

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 6 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

*For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on December 1, 2015*

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:05 p.m., on October 21, 2015.

Present: Christine Radewych, Chair
Frank Alaimo
Sandra Colica
Lelio DeCicco
Councillor Rosanna DeFrancesca
David Grossman
Nick Pacione
Fadia Pahlawan
Giacomo Parisi
Councillor Alan Shefman
Antoinella Strangis
Howard Tuchman

Also Present: Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage
Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

**1 PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF GARAGE AND ADDITION TO EXISTING
PART V DESIGNATED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING
21 KELLAM STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
WARD 1 – VICINITY OF ISLINGTON AVENUE AND NASHVILLE ROAD**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated October 21, 2015, was approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Frank Fallico, property owner, was received.

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed garage demolition and addition to a single detached dwelling at 21 Kellam Street, subject to the following conditions:

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

- a) The Owner shall submit final copies of the proposed development to Cultural Heritage staff for the issuance of a Heritage Permit;
- b) The final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- c) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning; and,
- d) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any further variances, permits or requirements that may be sought in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider a proposed addition to a single detached residential building at 21 Kellam Street within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Status	Designated Part V, Ontario Heritage Act, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.
Proposal	The subject property contains an existing Victorian building constructed circa 1900. The Kleinburg-Nashville inventory notes it to be a "puzzling structure" as it doesn't closely relate to precedent heritage style in Kleinburg.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

	<p>The applicant is proposing to remove the existing detached garage and construct a 1-storey addition on the right side of the house, a 2 storey addition on the left which will include parking facilities. All additions are located towards the back of the property and connect to the building at the rear of the property where a new addition was constructed in 2012. At the front portion of the building, on the right side, the wall is being bumped out and relocated to allow for more floor space on the interior. The wall is being cut a few feet from the front elevation so as not to disturb the original layout of the house. The same window will be used the relocated portion of the wall. Furthermore, this side of the house will be largely obstructed by a mature tree located in the front yard of the house. Please see plans and photos attached to this report.</p> <p>The proposed additions are constructed in a similar Victorian style with a clapboard finish, matching gables, and traditional style garage doors. The windows are similar hung windows, but are 1over1 to contrast with the 2over2 of the main portion.</p>
Variances	<p>The applicant has submitted application A313/15 to the Committee of Adjustment. The Development Planning Department has recommended deferral until Heritage Vaughan has viewed the application. The Committee of Adjustment application is slated to be brought to the meeting of October 22, 2015.</p> <p>The following variances are proposed:</p> <p>Proposal:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To permit a maximum lot coverage of 35.5% for the dwelling. 2. To permit a minimum rear yard setback of 3.45 metres to the dwelling. 3. To permit a swimming pool to be located in the side yard. <p>By-Law Requirements:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A maximum lot coverage of 30% is permitted. 2. A minimum rear yard setback of 7.5 metres is permitted. 3. A private swimming pool shall be located entirely in the rear yard. <p>Comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Cultural Heritage staff supports the variance for increased lot coverage as the site is located on Kellam Street, which is connected to Islington Avenue and an extension of the Islington Avenue commercial core. As such, an increase of 5.5% is consistent with the commercial character of Kellam Street. 2. Cultural Heritage staff supports the variance for a reduced rear yard setback as an existing detached garage is currently located in that area. The proposed addition allows for a greater rear yard setback than the current existing garage. 3. Cultural Heritage does not review pool permits or

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

	comment on pool permits (if archaeology is not a concern).
Building Materials	The applicant is required to submit building material information to Cultural Heritage staff for review and approval. Specific manufacturer information is required.
Archaeology	<p>The subject parcel of land lies in an area identified as a being of high archaeological potential in the City's database of archaeological resources. As such, the owner is advised that the following standard clauses apply:</p> <p><i>i. Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport and the City of Vaughan's Planning Department shall be notified immediately.</i></p> <p><i>ii. In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.</i></p>

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture

- The proposed new construction conforms to the District and will be a contributing built form asset in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed garage demolition and new construction of a single detached dwelling at 21 Kellam Street. The proposal is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Photos of subject property, submitted by Applicant October 7, 2015
3. Drawings submitted by Applicant, received October 7, 2015

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112
Maira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**2 PROPOSED DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION OF PART V DESIGNATED
SINGLE DETACHED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING
70 NAPIER STREET – KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
WARD 1 - VICINITY OF ISLINGTON AVENUE AND NASHVILLE ROAD**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated October 21, 2015, was approved;
- 2) That the Committee of Adjustment was requested to consider the concerns raised by Heritage Vaughan regarding the excess coverage of the cabana; and
- 3) That the deputation of Mr. Fausto Cortese, representing the applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. That the proposed demolition and new construction at 70 Napier Street BE APPROVED subject to the following conditions:
 - a) The Owner shall submit final copies of the proposed development to Cultural Heritage staff for the issuance of a Heritage Permit;
 - b) The final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
 - c) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning; and
 - d) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any further variances, permits or requirements that may be sought in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Objective 4.1: “To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage”

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the proposed demolition and new construction of a single detached residential building at 70 Napier Street within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District (HCD).

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Status	<p>Designated Part V, Ontario Heritage Act, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.</p> <p>The Kleinburg-Nashville HCD is divided into distinct areas and the subject property falls within the “Residential Villages” area. As such, those policies within the Guidelines apply.</p> <p>All new construction, renovations, and demolition will require the approval of the Heritage Vaughan Committee and a Heritage Permit in addition to any other City approvals.</p>
Existing Building	<p>The existing building is a single storey Cape-Cod building constructed circa 1950. Cultural Heritage staff had previously conducted a Built Heritage Evaluation in 2011 for the property and it scored a grading of 45/100 which is in the “Modest Significance” category.</p> <p>As such, demolition may be proposed if a suitable replacement structure is proposed that is consistent with the streetscape and Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.</p>
Proposed Design	<p>The applicant has proposed a single detached dwelling and a cabana in the Victorian Vernacular architectural style – a recognized style as per the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Guidelines.</p>
Variances	<p>The applicant has submitted application A291/15 to the Committee of Adjustment. The Development Planning Department has recommended deferral until Heritage Vaughan has viewed the application. The Committee of Adjustment application is slated to be brought to the meeting of November 19, 2015.</p> <p>The following variances are proposed:</p>

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

	<p>Proposal:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To permit a maximum lot coverage of 40.08%. 2. To permit a maximum building height of 5.502m for the cabana. 3. To permit a minimum rear yard setback of 1.2m to the cabana. <p>By-Law Requirements:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Maximum lot coverage 30%. 2. Maximum building height 4.5m (cabana). 3. Minimum rear yard setback 7.5m (cabana). <p>Further information on composition of 40.08% lot coverage: House footprint: 29.65% Porch footprint: 0.65% Loggia (rear porch) footprint: 3.19% Fireplace projections: 0.12% Cabana footprint: 6.47% (5.91 for main portion, 0.56 for stairs)</p> <p>Analysis</p> <p>Cultural Heritage has no objection to the proposed lot coverage variance as the design, massing, and scale of the building viewed from Napier Street is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and the cabana will not be visible from Napier Street. The Committee of Adjustment process is separate from the heritage review process and the variances are evaluated from a heritage context only.</p> <p>The following are relevant Goals, Policies, and Guidelines where this proposal is found to be consistent with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Section 5.2.1 District Goals and Objectives, Townscape: "To preserve existing patterns of streets, lanes, and pathways and to restore the heritage character of streetscapes by control and guidance of new development." • Section 5.2.5 District Goals and Objectives, Future Development in the District: "To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within." • Section 6.3 Policies for New Development: "New buildings should be sympathetic in siting, scale, material, texture, and general design to the heritage building around them." • Section 9.5.3 Residential Villages, 9.5.3.1. Site Planning outlines the elements that define the heritage character of the residential village, including "Generous lot sizes and modest house sizes", and the generous presence of mature trees.
--	---

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Section 9.5.3.3 Scale and Massing: “New residential construction in the Residential Villages should respect local heritage precedents in scale and massing.” <p>Cultural Heritage staff has no objection the remainder of the variances noted above regarding cabana height and rear yard setback to cabana.</p>
Building Materials	Building materials have been submitted to the City and will be reviewed by Cultural Heritage staff.
Archaeology	<p>The subject parcel of land lies in an area that has previously been cleared through the draft plan of subdivision noted above. As such, the owner is advised that the following standard clauses apply:</p> <p><i>Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport and the City of Vaughan’s Development Planning Department shall be notified immediately.</i></p> <p><i>In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.</i></p>

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends approval for the proposed new construction because the design and scale of the proposal and its effect to the Napier Street streetscape is consistent with the character of Napier Street and the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Plan
3. Elevations
4. Cabana Elevations

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**3 NEW CONSTRUCTION AND PART V DESIGNATED SINGLE DETACHED
RESIDENTIAL BUILDING
72 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
WARD 1 – VICINITY OF ISLINGTON AVENUE AND NASHVILLE ROAD**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated October 21, 2015, was approved.

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. That the proposed new construction for a single detached dwelling at 72 Napier Street BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) the final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage section;
 - b) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
 - c) the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any further variances, permits or requirements that may be sought in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and
 - d) the Owner shall submit final copies of the proposed development to Cultural Heritage staff for the issuance of a Heritage Permit.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: “To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage”

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider of a proposed new construction for a single detached residence at 72 Napier Street within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage status and process	<p>Designated Part V, Ontario Heritage Act, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.</p> <p>All new construction, renovations, and demolition must be consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan and require the approval of the Heritage Vaughan Committee and a Heritage Permit in addition to any other City approvals. The Kleinburg-Nashville HCD is divided into distinct areas and the subject property falls within the “Residential Villages” area. As such, those policies within the Plan apply.</p>
Existing Building	<p>In April 2008, the Owner applied for and received permission to demolish the previously existing structure on the property and received approval to build a new dwelling in the lot (HP 2008.011.00). The lot has been vacant since that period and the owner has submitted a new design for the proposed new building.</p>
Proposed Design	<p>The applicant has proposed a single detached dwelling in the Georgian Neo-Classical architectural style – a recognized style as per the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.</p> <p>Previous heritage staff comments were submitted regarding an earlier submission of the proposed dwelling and detached garage and the current drawings have incorporated those comments into the final design. One outstanding detail is the confirmation regarding the material of the front door, which staff recommends be of a wood and a solid panel design as outlined in Section 9.2.3 of the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan. However, this detail may be confirmed through staff consultation.</p> <p>Note: The submitted coloured renderings do not match the</p>

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

	submitted drawings and elevations. Staff comments are directed towards the submitted and stamped elevation, landscape and site plan drawings only.
Recommended Revision	<p>The following revision is recommended by Cultural Heritage staff:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">that the proposed front yard landscape design be reconsidered to a more naturalized, less formal approach to contribute to the rural and natural setting of the District, in support of Objective 5.2.3. “The Roads: <i>To preserve the rural quality of the views and vistas from the roads</i>”, and Objective 5.2.4 “The Rural and Natural Setting: <i>To preserve and enhance the experience of the rural and natural character of the Kleinburg-Nashville setting.</i>” See Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan Section 9.5 New Development, 9.5.3 Residential Villages and Section 9.7.7.5 Rural Lawns and Meadows.
Materials	Materials will be reviewed at the staff level prior to issuance of the Heritage Permit.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture –
 - i) The proposed architecture conforms to the District and will be a contributing built form asset in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends that the proposed new construction of a single detached dwelling at 72 Napier Street be approved as it is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Plan
3. Elevations

Report prepared by:

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

Maira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

4 **PROPOSED DESIGNATION UNDER PART IV OF THE**
ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT OF GALLANOUGH RESOURCE CENTRE

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated October 21, 2015, was approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Jacob Freedman, was received.

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

- ### **Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: “To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage”

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the proposed Part IV Designation of the Gallanough Resource Centre, located at 1 Brooke Street.

Background - Analysis and Options

Request from Council

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Council requested staff to prepare a designation report to determine the possibility of a Part IV Designation of the Gallanough Resource Library on June 23, 2015. The following was the recommendation:

Item 22, Report No. 24, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on June 23, 2015.

The Committee of the Whole recommends:

- 1) That the following be approved:
 1. That staff prepare a heritage designation report in consultation with the Heritage Vaughan committee, providing a comprehensive summary of the architectural, historical and contextual value of the Gallanough Building;
 2. That subject to its review of the staff report, this Council designate the Gallanough Building as an architecturally and historically significant building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act; and
 3. That this designation have the impact of ensuring that any proposed changes to the architecturally and historically significant features of the building must be reviewed by the City within the context of the impact on its architectural and historical significance; and
- 2) That the following resolution submitted by Councillor Shefman, dated June 2, 2015, be received.

Member's Resolution

Submitted by Councillor Alan Shefman.

Whereas, it is important to ensure that architecturally and historically significant buildings in the City of Vaughan are maintained in a manner that preserves their distinctive features, and

Whereas, the Gallanough building is an architecturally and historically significant building in the City of Vaughan, and,

Whereas, R. Napier Simpson, a renowned and significant Canadian architect, designed the Gallanough Building; and,

Therefore be it resolved that this Council designate the Gallanough Building as an architecturally and historically significant building under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act; and,

That staff prepare a heritage designation report in consultation with Heritage Vaughan committee, providing a comprehensive summary of the architectural, historical and contextual value of the building; and,

That this designation has the impact of ensuring that any proposed changes to the architecturally and historically significant features of the building must be reviewed by the City within the context of the impact on its architectural and historical significance.

Designation Process

In accordance with Part IV, Section 29 of Ontario Heritage Act the heritage designation process includes the following:

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

- Designation Report to determine if property is of cultural heritage value
- Report brought to Heritage Vaughan for consultation
- Report brought to Council
- Council decision
- Notice of intention to Designate to City Clerk, Owner, Newspaper (or alternative)
- 30 days notice required
- If no objection received, Council passes designation by-law
- By-law served on the Owner and Ontario Heritage Trust, registered in land registry office, and notice published in newspaper (or alternative)

If an objection is received during the 30 day period, the matter is referred to the Conservation Review Board

Designation Report

A Designation Report has been prepared by Cultural Heritage staff to determine the cultural heritage value of the Gallanough Resource Centre (See Attachment 2).

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, specifically:

Service Excellence: Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends that the Gallanough Resource Centre be approved for Part IV Designation as per the Ontario Heritage Act due to its architectural, historical, and contextual significance.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Designation Report for the Gallanough Resource Centre, 1 Brooke Street

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112
Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Maira Wilson, Sr. Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

**5 PROPOSED CONSERVATION OF THOMAS FRAZIER WALLACE HOUSE AND
 DR. PETER MCLEAN HOUSE AND NEW CONSTRUCTION
 177, 185, AND 197 WOODBRIDGE AVENUE, WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE
 CONSERVATION DISTRICT
 WARD 2 – VICINITY OF WOODBRIDGE AVENUE AND KIPLING AVENUE**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) That the Heritage Vaughan Committee requested that the applicant reconsider the present proposal taking into consideration the issues raised regarding a design for the new development that is sympathetic to the historic character of the district and the two heritage buildings, and work with the community to find an acceptable approach for the development;
- 2) That the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated October 21, 2015, was received; and
- 3) That the following deputations were received:
 1. Mr. Mark Zwicker, representing the applicant;
 2. Mr. Philip Evans, representing the applicant;
 3. Ms. Gina Pietrangelo, James Street, Woodbridge;
 4. Mr. Jamie Maynard, William Street, Woodbridge;
 5. Ms. Doreen Smith, Wallace Street, Woodbridge; and
 6. Dr. Asim Izzat, Park Drive, Woodbridge.

