

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 6 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

*For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on September 4, 2012*

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:00 p.m., on June 20, 2012.

Present: John Mifsud, Chair
Robert Stitt, Vice-Chair
Robert M. Brown
Roger Dickinson
Rosario Fava
Councillor Marilyn Iafrate
Tony Marziliano
Nick Pacione
Fadia Pahlawan
Christine Radewych
Regional Councillor Deb Schulte
Rajbir Singh
Claudio Traverso

Also Present: Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Angela Palermo, Manager of Cultural Services
Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

**1 10773 HUNTINGTON ROAD – HERITAGE REVIEW OF NEWLY CONSTRUCTED GARAGE
SHED AND COVERED PORCH – WARD 1**

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the report of Cultural Services, dated June 20, 2012, be approved, subject to the following:
 1. That the design of the garage doors be addressed in consultation with Cultural Services; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Stephen Canjer, agent for the applicant, be received.

Recommendation

Cultural Services staff recommend:

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

1. That Heritage Vaughan consider the information provided in the analysis portion of this report concerning the heritage review of the existing structures that were constructed without City approvals, and;
2. That since Huntington Road, is predominantly rural in character, Cultural Services recommends that Heritage Vaughan approve the shed and covered porch structures as the property has a mid-century style house on it, these two structures are not seen from the streetscape, nor does their setback affect any neighbours within the Heritage District, and;
3. That Heritage Vaughan approve the retention of the prefabricated metal garage structure with the following conditions:
 - a. That the applicant work with Cultural Services to provide appropriate screening of the prefabricated metal garage structure from Huntington Road in the way of or similar to tall evergreen plantings along the front of the property line, and;
 - b. That Heritage Vaughan approve the design for the façade of the garage structure as presented in the drawings dated June 5, 2012, and;
 - c. That the façade, doors and details be constructed of wood or suitable equivalent as reviewed and approved by Cultural Services staff, and;
 - d. The owner and applicant obtain all other necessary City permits.
4. That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available; and,
5. The applicant is to be advised that if the design changes as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To consider the proposed retention of the subject structures as described in the background and analysis portions of this report.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

Background and Analysis

Background

Heritage Status of the property: Designated Part V, part of Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District.

The property contains a mid 20th century bungalow, of a non-heritage style as identified in section 9 of the Heritage District Guidelines.

On October 2011, a heritage permit for a temporary structure was given to the owner in order to allow the erection of a temporary metal structure on the property.

This item was circulated to staff as a Committee of Adjustment application. The application notes the following variances (please refer to attachments):

Proposal:

- 1) 5.58m maximum accessory building height.
- 2) 167.14 sq.m total accessory building area (2 buildings)
- 3) 2.13 m minimum setback to accessory building (shed)

Zoning By-law requirements:

- 1) 4.5m maximum accessory building height.
- 2) 67metre sq. total accessory building area.
- 3) 4.5m maximum interior side yard setback to accessory building (shed)

There are four outstanding stop work orders on file with the Building Standards department. The structures were constructed without a Heritage Permit.

Cultural Services provided the Committee of Adjustment with the following comments dated May 21, 2012 :

Cultural Services has received the request for comments regarding the above noted Committee of Adjustment application and offers the following comments:

1. *The property at 10773 Huntington Road is Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act as part of the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage Conservation District. As such new construction, additions, demolitions and changes to the exterior of buildings and properties within Heritage Districts require approval of a Heritage Permit application in addition to other City permits such as Building Permits or Planning Application approvals. Proposed changes to properties designated within heritage conservation districts must be in keeping with the heritage character of the building, the historical streetscape and must be in conformance with the heritage district plan and design guidelines.*
2. *The proposal falls in the category of applications requiring a Heritage Permit with Heritage Vaughan Committee Review.*
3. *The Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage District Guidelines support new construction that is in keeping with the heritage styles in the area, as identified in the guidelines. The proposed design does not reflect a heritage style as described in the guidelines.*

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

4. *The applicant is advised to contact Cultural Services at their earliest convenience so that staff may have the opportunity to work with the applicant and provide guidance regarding compliance with the heritage district's guidelines. Staff will also provide guidance regarding timelines for submission of material for Heritage Vaughan Committee review.*

As a result of receiving the above comments, the representative of the owner contacted Cultural Services and a site visit meeting was done on May 24, 2012. Please see photos in the attachment section of this report.

On June 5, the applicant forwarded drawings with a proposal, included in the attachment section of this report.

Analysis

At the meeting of May 24, 2012 with the representative of the owner, different ways of addressing the issue were discussed, also reflected in the recommendation of this report.

At the said site meeting, Cultural Services confirmed that the existing main house on the property is a mid-20th century bungalow of a non-heritage style as identified in the Nashville-Kleinburg Heritage District Guidelines.

The representative of the owner expressed that the owner is seeking to rectify the missed approvals for the structures (including the garage structures). Cultural Services finds that if taking the structure down is not being contemplated, the metal structure no longer qualifies as a temporary structure. Therefore a Heritage Permit is required to address the new information.

The Heritage Conservation District Guidelines for the area, in section 9.4 Existing Non-Heritage Buildings, allows for renovations of these buildings to be based on the style of the existing building, as a "Contemporary Alteration" Section 9.4.1.2. The other option is to follow section 9.4.1.1 and do a "Historical Conversion", which would involve renovations to convert the style of the house to a heritage style, as identified in the guidelines.

Cultural Services found that of the three proposed structures, the galvanized metal garage is very visible from Huntington Road. Although it is considerably set back from the street it still impacts the streetscape and it detracts from the heritage character that the district aims to maintain. The structure is approximately 121metres squared in footprint area. Its height is noted at 5.48 metres in the drawings accompanying the Committee of Adjustment application. The area exceeds the permitted accessory building coverage by 54 sq. metres and the permitted height by 1.08 metres.

The other two proposed structures proposed for retention are the red wood clad shed and the covered porch area to the rear of the main house. These two structures are not readily seen from the streetscape nor does their setback affect any neighbours directly to the south, who are within the Heritage District. The coverage of the red clad structure exceeds the allowable for the property in its entirety. The structure is located closer to the North boundary of the property, away from the other neighbours within the Heritage Conservation district and is one level tall (4.04m). The covered porch area has not been identified as a variance.

Cultural Services recommends that the retention of the covered porch structure and the red shed structure does not impact the Heritage District Streetscape.

Cultural Services finds that these are acceptable solutions at this time.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Regional Implications

Conclusion

Report Prepared by

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139
Recreation and Culture Department

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated June 20, 2012, be approved.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

Recommendation

Cultural Services staff recommend:

4. That Heritage Vaughan consider the information provided in the attached Built Heritage Evaluation for the existing structures at 9570 Keele Street, together with the background and analysis portions of this report, and;
5. That Heritage Vaughan consider the demolition of the structures at the subject property and that if it is approved, that the following conditions be included with the approval:
 - a. That the demolition clearance be effective from the date of the Building Permit approval, and;
 - b. That the owner and applicant work together with Cultural Services in the design of a replacement structure and they return for approval of a Heritage Permit for the same at a later Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting, and;
 - c. That for any period of time that the structures are vacant or the lot is vacant awaiting new construction, that it is maintained in compliance with the City Property Standards by-law, including that the structure be secured from unwanted entry, and the lot be maintained clean of debris, garbage and grass be cut, and;
 - d. That the proposed new construction is in accordance with the Heritage District Guidelines.
5. The applicant is to be advised that if there are any changes as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, a new submittal for review for the Heritage Vaughan Committee may be required and any previous approval granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To consider the background and analysis portions of this report in order to review the request for demolition for the subject property.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

Background and Analysis

Background

Heritage Status of the property: Designated Part V, part of Maple Village Heritage Conservation District.

The property contains a mid 20th century, two storey structure of a non-heritage style as identified in section 9 of the Heritage District Guidelines. Please also refer to the attached Built Heritage Evaluation of the building.

The applicant is proposing the demolition of the structure, as it is vacant and boarded. The applicant has expressed concern for the safety of the building since animals have gone inside as well as people have been able to enter through the basement back window. The property standards by-law would apply in this case, as it provides the standards for vacant properties in order to ensure their safety.

The applicant has been working with the owner directly to the south, who has bought the property and has plans to develop the two properties in the future. The house to the south at 9560 Keele Street is currently occupied. The applicant has informed Cultural Services that there are no formal development applications that have been submitted to the City, and the design has not been developed to reflect a final design solution yet.

Analysis

The property scored 30 points out of 100 in the Built Heritage Evaluation done by Cultural Services staff. This resulted in the subject property to be identified as having "little or no significance" in terms of built heritage.

It is encouraged to submit a proposal for replacement construction for consideration accompanying a request for demolition of a structure within a Heritage Conservation District. Approval for demolition in these cases, if granted by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, is usually conditional upon review and approval of a replacement design.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL:
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

Report Prepared by

Cecilia Nin Hernandez
Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139
Recreation and Culture Department

3

FIRES IN HERITAGE BUILDINGS

Heritage Vaughan recommends to Council:

- 1) That Heritage Vaughan requests Cultural Services staff to review steps required to:
 1. Identify best practices to better protect heritage structures from fire or demolition by neglect; and
 2. Make reconstruction of a heritage property obligatory in the event that the building is damaged or destroyed; and
- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated June 20, 2012, be received.

Recommendation

Cultural Services staff recommend:

1. That the information in this report be received.

(This item has been placed on the agenda at the request of a committee member.)

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

- To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

Purpose

To receive the information in this report.

Background and Analysis

Background

In the last year there have been three vacant houses lost to fire: The Richard Agar House, 10395 Huntington Road, 3930 Major Mackenzie Drive and 3180 Teston Road.

The City's property Standards by-law has provisions for the care of vacant properties and the maintenance of heritage attributes for heritage properties. This by-law can be downloaded from the City's webpage, under "most requested by-laws" or following the link below:

http://www.vaughan.ca/vaughan/forms_docs/bylaws.cfm

The care of vacant properties is an issue that all municipalities experience. Please see attached article by Michael Seaman, Director of Planning at the Town of Grimsby, Ontario.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- **STRATEGIC GOAL:**
Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- **STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:**
Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendation section of this report.

Report Prepared by

Cecilia Nin Hernandez
Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo
Manager of Cultural Services, ext. 8139
Recreation and Culture Department

**REPORT NO. 6 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

4

UPDATE - THE FINE SCHEDULE

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

That Cultural Services staff provided an update on the fine schedule.

5

**UPDATE - DEVELOPMENT AT WOODBRIDGE AVENUE
AND CLARENCE STREET**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

That Cultural Services staff provided an update on the development at the northwest corner of Woodbridge Avenue and Clarence Street.

6

UPDATE - 150 BROOKE STREET

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

That Cultural Services staff provided an update on the heritage permit application.

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

John Mifsud, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk