultation with the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
  - b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Vaughan Council do not constitute specific support for any development application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits/requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
  - c) the Owner submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division for the approval of a Heritage Permit;
  - d) that the Heritage Permit for the relocation of the Vaughan Glen House only be issued by Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division following a Site Plan Development Application for 9000 Bathurst Street being approved by Vaughan Council;

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017**

#### Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 2

- e) that a Letter of Credit in an amount equal to the structure's replacement value be submitted to the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division, should Vaughan Council approval of the relocation of the Vaughan Glen House;
- f) that a Conservation Plan and Relocation Plan be submitted to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to the issuance of a Heritage Permit for the proposed relocation. The Conservation Plan shall include the proposed measures to mothball and protect the Vaughan Glen House prior to and during relocation until final tenant occupancy;
- g) that a Commemoration Plan be developed at the cost of the Owner; and,
- h) that the Vaughan Glen House be Designated Part IV under the Ontario Heritage Act. The Designation By-law shall include a legal description that will solely identify lands containing the Vaughan Glen House and not the remainder of the subject property.

#### **Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

#### **Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

#### **Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

#### **Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan Committee approval of the recommendations to Vaughan Council for the proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House located at 9000 Bathurst Street. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, relocation of heritage resources located on Registered and Designated properties require Heritage Vaughan Committee and Council approval.

Associated development planning applications, specifically Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment Files OP.13.013 and Z.13.036, have been submitted for the subject property, and are currently under review by the Development Planning Department.

#### **Background - Analysis and Options**

##### **Location, Heritage Status, and Policies**

The subject property, municipally known as 9000 Bathurst Street, is located on the west side of Bathurst Street, south of Rutherford Road as shown on Attachment #1. The subject property is Registered under Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Applicable policies within Chapter 6 of the Vaughan Official Plan 2010 shall apply.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

#### Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 3

The Vaughan Glen House is a two-storey building constructed in the Georgian Revival style circa 1914. The Georgian Revival style was common in Ontario and especially Toronto in the 1920s as there was a move away from Gothic architecture as the early 20<sup>th</sup> century saw an influx of new immigrants and the existing English inhabitants of Toronto were keen to make their presence known. Wealthy suburbs like Rosedale, Forest Hill, and Kingsway Park were growing at the time, and experienced numerous Georgian and Classical Revivals, often referred to as Stockbroker Georgians and Greek Revival (Cruikshank, Tom. *Old Toronto Houses*).

The subject property is approximately 11.4 hectares in size and contains a large private community centre and place of worship located to the west of the Vaughan Glen House. The subject property is surrounded by low-rise residential to the south and west of the property, with institutional uses to the north and low-rise residential to the east in the Town of Richmond Hill.

An outbuilding on the property was demolished as it was deemed by the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division to have little heritage value. A report with this recommendation was considered by the Heritage Vaughan Committee and approved on December 10, 2014.

#### **History of Subject Property**

According to assessment records, the Vaughan Glen House was constructed in 1914 on lands owned by Edward Prentice on the east half of Lot 14 Concession 2 (100 acres). Edward and his wife Betty sold the land (100 acres) to Robert A. Campbell in 1925. Campbell sold parts of the land to Andrew Krall and another piece to James Vanderburgh and wife Mary. Krall eventually sold his piece to Vanderburgh as well. In 1928, Campbell sold another part of the property to Rennie C. Trimble, who in 1939 sold to Alice H. Clarkson.

Alice H. Clarkson was the wife of George Elliot who moved to the house at 9000 Bathurst Street. Alice and George lived with their children John, Max, Lilian de Arias, William, Austin, Geoffrey, and Stephen. The family nicknamed the property Primrose Hill after a favourite park in London, England. George Elliot Clarkson played ice hockey professionally and was a member on the Prince's IHC for England in the 1914 tournament of the LIHG (Ligue International du Hockey sur Glace) at Chamonix, France. This hockey tournament was regarded higher than other hockey tournaments in Europe as teams could recruit players from North America. While living in England, George Elliot coached England's hockey team in the 1924 Winter Olympics in Chamonix, France. England went on to win the bronze medal with Canada and the United States taking gold and silver respectively (<http://www.austinclarkson.ca/page3/page3.html> and correspondence with Austin Clarkson).

In 1942, Vanderburgh sold a 12 acre piece of property to Clarkson with another 75 acres being sold in 1947. For a time, Clarkson owned the entire 100 acre property. In 1956, Clarkson sold land to Raffaele and Salvatore Disera and Donald C. Stewart and Lily G. Mackie with the Diseras turning over their property to Stewart and Mackie 3 years later. In 1965, the Clarkson children granted land for \$2 to Cherrywood Properties. 5 years later, Cherrywood sold 10 acres to Donald Stewart and Lily Stewart. 3 years later, Cherrywood sold another 10 acres to the Stewarts. In 1987 the Stewarts sold 30.231 acres to Villa Private Hospital. On January 15, 1988, the Villa Private Hospital sold to Vaughan Glen Hospital the same 30.231 acres with 1.9 acres being sold to the Toronto Waldorf School a year later. On May 4, 1994, the remaining 28.331 acres was sold to the Trustees of the Islamic Shia Ithna-Asheri Jamaat of Toronto – the current owners.

#### **Proposal to Relocate within Development**

The Owner is proposing to relocate the Vaughan Glen House to a location approximately 80 metres northwest of its current location on the same subject property, as shown on Attachment

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

#### Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 4

#2, to facilitate the proposed development of a six-storey senior's buildings, an eight-storey condominium building, 60 three-storey townhouse units, a private secondary school, and a parking garage (Attachment #3).

A proposed use for the Vaughan Glen House has not yet been finalized and is not governed through the heritage permit process. Currently, the Owner has indicated that the Vaughan Glen House will likely be associated with the existing community centre and used as associated office space.

#### **Structural Assessment Submitted, Relocation Feasible**

A Structural Assessment, dated January 13, 2017, prepared by Hannigan Engineering Limited, was submitted to the City of Vaughan which concluded:

“It is our opinion the existing structure is in generally serviceable and stable condition and capable of remaining stable during relocation.”

The report includes further details and recommendations to ensure the stability of the house during relocation. These include, but are not limited to, sealing all windows and doors, reinstating the terrace roof at the rear of the building, disassembling the open roof portion of the house and re-assembling it after relocation.

#### **Heritage Impact Assessment Submitted**

Consistent with policies in the Vaughan Official Plan 2010, the Owner submitted a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) in April 2016 for the proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House. Staff provided comments to the Owner and requested further information and justification. An HIA addendum, dated January 31, 2017, was submitted to the City and a copy is attached to this report (Attachment #4).

The HIA addendum considers and evaluates six possible options (1, 2a, 2b, 3, 4, and 5) for the future of the Vaughan Glen House and recommends option 5 which places the Vaughan Glen House northwest of its current location adjacent to the Don Valley River (Attachment 2). The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division is satisfied with the contents and recommendations of the Heritage Impact Assessment.

#### **Landscape and Existing Trees**

The Owner has submitted an Arborist Report that includes an Existing Tree Inventory Plan, Assessment, and Edge Management Plan. This report and proposed Landscape Plans are currently under review by Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division. Currently, the Vaughan Glen House is associated with the Don Valley River and framed by large coniferous trees. The proposed location will include substantial landscaping that will surround the house, through existing and proposed landscaping, and maintain its association with the river. The final landscape details will be reviewed through the Site Development application stage.

#### **Analysis**

The subject property is not located within a Heritage Conservation District, and therefore, no District Plans apply for the review of this proposal. The following documents were considered for the review of this application:

- Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada
- Provincial Policy Statement

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

#### Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 5

- Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport Eight Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties
- Vaughan Official Plan 2010, Chapter 6

#### **Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada**

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada provide guidance for the conservation of cultural heritage resources in Canada (Attachment #6). Standards 1-9 as follows are oriented towards preservation, while standards 10-12 are additional for rehabilitation, and 13-14 are additional for restoration.

Standard	Analysis
Standard 1 – Conserve historic value and historic place.	The location of the Vaughan Glen House adjacent to the Don Valley River, set well back from the street, and surrounded with landscaping is one of its character defining elements. The proposal to restore the building and relocate it maintains these elements as the proposed location is adjacent to the Don Valley River, surrounded by landscaping, and still associated with Bathurst Street while substantially set back.
Standard 2 – Conserve changes over time	The HIA addendum concluded that the Vaughan Glen House was constructed in stages, which have now become part of the heritage resource. All components will be conserved and relocated.
Standard 3 – Minimal intervention	The stand-alone location of the Vaughan Glen House (page 15 of the HIA addendum) allows a minimal intervention approach, whereas connecting it to a newly constructed building would require greater intervention.
Standard 4 – Do not add false heritage elements	Not proposed.
Standard 5 – Find a use that requires minimal change	Presently, the Owner is envisioning a use that is associated with the community centre, although current heritage policies do not permit a use to be dictated.  The stand-alone location will require less intervention compared with connecting it to one of the proposed mid-rise buildings and having the Vaughan Glen House serve as a lobby or similar function.
Standard 6 – Protect and stabilize until intervention	The Conservation Plan will include information on how the Vaughan Glen House will be protected and mothballed until relocation and final tenant occupancy.
Standard 7 – Use gentlest means possible for any intervention	Details to be reviewed as part of the Conservation Plan.
Standard 8 – Maintain on an ongoing basis	Tools such as the Property Standards By-law and Part IV Designation assist in the conservation of cultural heritage resources.
Standard 9 – Intervention to be visually compatible	To be reviewed with the Conservation Plan. The proposed relocation and repair work maintains the existing style of the heritage resource.

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 6

#### **Provincial Policy Statement**

The Provincial Policy Statement is a guiding policy document for development in Ontario and issued under Section 3 of the Planning Act. Section 2.6 writes:

*“Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscaped shall be conserved.”*

The proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House conserves the cultural heritage resource while allowing new development on the subject property.

#### **Eight Guiding Principles in the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties**

The Ministry of Culture (now the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport) has identified eight guiding principles in the conservation of built heritage properties as follows:

<b>Principle</b>	<b>Analysis</b>
1. Respect for documentary evidence	The heritage consultant has investigated the building's construction to ensure all proposed work is consistent with original construction of building. Documentary evidence and photos have been gathered by City staff and heritage consultant.
2. Respect for the original location	While the building is proposed to be relocated approximately 80 metres northwest of its current location, the building still respects the original location and context. The relocation allows the proposal to better meet the remaining 7 guiding principles.
3. Respect for historic material	A minimal intervention approach has been adopted and will be used in Conservation Plan.
4. Respect for original fabric	All proposed repair work will be completed with sympathetic materials to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division through the Conservation Plan.
5. Respect for the building's history	The side additions to the Vaughan Glen House are not original, but will be maintained and conserved.
6. Reversibility	All alterations will be documented accurately to allow reversibility.
7. Legibility	Not applicable as no new additions are proposed for the Vaughan Glen House.
8. Maintenance	The Conservation Plan will indicate a schedule of regular upkeep and repair work.

A copy of the principles is attached to this report (Attachment #5).

## CITY OF VAUGHAN

### EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 7

#### **Vaughan Official Plan 2010 (VOP 2010)**

Policy 6.2.2.7 of VOP 2010 refers to the relocation of Designated properties, however, staff had regard for this section as the Vaughan Glen House is a Registered heritage property. The section explains on-site retention of the original use and on-site retention in an adaptive re-use as preferred options before relocation is considered.

Due to the underground parking related to the developed proposal for the site, in-situ retention would require the temporary relocation of the heritage resource. As such, several options for relocation, all within the development area, were considered by the Owner. These options are outlined in the attached HIA addendum.

Policy 6.2.4.1 of VOP 2010 identifies that a Heritage Impact Assessment “must demonstrate whether the heritage values and character of the cultural heritage resources, as identified by the City, are being retained, improved, adversely impacted or lost by the proposed development”.

Policy 6.2.4.2 of VOP 2010 identifies that the review of Heritage Impact Assessments “will be guided by good heritage conservation practice”. *Good heritage conservation practice* is included in the definitions section of the VOP 2010 and include the Ministry’s Eight Guiding Principles and Parks Canada’s Standards and Guidelines, both of which are reviewed in this report.

Urban Design and Cultural Heritage staff are of the opinion that the proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House conforms to the policies of VOP 2010.

#### **Part IV Individual Designation under the Ontario Heritage Act Proposed**

The Owner has recommended Part IV Designation of the Vaughan Glen House after its relocation as the resource meets the criteria of having cultural heritage value according to Ontario Regulation 9/06. This is noted in Section 2.5 of the attached HIA Addendum.

A Part IV Designation is registered on title of the property and is one of the best methods for the preservation of a cultural heritage resource as per policy 6.2.2.1 of VOP 2010.

#### **Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

#### **Regional Implications**

N/A

#### **Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed relocation of the Vaughan Glen House conforms to the policies and guidelines noted above. Accordingly, staff recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the recommendation in this report for consideration by Vaughan Council.

#### **Attachments**

1. Location Map
2. Site Map

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**

**EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017**

Item 28, CW Report No. 13 – Page 8

3. Site Plan
4. Heritage Impact Assessment Addendum
5. Eight Guiding Principles
6. Standards and Guidelines
7. A+B Renderings of Condominium Building and Seniors' Building
8. A-E Photos of Subject Property March 2, 2017

**Report prepared by:**

Daniel Rende, Planner I, ext. 8112

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)