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. That the proposed relocation and conservation of the Thomas Frazier Wallace House and Dr. Peter McLean House and new construction at 177, 185, and 197 Woodbridge Avenue BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) The Owner shall provide a letter of credit in the amount calculated at \$125 dollars per square foot for each of the homes at 185 and 197 Woodbridge Avenue, the Thomas Frazier Wallace House and Dr. Peter McLean House respectively;
 - b) That the Owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the two relocated heritage buildings;
 - c) That the Owner enter into an Access Easement with the City for the two Privately Owned Publically-Accessible Spaces (POPS);
 - d) The Owner shall submit final copies of the proposed development to Cultural Heritage staff for the issuance of a Heritage Permit;
 - e) The final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
 - f) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;

- g) That the Owner understand that Heritage Vaughan Committee approvals do not constitute specific support for any variances, permits or requirements by other City reviewing bodies, that may be sought in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the proposed new construction and the relocation and conservation of two heritage buildings at 177, 185 and 197 Woodbridge Avenue within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Status

- All subject properties are Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act as they are located within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.
- 177 Woodbridge Avenue is a one storey, commercial, modernist building. It is identified as non-contributing in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan).
- 185 Woodbridge Avenue, c. 1875, is a Victorian Gothic Revival house, known as the Thomas Frazier Wallace house. It is Registered under Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. Identified as Contributing in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- 197 Woodbridge Avenue, c. 1893, is a Queen Anne Revival house known as the Dr. Peter McLean house and office. It is Registered under Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act and identified as Contributing in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

- All new construction, additions, demolitions and changes to the exterior of buildings within the subject properties require approval of a Heritage Permit application, with Heritage Vaughan Committee review and approval, in addition to other City permits such as Building Permits or Planning Application approvals.
- Proposed changes to properties designated within heritage conservation districts must be in keeping with the heritage character of the building, the historical streetscape, and with the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Design Review Panel

Iterations of the development proposal have been presented to Design Review Panel on February 27, 2014 and August 27, 2015.

Cultural Heritage Review of Proposed Development

The following is a Cultural Heritage analysis of the proposed development based on conformance to the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan (2009) and the Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan (approved by the Ontario Municipal Board on February 24, 2015).

The Cultural Heritage analysis is divided into five main areas of interest:

1. Heritage Conservation
2. Building Height
3. Setbacks and Relocation
4. Transitions of New Buildings in Relation to Heritage Resources
5. New Construction

1. Heritage Conservation

Policies and Guidelines

Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan, Section 5.3:

Properties that contain heritage resources that have been listed or designated as part of the City of Vaughan Heritage Inventory shall conserve the heritage character and heritage attributes identified as part of the Cultural Services Designation Report.

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan, Section 6.1.1 Woodbridge Avenue - Heritage Attributes:

- Main Street character, with pedestrian oriented retail at grade level and a variety of other uses above grade, mostly residential.
- A street wall of buildings averaging between 3 and 4 floors, with some buildings rising up to 6 floors.
- Storefronts open directly onto the sidewalk and provide pedestrians with a variety of storefronts, which change every few steps.
- Buildings are often built with zero (or minimum) setback.

Analysis

The Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan and Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan both speak to the existing heritage character of Woodbridge Avenue as a commercial corridor and a focal point to the village which shall be conserved carried into future development.

2. Building Height

Policies and Guidelines

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan, Section 6.1.1 Woodbridge Avenue - Heritage Attributes:

- A street wall of buildings averaging between 3 and 4 floors, with some buildings rising up to 6 floors.

Guidelines:

- Generally, new buildings along Woodbridge Avenue should be no taller than 4 floors (13m) and must be sympathetic to, and transition from, the height of adjacent contributing buildings with a minimum 45 degree angular plane, starting from the existing height of the contributing building, measured at the building's edge.
- New buildings may be allowed an increase in building height to 6 storeys provided that they meet official plan policy. In such cases, a podium of a minimum 2 floors and a maximum of 4 floors is required, with the additional two floors stepping back on a 45 degree angular plane.

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan, Section 6.4.2.2. Woodbridge Avenue (Character Area) - Heritage Attributes:

- Woodbridge Avenue has a Main Street character, which includes heritage buildings that are 2 and 3 floors tall.
- More recent construction includes buildings that are 4 and 6 floors tall, facing Woodbridge Avenue.

Guidelines:

- Additional building height, to a maximum of 6 floor (20m), may be considered only when there is no undue impact to the public realm and/or adjacent properties, including an impact on sunlight penetration and views. Additional building height must step-back along a 45 degree angular plane from:
 - The street, starting at 13 metres, when facing a street and starting at 9.5 metres, when facing another property; and
 - The height of any contributing building

Analysis

The applicant is proposing a 7 storey building at a height of 22.68m from the finished grade with a podium of 2 storeys. The proposed height does not conform to the Guidelines, however, the overage in height will have minimal impact to the heritage assets on the site as it is stepped back and the overage in height is limited to a small portion of the site. The applicant has outlined in the submitted Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) where the proposed building exceeds the maximum heights within the 45 degree angular plane requirements. This includes:

- South side (rear) of site, an overage of approximately 1 storey
- East side of site, an overage of less than a storey
- West side of site, an overage of less than a storey
- From height of Wallace House, an overage of 2.5 storeys
- From height of McLean House, an overage of 2.5 storeys

The following impacts to public realm and neighbouring properties have been considered:

- Woodbridge Avenue (north side): The density of the site has been pulled back from the Woodbridge Avenue elevation compared to previous

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

submissions to create privately owned publically-accessible spaces (POPS) and generous side yards for the heritage buildings.

- Wallace Street (east side): Height overages are under 1 storey. The majority of massing is the 2 storey podium along this elevation.
- Old Firehall Lane (west side): The height overage is less than 1 storey, with a 3 storey podium closest to the property edge.
- Rear (south side): The proposed development is an L-shaped lot, with 197 Woodbridge Avenue extending further back. As such, the massing for the left portion of the site has been made slender as this abuts the rear-side of townhouses. A 14.257m buffer has been provided between the proposed 7-storey portion of the building and the existing townhouses. The 7-storey portion extends further back on the right side of the site, though it drops off closer to the rear property boundary. The rear property boundary, on the right rear portion, contains the first storey terraces and abuts the side flankages of the townhouse development.

3. Setbacks and Relocation

Policies and Guidelines

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan

Section 6.1.1:

- Existing contributing building should retain their historic setbacks, and create front landscaped courtyards that open onto Woodbridge Avenue to building on the 'green' character of the Street.

Sections 6.4.1.1, 6.4.1.2:

- The historic setbacks of contributing buildings should be maintained and contributing buildings should not be relocated to a new setback line. New buildings must be sympathetic to the adjacent contributing buildings.

Section 6.5:

- Buildings and structures listed as 'contributing in the Woodbridge HCD may not be demolished or moved.

Section 6.2.3 – Relocation of Contributing Buildings:

- Buildings and structures located within properties that are listed as contributing to the Woodbridge HCD Heritage Character should not be relocated and should remain in-situ within their existing context.

Section 6.6.3 – Tree Canopy and Vegetation:

- Much of the heritage 'Village' character of Woodbridge derives from the character of the vegetation, landscape and topography. The conservation of mature vegetation, including trees and stands of trees is a key aspect of the HCD Plan as well as the conservation of the rolling land form, the remnant riverbeds and the distinct vegetative character that define the valleylands.

Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan - 5.1.1 Woodbridge Avenue:

- New development adjacent to heritage contributing buildings must comply with the Street Wall Setbacks Guidelines of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- The historic setbacks of contributing buildings should be maintained and contributing buildings should not be relocated to a new setback line.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

Analysis

The Applicant proposes to relocate both heritage buildings closer to Woodbridge Avenue. The proposed relocation is inconsistent with the HCD Guidelines, however, in this instance, relocation of the heritage buildings will provide the following substantial public realm benefits:

- The proposal includes an improved pedestrian experience along Woodbridge Avenue within the public right-of-way including street trees, a 1.7m wide sidewalk, and a unit paved area ranging from 3.3m to 4m. The portion of Woodbridge Avenue fronting the proposed development site currently contains a narrow sidewalk in front of the McLean House adjacent to a short retaining wall.
- Two proposed privately owned publically-accessible spaces (POPS) between the heritage buildings will create additional destinations for pedestrians along Woodbridge Avenue. The applicant has improved the design of the POPS from the previous submission by creating active frontages of the heritage buildings onto the POPS.
- The POPS will allow for greater public interaction with the heritage buildings than currently exists.
- The adaptive reuse of both heritage buildings will help to ensure their maintenance and longevity in the community.
- Commercial use of the heritage buildings will contribute to the animation of the Woodbridge Avenue streetscape.

Heritage Conservation Districts are considered Cultural Heritage Landscapes, and thus, landscape alterations must be carefully considered. Relocating two heritage buildings, removing mature trees, and re-grading the site for new development will ultimately change the nature of the public streetscape and landscape. The proposed changes have been reviewed by staff through the lens of conforming to the Woodbridge HCD Plan and achieving the vision, principles and objectives in the Secondary Plan. As the Woodbridge Centre area intensifies, increased pedestrian activity is anticipated along Woodbridge Avenue as the main commercial street.

The proposal meets the following objectives in the Woodbridge HCD Plan:

5.1 Objectives

- Conserve contributing buildings, landscapes, monuments and streetscapes.
- Ensure new designs contribute to the Woodbridge heritage character.
- Manage any development or redevelopment proposed within the district, in a manner that is sensitive and responsive to all aspects necessary to ensure the protection and conservation of the heritage resources, in order to maintain the village character of the Woodbridge District.
- Ensure individual heritage structures and landscapes are maintained, and new development or redevelopment sensitively integrated, as part of a comprehensive district.
- Support a welcoming, interesting pedestrian environment by encouraging pedestrian amenities and by maintaining human-scaled development and connections to adjacent neighbourhoods.

The proposal meets the vision of the Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan – Section 2.1 Overall Character of Development and Vision:

- The Woodbridge Centre has a distinct character within the larger Woodbridge context in that it is defined by its heritage features and mixed uses, including commercial, institutional, residential, and open spaces. The Woodbridge Commercial Core is the historical commercial centre of the

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

community and should continue to serve as an important social gathering area and commercial focus. The vision of the Plan is one of an enhanced local centre, with some residential intensification, a strong animated commercial avenue, and a designated public square.

4. Transitions of New Buildings in Relation to Heritage Resources

Policy and Guidelines

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan, Section 6.5:

- The setback requirement to adjacent contributing heritage buildings must be at least half the building height.
- New buildings must transition from the height of adjacent contributing buildings with a minimum 45 degree angular plane, starting from the existing height of the contributing building.
- Consideration may be given to the construction of new buildings, and additions to contributing buildings, joining with contributing buildings only when:
 - new construction is located in the parts of the contributing building that is not visible from the street or from a public space;
 - new construction is setback from the street frontage of the contributing building, to maintain open views and vantage points from the street to the contributing buildings and to support the unique heritage character of the street;
 - the parts of the contributing building that will be enclosed or hidden from view by the new construction, do not contain significant heritage attributes, and the three dimensional form of contributing buildings can be maintained; and,
 - new construction is of a good architectural quality and contributes to the district's heritage character.

Analysis

The proposed development does not meet the 45 degree angular plane guideline for transition to new buildings, although large side yard setbacks have been provided to both heritage resources.

The proposal has been revised from the previous submission to include connections of both heritage buildings to the new construction condominium building. Both connections utilize contemporary materials that will create a clear visual distinction between old and new.

The proposal is to mostly remove the rear of the McLean House to facilitate the new construction. However, the proposal has been revised from the previous submission to include all storeys of the front portion (3 storeys on the left side and 2 storeys on the right due to grading). While the rear portion of the McLean House contains heritage value and is part of the original construction, the front portion contains the most significant heritage attributes. Heritage attributes include, but are not limited to:

- Gambrel (barn) roof
- Cedar shingles on roof sides
- Unique topography where 3-storeys only on left side
- Jack arches on door and window openings
- Classical-inspired front porch
- Symmetrical front elevation

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

- Ornate half circle window with brick masonry arch above 3-paneled window
- Balcony with ornate brackets

5. New Construction

Policy and Guidelines

Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Plan, Sections 6.3.2 and 6.3.3: The guidelines state that new construction “should be ‘of its time’” and should “fit this ‘village’ context while at the same time representing current design philosophy.

- Architectural composition has always had at its root the study of proportion...For new buildings in this heritage district, the design should take into account the proportion of buildings in the immediate context and consider a design with proportional relationships that will make a good fit.

Analysis

The proposal includes a newly constructed residential building that is visually broken up into three parts. The light brick two-storey portion contains massing and articulations that relate to the commercial buildings along Woodbridge Avenue. Woodbridge Avenue was historically a commercial strip and elongated buildings with commercial glazing were typical. The proportion of glazing at ground level along the light-bricked portion of the two storey corner commercial has been increased from the previous submission to better reflect a traditional storefront and to increase transparency. Additionally, the balconies on the seven storey portion of the development have been revised to better blend with the massing.

The publicly-accessible open spaces (POPS) provide side-buffers to the heritage resources and create an improved pedestrian experience along Woodbridge Avenue.

Heritage Impact Assessment Submitted

The applicant has submitted a Heritage Impact Assessment by ERA Architects, revision dated June 9, 2015. The report notes that the proposal “largely conforms with the detailed guidelines”. While not all Guidelines have been met, the HIA contends that the general intent of the Woodbridge HCD Plan has been met. An additional revised version will be required for submittal to address comment from staff regarding the amount of the McLean House to be preserved.

Conservation Plans Submitted

Staff has reviewed Conservation Plans for both the Wallace House and McLean House. The applicant is required to submit a revised Conservation Plan for the McLean House based on revisions of the HIA. Updated Conservation Plans, or addendums, will be required in the future once uses are determined for the proposed heritage resources.

Archaeology

The subject parcel of land lies in an area identified as a being of high archaeological potential in the City’s database of archaeological resources. As such, the owner is advised that the following standard clauses apply:

- i. Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture

**REPORT NO. 6 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON DECEMBER 1, 2015**

and Sport and the City of Vaughan's Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Section shall be notified immediately.

- ii. In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the proponent must immediately cease all construction activities. The proponent shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed new construction as the proposal will contribute to the heritage character and attributes of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District and the vision, principles and objectives of the Woodbridge Centre Secondary Plan.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Existing and proposed sidewalk pedestrian environment
3. Heritage Impact Assessment
4. Proposed Development: Site Plan, Elevations, Landscape Plan

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112

The meeting adjourned at 9:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Christine Radewych, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk