

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**  
**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE**  
**HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE**

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole  
of the City of Vaughan  
on October 5, 2016***

---

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:04 p.m., on July 20, 2016.

Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair  
Frank Alaimo  
Robert Brown  
Lelio DeCicco  
Regional Councillor Michael Di Biase  
David Grossman  
Nick Pacione  
Giacomo Parisi  
Pankaj Sandhu  
Councillor Alan Shefman  
Antoinella Strangis  
Claudio Travierso  
Howard Tuchman  
Henry Xu

Staff present: Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator  
Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator  
Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator

The following items were dealt with:

**1 NEW CONSTRUCTION AND DEMOLITION OF EXISTING DETACHED RESIDENCE  
5 ELIZABETH STREET  
THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT  
WARD 5 - VICINITY OF YONGE STREET AND CENTRE STREET**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommends:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. David Brown, David Small Designs, Hurontario Street, Mississauga, be received.

**Recommendation**

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

1. THAT Council approve the proposed demolition of an existing residence and detached garage and new construction of a single detached house at 5 Elizabeth

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

Street under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:

- a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
- b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and,
- c) the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval of the recommendations for the proposed demolition of an existing residential dwelling and detached garage and proposed new construction of a dwelling with an attached garage at 5 Elizabeth Street in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

**Location, Heritage Status, and Policies**

The property, municipally known as 5 Elizabeth Street, is located on the east side of Elizabeth Street, south of Centre Street, at the edge of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD). The subject property is Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act. The subject property is located within the Residential Area of the Thornhill HCD and is part of a cluster of historical properties within a grid pattern of streets along Centre Street, Old Jane Street, Brooke Street, and Elizabeth Street.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

The existing detached dwelling at 5 Elizabeth Street is an interpretation of a Georgian Revival style home. The Thornhill inventory notes its construction as 1950s but the submitted Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) provides further clarification on this construction date. The existing building is a 2-storey structure clad with white aluminum siding, has multi-pane hung windows with shutters, a hipped roof, and a symmetrical layout with a central doorway.

As demolition is proposed of the existing building, policies in Section 9.5, New Development, of the Thornhill HCD Plan apply. Policies for the Residential Area are included in Section 9.5.2. .

Guidelines include:

- Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.
- Site new house to preserve existing mature trees.
- Design house to reflect one of the local heritage architectural styles.
- New buildings should be designed to preserve and contribute to the scale and pattern of the historic District.

**Existing Building – Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) submitted**

A Heritage Impact Assessment was submitted, as the existing structure relates to one of the heritage styles noted in Section 9.1 of the Thornhill HCD Plan. The heritage consultant determined that a smaller brick clad dwelling was constructed on the property in the 1940s. The original house was completely enclosed by a 1976 renovation, and then further enlarged in 2004.

The Georgian Revival style is a product of the 1976 and 2004 renovations. The HIA writes that “A 1976 Building Permit indicates the 1940s dwelling was fully encased within the north part of a larger and completely remodeled dwelling. The interior was gutted and the exterior remodeled into the pseudo Georgian Revival style dwelling now on site”. The detached garage was also constructed at this time. The original house was built by the Weldricks between 1940 and 1947.

The HIA finds that the existing building does not contain sufficient Cultural Heritage value for conservation and that the proposed new construction will contribute to the District and conforms to the Thornhill HCD Plan.

Staff has reviewed the HIA and has found it acceptable. A copy of the HIA report will be available at the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting.

**Proposed New Construction**

The proposed new construction is a 2 storey detached dwelling in the Georgian style with a central gable. Details include board and batten wood siding, 4over4 hung windows, stone base, central doorway, and centre hall plan. The main focus of the residence is the central portion, accented by a porch, which is flanked on either side by wings that are stepped back. The right wing is the attached garage.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

**Landscape**

The applicant has submitted an arborist report which indicates that 10 trees on the subject property will be preserved while 6 trees on the property are recommended to be removed. The proposal does not impact neighbouring trees or trees on City property. The applicant will be planting 10 trees and providing cash-in-lieu to replace the 6 proposed to be removed.

The generous front yard setback allows for several trees in the front yard to remain. The proposed new dwelling will have a similar front yard setback as the existing dwelling in order to preserve the generous front yard character.

**Analysis**

The existing heritage-style building on the subject property does not contain sufficient cultural heritage value to warrant preservation. Its value is its architectural style and siting within the subject property. These characteristics can be present in a newly constructed dwelling on the subject site.

The proposed detached dwelling conforms to the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan in the following ways and conforms to the policies and guidelines in Section 4.4 and Section 9.5.2:

- Sited with similar front yard and side yard setbacks that are consistent with the village pattern
- Preserves existing mature trees in the front yard that maintain and define the streetscape of Elizabeth Street
- Is designed in an appropriate heritage style and employs appropriate heights and massing that contribute to the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District character

**Variances Proposed**

The applicant will be applying for relief from the City of Vaughan Zoning By-law 1-88 for the following:

Proposal:

1. To permit a maximum lot coverage of 24.58% (22.99% dwelling, 1.59% covered porch).
2. To permit a minimum interior side yard setback of 1.0 metres to the air conditioning unit.
3. To permit a building height of 3.03 metres to the accessory building (shed).
4. To permit a minimum interior side yard setback of 0.53 metres to the accessory building (shed).

By-Law Requirements:

1. A maximum lot coverage of 20% is permitted.
2. A minimum of 1.2 metres is required to the air conditioning unit.
3. A maximum building height of 2.5 metres is required.
4. A minimum interior side yard setback of 0.60 metres is required.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

**Regional Implications**

N/A

**Conclusion**

The Director of Development Planning recommends that Council approve the proposed demolition and new construction as it has been determined to conform to the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**Attachments**

1. Location Map
2. Subject Property and Context Photos
3. Proposed Streetscape Rendering
4. Proposed Site Plan and Elevations

**Report prepared by:**

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112  
Moir Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353  
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**2                    DEMOLITION OF A SINGLE DETACHED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING  
                             AND NEW DEVELOPMENT  
                             10316 KEELE STREET- MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT  
                             DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT  
                             WARD 1 – WEST SIDE OF KEELE STREET AND NORTH OF MCNAUGHTON ROAD**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommends:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated July 20, 2016, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Richard Domes, Gagnon & Law Urban Planners Ltd., Keele Street, Vaughan, be received.

**Recommendation**

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the proposed demolition under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for a single detached dwelling at 10316 Keele Street, subject to the following conditions:

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

- a) that the property owner recycle the rubblestone from the dwelling foundation into a retaining wall or entry feature on the site;
  - b) that the interior woodwork, including the original and/or vintage panelled doors, transom, baseboard, panelled dado or wainscot, moulded door and window trim, and similar components, be examined to determine the potential for salvage and reuse. If it is determined not suitable for reuse in the proposed development, they should first be made available to the City as repair materials for heritage buildings elsewhere in Vaughan;
  - c) the examination to determine potential for salvage or reuse shall be done for the original 4 to 6 inch wide, tongue and groove floorboards.
2. That Heritage Vaughan recommend the approval of the elevation design of the proposed development subject to following conditions:
- a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
  - b) any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
  - c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
  - d) that the proponent commemorate the history of the site by developing signage for within the adjacent McNaughton Park;
  - e) that the proponent submit a Tree Inventory/Assessment, and Tree Preservation/Remediation Plan, prepared by licensed arborist which specifically describes and identifies significant cultural heritage trees and existing specific trees for preservation through detailed inventory, evaluation and analysis of the possible impact the proposed development will have on existing trees on and adjacent to the subject property.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the demolition of a single detached house at 10316 Keele Street and the proposed new development within the Maple Heritage Conservation District.

**Background - Analysis**

The subject property is known municipally as 10316 Keele Street. It is part of the North Gateway to the Maple Heritage Conservation District (see Maple Heritage Conservation District Study, Volume 2), located just before the intersection at McNaughton, marked by a treeline and heritage buildings on the west and is bordered by a stormwater pond to the north.

The Maple HCD is divided into distinct areas and the subject property falls within a "Residential Village" area. As such, those policies within the Guidelines will apply.

The existing built heritage house on the property is thought to be have been built in the 1870's and is therefore one of the older properties in The Village of Maple. The rural nature of the property and its location is the "start of the downslope to the main crossroads creates a sense of entry to the district". (Section 5.2 – Volume 2 of Maple Heritage Conservation District Study)

The existing landscape has a rural character with mature trees on an undulating terrain is bordered on the north side of the property by a swale and stormwater pond that further contributes to the rural feel of the property. The house is located near the Keele Street frontage on a small hill which is supported by a stone retaining wall. The stone wall is a recent construction, possibly installed in the 1990's.

As demolition is proposed of the existing building, policies in Section 4, regarding the demolition and salvage of heritage properties should be considered.

The new development should be considered under the Policies of Section 4, including:

*4.4.1 Design Approach*

- a) *The design of new buildings will be products of their own time, but should reflect one of the historic architectural styles traditionally found in the District.*
- b) *New residential buildings will complement the immediate physical context and streetscape by: being generally the same height, width, and orientation of adjacent buildings; being of similar setback; being of like materials and colours; and using similarly proportioned windows, doors, and roof shapes.*

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

- c) *New residential building construction will respect natural landforms, drainage, and existing mature vegetation.*
- d) *Larger new residential buildings will have varied massing, to reflect the varied scale of built environment of the historical village.*
- e) *Historically appropriate façade heights for residential buildings has been 1 - 1/2 or 2 storeys. The façade height of new residential buildings should be consistent with the façade height of existing buildings. Differences in façade heights between buildings on adjacent properties within the district should be no more than 1 storey. In all instances the height of new buildings shall conform to the provisions of the City's Zoning By-law New Development, of the Maple HCD Plan apply. Policies for the Residential Area are included in Section 9.5.2.*

Section 9 Guidelines include:

- Site new houses to provide setbacks and frontages that are consistent with the variety of the village pattern.
- Site new house to preserve existing mature trees.
- Design house to reflect one of the local heritage architectural styles.
- New buildings should be designed to preserve and contribute to the scale and pattern of the historic District.

The existing proponent has submitted a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (CHIA), submitted on June 20, 2016. The CHIA provided a detailed history of the property which dates to the early 19<sup>th</sup> century of settlement of Vaughan Township and is associated with the McQuarrie and McNaughton families, to its more recent history as a rental property.

The existing Georgian Revival style dwelling on the property is in a state of physical deterioration so advanced that it is not reasonable to retain the structure, although several elements of it may be salvaged for potential use. A full review of the state of the property is included in the attached CHIA, as well as identification of possible salvage features.

Regarding the impact to the streetscape, the CHIA argues that the area of the subject property has already evolved from an agricultural landscape to one of the new and large scale residential, commercial and light industrial built form and use. It argues that there is a minimal perception of this area being the prelude to the Heritage Conservation District due to this evolution.

Cultural Heritage staff has accepted this Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment and has found that it meets the City of Vaughan Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment Terms of Reference. A copy of it is attached to this report.

Proposed New Development

The proponent is proposing a development of 4 townhouse blocks fronting on to a common element Condominium Road and Keele Street with a total of 19 units built in a Second Empire style. Two 3 unit townhouse blocks face onto Keele Street with a height of 8.477 metres from finished grade which integrates into the existing scale of the Maple streetscape. Behind the townhouse blocks which face onto Keele Street, are two townhouse blocks with 6 and 7 units, also built in the Second Empire style. These properties are 3 stories, with a rooftop terrace and a total height of 11 metres.



**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

The development is set back a minimum 4.5 metres from the proposed Keele Street road widening boundary, which ensures an appropriate streetscape setback in the Heritage Conservation District should York Region move forward with widening this section of Keele Street. This will allow the development to retain some of the village character.

The proposed development will also be utilizing salvage mitigation from the existing structure by recycling rubblestone from the foundation into the entry feature and salvaging interior woodwork and floorboards for possible reuse. The proponent will be responsible for historical commemoration of the farmstead in nearby McNaughton Park, in consultation with staff. McNaughton Park already commemorates one family by its name and the plaque will be able to commemorate both founding families.

#### Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on **July 5, 2016** and must be deliberated upon by Council by **October 4, 2016** to meet the 90 day timeline.

#### Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

#### Regional Implications

N/A

#### Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the proposed application and determines that the proposed new development at 10316 Keele Street is consistent with the Maple Conservation District Plan. Should the Committee concur, the recommendations in this report may be adjusted.

#### Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Current Condition
3. Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment
4.
  - a) Site Plan
  - b) Elevations - North, East, West, South
  - c) Colour Elevations of Block 3
  - d) Colour Elevations of Block 4
  - e) Type A - Floor Plans and Sections
  - f) Type B - Floor Plans and Sections
  - g) Type C and E - Floor Plans
  - h) Type C and E - Sections
  - i) Type D and F - Floor Plans
  - j) Type D and F - Sections
  - k) Landscape Plan
  - l) Coloured Landscape Plan
  - m) Landscape Details
5. Renderings
  - a) View from Keele Street

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON OCTOBER 5, 2016**

---

6.       b)   Block 4 - West Face (Facing Keele Street)  
          Proposed Materials

**Report prepared by:**

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115  
Moir Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353  
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext.8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

---

The meeting adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator