

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on September 19, 2017***

The following item was dealt with:

**1 ADDITION AND ALTERATIONS
DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
19 CENTRE STREET (ROBERT SHUTER HOUSE), THORNHILL HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT
WARD 5 - VICINITY OF YONGE STREET AND CENTRE STREET**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated June 21, 2017, was approved as shown in Attachment 5, titled "Proposed Elevations";
- 2) That City forestry staff meet with the architect at the subject site to review the tree inventory with the perspective of retaining the trees on the property; and
- 3) That the deputation of Ken Trevelyan, Trevelyan Architect Inc., representing the applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 19, 2017**

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend to Council that a Heritage Permit be issued for the proposed alterations to the detached dwelling located on the address municipally known as 19 Centre Street (Robert Shuter House) including: the removal of the existing 1-storey wood and glass frame addition; a proposed 2-storey rear addition; the conversion of an existing doorway into a window; the installation of an accessibility ramp; and a new parking lot, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) The Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division shall approve the final building material specifications for the proposed addition and accessibility ramp;
 - b) That the Owner provide a complete set of detailed photo documentation of all elements proposed for removal;
 - c) It is understood that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application;
 - d) As the subject property has been identified as having archaeological potential, the following standard clauses shall apply:
 - i) *Should archaeological resources be found on the property during construction activities, all work must cease and both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, and the City of Vaughan's Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division in the Development Planning Department shall be notified immediately;*
 - ii) *In the event that human remains are encountered during construction activities, the Owner must immediately cease all construction activities. The Owner shall contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of the Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of Consumer and Business Services; and*
 - e) Any significant changes to the proposal be submitted to the Heritage Vaughan Committee for consideration and approval.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 19, 2017**

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek approval for Heritage Permit from the Heritage Vaughan Committee for the proposed alterations to the dwelling located at the address municipally known as 19 Centre Street (Robert Shuter House) including: the removal of the existing 1-storey wood and glass frame addition; a proposed 2-storey rear addition; the conversion of an existing doorway into a window; the installation of an accessibility ramp; and a new parking lot.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on June 16, 2017, and must be deliberated upon by September 14, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background - Analysis and Options

Background and Description

The subject property, known municipally as 19 Centre Street is located on the south side of Centre Street as shown in Attachment #1, and is located in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD). The existing dwelling on the site is known as the Robert Shuter House and is a contributing property within the Thornhill HCD, as shown in Attachment #2.

Thought to be originally built circa 1825, the Robert Shuter House is a three bay symmetrical Neo-classical house with chimneys on each side of the building. The central entry has sidelights and transom windows. There are two additions to the original house. The first is a 2-storey addition at the rear and to the west of the central bay of the house. The second addition is a smaller one-storey frame addition at the rear property. Between 1925 and 1969, the original house and the 2-storey addition were re-clad in stucco. Pictures of the existing house and additions are included in Attachment #3. The property also contains several mature trees which are identified in the original Thornhill HCD Inventory excerpt. There was previously a barn on the site, however an emergency Heritage Permit was issued in 2015 (HP.2015.018) to permit the demolition of the barn as it was identified as being unstable, partially collapsed and a significant public danger.

The Robert Shuter House has undergone several historic alterations through its 180 year history. According to the 1979 Vaughan Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (LACAC) property report, it was initially built as a 1 ½-storey house with wooden siding. The full second storey was likely added sometime in the 1860's. It is thought that the 2-storey rear extension was also added at this time, as it was in existence when the house was purchased by Doctor McConnell in 1871. As the second storey and the 2-storey addition now comprise the unified form and massing of the structure, it is therefore considered that the existing 2-storey addition is a contributing element of the built heritage of 19 Centre Street.

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 19, 2017**

Current Proposal

The subject Heritage Permit application is related to current Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Development Files Z.16.029 and DA.15.89 to rezone the subject property from R1V Old Village Residential to a Commercial Zone and to permit alterations to the site and the existing dwelling to be used as an office for two professionals. As part of the proposed site alterations, the Owner is proposing to: replace the existing 1-storey frame addition with a 2-storey addition; the conversion of a side door located on the west elevation into a window; the addition of an accessible ramp to the front porch; and, a new parking lot, as shown on Attachments #4 and #5.

Removal of 1-Storey Wood and Glass Frame Addition

It is uncertain when the existing one-storey shed and rear frame addition was built and whether it may have replaced an earlier structure. However, it was in place by 1979 as shown in Attachment #3. The addition is a combination of a glass enclosed porch that is attached to a shed-like structure. There is only a minimal reference to this addition in the 1979 Vaughan LACAC report and none in the 2007 Thornhill HCD Inventory. Consequently, it may be surmised that the existing 1-storey addition is a late and non-contributing element of the property. Therefore, Cultural Heritage staff have no concerns with its proposed removal.

Proposed 2-Storey Addition

The proposed 2-storey board and batten addition, as shown in Attachment #5, is in scale with the existing addition and painted to match the existing stucco. The design of the addition follows the policies of Section 4.2.2 of the Thornhill HCD Plan, which states that new additions should be compatible, subordinate and distinguishable from the heritage resource. The proposed addition meets this policy and the guidelines in Section 9.3.7 of the Thornhill HCD Plan and Guidelines as the addition will be constructed using board and batten siding, distinguishing it from the contributing heritage resources, will be compatible in scale, and is located to the back of the main dwelling. Where the addition protrudes on either side of the main structure, it is well set back from the street frontage of the property and is significantly lower in height than the contributing heritage structure. The portion of the addition that is visible from the street on the west side will be similar to the existing wood frame addition in height. The portion of the addition that is visible on the east side of the dwelling will be mitigated by its lower height, setback, and is screened by existing trees.

New Accessibility Ramp

The proposed accessibility ramp is required to meet OADA requirements and will be located along the west elevation and is designed so it will not impact the existing stucco cladding. The ramp will allow users to access the building at the front door. The Thornhill HCD Plan and Inventory excerpt (Attachment #2), illustrates that the current Doric columns are not original and replaced the original 6 pillars between 1969 and 1979. The neo-classical pediment however, is confirmed in the 1929 and 1969 photos and does appear to have been retained despite other changes to the front entrance. This element will not be altered in the redevelopment.

Conversion of Doorway into a Window

The Owner is proposing to replace a door on the west elevation with a window to match the existing windows. Although this door is thought to have been installed in the 1870's as the entrance to the Doctor MacConnell's waiting room, there is minimal documentation

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 19, 2017**

related to this entrance and it is difficult to determine how much of the original has been retained. The concrete steps are likely not original, but the existing dentillated and molded decorative entablature above the door has been retained. However, the door is not specifically identified among the contributing elements of the property in the Thornhill HCD Inventory, and is not visible from the street. Therefore, Cultural Heritage staff recommends that if the door cannot be retained, that the appropriate mitigation is to document the existing doorway from both the interior and the exterior prior to its removal.

Cultural Heritage Landscape

The proposed site plan includes the installation of parking spaces for staff and patients, which would result in the removal of several trees on the site to accommodate the change. The Owner has submitted an Arborist Report, Tree Preservation Plan and Landscape Plan as shown in Attachment #6. Initially, the Arborist Report identified a number of trees that would be removed along the street to accommodate the entrance to the parking area. However, working with Cultural Heritage and Development Planning staff, the Owner submitted a Landscape Plan and Tree Protection Plant that aims to conserve four trees along the streetscape. As a key measure to preserve the trees along Centre Street, the Owner will be applying to the Committee of Adjustment to create one shared driveway with the adjacent located on the address known municipally as 33 Centre Street. This will minimize the loss of trees along the street.

This application meets the City's Delegation By-law criteria and therefore, does not need to be advanced to Vaughan Council for deliberation unless the Committee advises against the approval of the proposed changes.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

The application supports the following priorities set forth in the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018):

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The proposed alterations to the property at 19 Centre Street are consistent with the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department recommends that the Heritage Vaughan Committee adopt the recommendation in this report to issue a Heritage Permit to permit the proposed addition, accessibility ramp and new window to the Robert Shuter House and new parking spaces on the property under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Thornhill HCD Inventory (Excerpt)
3. Subject Property Photos
 - a) Pictures of 1 ½ Rear Storey
 - b) Pictures of Front Porch & Side Door
4. Proposed Site Plan

**REPORT NO. 5 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 19, 2017**

5. Proposed Elevations
6.
 - a) Arborist Report
 - b) Tree Protection Plan
 - c) Landscape Plan
7. Rendering of Proposed Changes

Report prepared by:

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 7:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Christine Radewych, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator