

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, Report No. 6, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on February 21, 2018.

11 ALTERATION TO AN EXISTING BUILDING AND THE DEMOLITION OF OUTBUILDINGS 872 NASHVILLE ROAD, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT WARD 1 – VICINITY OF HUNTINGTON ROAD AND NASHVILLE ROAD

The Committee of the Whole recommends approval of the recommendation contained in the following report of the City Clerk dated February 6, 2018:

Recommendation

The City Clerk, on behalf of the Heritage Vaughan Committee, forwards the following recommendation from its meeting of January 24, 2018 (Item 1, Report No. 1) for Council's consideration:

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

1. That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated January 24, 2018, be approved.

Report of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated January 24, 2018

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend approval to Council for the proposed demolition of the three outbuildings located at 872 Nashville Road under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
2. THAT Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed alterations to 872 Nashville Road under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
3. THAT the above recommendations are subject to the following conditions:

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 2

- a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- b) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- c) That the applicant submit a conservation plan to restore the north elevation on completion of the removal of the kitchen tail, to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.
- d) That Heritage Vaughan Committee approval or recommended approval to Council does not constitute specific support for any development application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner, as it relates to the subject application.

Purpose

- i) Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed alterations to the existing vernacular Victorian house; and
- ii) A Heritage Vaughan recommendation for consideration by Council regarding the demolition of three outbuildings in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 3

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on December 15, 2017. The proposal for the proposed alterations must be deliberated upon by Heritage Vaughan by March 15, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline. The proposal for demolition must be deliberated upon by Council by March 15, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background

The subject property is known municipally as 872 Nashville Road, and is located on the north side of Nashville Road, west of the rail line, as shown on Attachment #1. The subject property contains a two-storey brick Victorian house, built circa 1890, with an enclosed front verandah and a rear kitchen tail. The subject property contains three outbuildings, with a mix of rooflines, materials and massing.

Property History

The Heritage Impact Assessment and Ownership Chronology (Attachment #3), identified that the brick house was built by John Train for his son Robert James Train and his wife Ester (Card). The property was previously owned by the Somerville family, local farmers that had originated from Scotland, with James Somerville arriving in Vaughan Township in 1836.

Proposed Alterations

The applicant is proposing the following work to be undertaken, in accordance with the submitted Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA):

- 1) Demolition of the following three outbuildings:
 - a. One-storey frame outbuilding (approximately 29 m² in size)
 - b. One- to two-storey barn (approximately 67 m² in size)
 - c. One-storey steel shed (approximately 50 m² in size)
- 2) Conservation of the Victorian brick house, including:
 - a. Remove the existing altered kitchen tail;
 - b. Replace all roofing, including main house, verandah, and bay window, including the flat roof portions;

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 4

- c. Remove enclosure of the verandah, restoring its original appearance. It appears that all but one of the original columns are in place, and the replacement column will replicate the originals;
- d. Renew or repair all flashings and rainware;
- e. Remove paint from the existing masonry within the enclosed verandah using non-abrasive methods. Work to be performed by a qualified restoration contractor;
- f. Clean all masonry using gentlest methods—detergent and water with hand brushing;
- g. Replace any damaged masonry units using salvaged material from the tail;
- h. Repoint masonry where joints are eroded, using historic lime mortar to match original;
- i. Insulate the roof, and provide ventilation as required;
- j. Replace the existing windows with modern wood-framed thermal units matching original design, and
- k. Restore the masonry on the north elevation, where the tail is to be removed. Until the removal, it's not possible to specify the extent of the work. A plan for this work will be provided by the applicant once the area is visible. Historic masonry units from the tail should be kept on site for re-use in this work.

Analysis

The following is an examination of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines relevant to the proposal to remove the existing outbuildings and alter the existing Victorian dwelling.

5.2.2 Heritage Buildings

“To retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance in the District.”

- The property (872 Nashville Road) is considered to be a contributing property to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District; however, the contributing heritage resource applies to the brick residence and not the outbuildings. The HIA reviewed the potential cultural heritage value of the three outbuildings and found that these buildings do not contain any heritage

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 5

value that would warrant retention. The brick residence at 872 Nashville Road will be retained and conserved.

“To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.”

- The HIA identifies that the enclosed verandah appears to have been originally open with the post brackets visible on the exterior. This open verandah will be brought back to its original configuration. The tail to be removed was originally a kitchen tail that has since been altered with subsequent additions. There is only one remaining arched window of the dwelling and the other windows have been altered to larger square configurations. The tail has been altered to such an extent that removal of this feature can be supported by Cultural heritage staff.

“To encourage the corrections of unsympathetic alterations made over the years to heritage buildings.”

- The unsympathetic closed verandah and altered kitchen tail addition will be corrected and removed, respectively.

“To encourage restoration of heritage buildings based on historical, archival, and pictorial evidence.”

- The applicant has provided an aerial photo of the house (predating 1942) that shows the open verandah and the smaller, original kitchen-tail. Additionally, the proposed restoration is based on neighbouring examples and architectural evidence visible through the differing materials of the kitchen tail and the visible post brackets on the closed verandah.

Section 6.2 Policies for Heritage Buildings

“The original construction and detail on heritage buildings should be retained and repaired whenever possible.”

- The verandah will be repaired to what appears to be its original open configuration. The later kitchen tail addition will be removed as it not longer represents its original configuration due to significant alterations.

“Alterations to heritage buildings should include removal of later unsympathetic work and restoration of original features and detail.”

- The later unsympathetic, heavily-altered kitchen tail will be removed and the north elevation masonry will be restored. It is noted that the plan for this work cannot be provided until such time the kitchen tail is removed.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 6

“Work on heritage buildings should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.3”

- The following is an analysis of the consistency of the proposal with Section 9.3 of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Section 9.3.4 Building Maintenance – Masonry

“Clean masonry using detergents and a stiff natural bristle brush. If this doesn’t produce satisfactory cleaning, use only professional water-borne chemical agents for further cleaning.”

- All masonry will be cleaned using the *“gentlest methods – detergent and water with hand brushing”*, as identified in the Conservation Plan.

“Do not use sand-blasting or high pressure water for masonry cleaning.”

- As per the above note, high pressure water will not be used for masonry cleaning.

Section 9.3.5.1 Brickwork

“Repair structural damage before repointing.”

- Repointing of masonry will only occur where joints are eroded.

“Use matching bricks for repairs, either salvaged old material, or the best modern match in size and colour.”

- Damaged masonry units will be replaced using salvaged material from the tail.

“Use lime mortar for repairs and repointing to historic brick. Match the original in formulation, with a cement content no greater than one-twelfth of the dry volume of the mix; the cement must be white portland cement and not grey.”

- The Conservation Plan provides for the use of *“historic lime mortar to match original”* for the repointing of masonry joints where eroded.

Section 9.3.5.3 Roofing

“In re-roofing heritage buildings, care should be taken to choose a material that relates to the original roofing. If asphalt shingles are selected, colours should be black or a dark grey, like slate or weathered cedar.”

- The current roofing is black asphalt, and the proposed new roofing will match the existing material.

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 7

Section 9.3.5.6 Windows

“Repair material should be of the same species and profile as the originals. If replacement is necessary, wood should normally be used, and window design should match the original in type, glazing pattern, and detail.”

- The existing windows are to be replaced with modern wood-framed thermal units to match the original design.

Section 9.3.6 Renovations

“When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, it should be part of the renovation to remove later work that conceals the original design, or is unsympathetic to it. Research, as described in Section 9.3.2, should be undertaken, and the design of new work should restore the principal architectural features of the original building.”

- Based on the research undertaken in the HIA, it has been found through historic aerial photography and the visible post brackets on the exterior of the closed in verandah that the closed-in verandah was once open and that the original kitchen tail has since been altered significantly. The verandah will be restored to an open design. The tail addition will be removed and the north wall of the dwelling restored.

“Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminum siding, use wood siding or board and batten.”

- All materials being proposed for the restoration will be authentic including the asphalt shingles to match the original condition. The use of salvaged masonry from the removal of the kitchen tail. The windows will be replaced with thermal windows to match the appearance of the existing 2 over 2 double hung windows.

“Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.”

- The roofing will be replaced and all flashings and rainware will be repaired or replaced if necessary.

“Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffit that conceal original architectural detail.”

- The original details of the open porch and north elevation will be restored.

Section 9.9.2 The Village Forests – Character

“Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.”

- The proposed alterations to the existing Victorian house and the demolition of

CITY OF VAUGHAN

EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 21, 2018

Item 11, CW Report No. 6 – Page 8

the kitchen tail and outbuildings will not require the removal of any of the existing trees, as confirmed by the submitted Arborist Report.

Conclusion

Based on the above analysis, the proposed demolition of the outbuildings and the alterations to the existing Victorian house on 872 Nashville Road are in conformity with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application and is satisfied that the proposed alterations to the Victorian building and demolition of the outbuildings at 872 Nashville Road are consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed demolitions and alterations under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the conditions in this report.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Map and Site Photos
3. Heritage Impact Statement – 872 Nashville Road
4. Architectural Drawing Set
5. Survey of Outbuildings to be demolished
6. Tree Inventory Plan

Report prepared by:

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)