CITY OF VAUGHAN

REPORT NO. 4 OF THE

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

For consideration by the Committee of the Whole of the City of Vaughan on September 7, 2016

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:01 p.m., on June 15, 2016.

- Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair Christine Radewych, Vice-Chair Frank Alaimo **Robert Brown** Sandra Colica Lelio DeCicco David Grossman Regional Councillor Michael Di Biase Nick Pacione Giacomo Parisi Pankaj Sandhu Councillor Alan Shefman Antoinella Strangis Claudio Travierso Howard Tuchman Henry Xu
- Staff present: Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator

The following items were dealt with:

1

BUILDING ADDITION TO 21 CHELTENHAM AVENUE WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT WARD 2 - VICINITY OF KIPLING AVENUE AND REGIONAL ROAD 7

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the proposed addition and deck to 21 Cheltenham Avenue was approved in accordance with the revised site plan and renderings presented by the applicant;
- 2) That the report of the Director of Development Planning, dated June 15, 2016, was received; and
- 3) That the deputation of Mr. Christopher Xavier, Greater Toronto Builders, Yonge Street, Toronto, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

- 1. THAT Council approve the proposed addition and deck to a single detached house at 21 Cheltenham Avenue under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
 - b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for the Heritage Vaughan Committee to consider the proposed addition and deck to an existing bungalow located at 21 Cheltenham Avenue, a Part V Designated property located in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Location and Heritage Status

The property municipally known as 21 Cheltenham is located on the south side of Cheltenham Avenue, a street that intersects Kipling Avenue in the southern end of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District (HCD). The subject property is Designated Part V but it is noted as "non-contributing". The buildings on the property include a bungalow and detached garage constructed circa 1950.

Kipling Avenue Character Area

The subject property falls within the Kipling Avenue Character Area of the Woodbridge HCD and contains an existing non-contributing building. Therefore, the applicable guidelines within the sections for the Kipling Avenue Character Area (6.1.2) and Approach to Non-Contributing Buildings (6.2.5) of the District Plan apply.

Proposed Addition

The proposal includes the retention of the existing bungalow with a one-storey addition and deck at the rear of the property in the same architectural style. The proposed onestorey addition will be lower than the existing front portion of the house and will be only slightly visible from the street. The addition will be clad in a similar siding material to match the existing portion and will have a shed roof sloping back.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

• Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and deck to the existing bungalow as it complies with the policies and guidelines within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.

Attachments

- 1. Location Map
- 2. Subject Property and Context Photos
- 3. Proposed Site Plan and Elevations
- 4. 3D Rendering

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112 Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2

PROPOSED ADDITION TO THE REGISTER OF PROPERTY OF CULTURAL HERTAGE VALUE <u>AII WARDS – CITY WIDE</u>

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated June 15, 2016, was approved; and
- 2) That Communication C1, from Mr. Don Given, Malone Given Parsons Ltd., Renfrew Drive, Markham, dated June 15, 2016, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

THAT Council approve the proposed additions to the Heritage Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value as per Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act.*

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goal and objective within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All current property owners of the properties noted in this report have been notified via mail and have been invited to the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting where this proposal will be presented.

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan Committee to consider the proposed additions to the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value as per Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Background - Analysis and Options

Background

Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act enables municipalities to create a Heritage Register of properties of "cultural heritage value or interest". The current City of Vaughan Register was established and approved by Council on June 27, 2005. The Register has

not been updated since that date. The Register also includes properties that are individually Designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value

Ontario Regulation 9/06 defines what constitutes "cultural heritage value or interest". The complete version of this regulation can be viewed at www.ontario.ca. Properties are deemed to have cultural heritage value if they possess one or more of the following:

- 1. Design Value or Physical Value
- 2. Historical or Associative Value
- 3. Contextual Value

All of the properties recommended for inclusion on the Register have been evaluated and it is determined that they possess at least one of the three criteria for cultural heritage value or interest.

City of Vaughan Policies

Section 6.1.2.1 in Vaughan Official Plan (VOP) 2010 states that the City shall maintain a Register of Cultural Heritage Resources.

Sections 6.1.2.3 and 6.1.2.4 in VOP 2010 require that heritage resources that are not yet Listed on the Register be evaluated and included on the Register when deemed to have cultural heritage value and that "identification of cultural heritage resources is an on-going process". Additions to the register may be made through evaluations that arise from development activities.

Benefits

Currently, the City of Vaughan maintains a heritage inventory of approximately 1200 properties that includes all designated and registered properties as well as properties that are only "of interest". The Official Plan contains policies that pertain to these properties "of interest" and these properties are typically evaluated through submitted development applications. These properties "of interest" do not benefit from any protection under the Ontario Heritage Act. For instance, there is no mechanism to stop or slow down a demolition application for a property of interest.

Properties Listed on the Register, however, are protected under the *Ontario Heritage Act* because demolition proposals require a decision by Council. Once a proposal under the *Ontario Heritage Act* is submitted for demolition to the City, Council must render a decision within 60 days. It should be noted that the Act specifically states that a property cannot be added to the Register after a demolition application has been submitted. This is to encourage proactive listing and a transparent process.

Properties proposed to be Listed on the Register

All of the following properties proposed to be Listed on the Register are already included on the inventory as properties "of interest", and are being recommended by Cultural Heritage staff within the Vaughan Development Planning Department to be added to the Heritage Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value as per Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act, as they all contribute as follows:

1) <u>46 Monsheen Drive</u> (Attachment #1)

Design Value or Physical Value - Designed by noted Canadian architect Jerome Markson and nicknamed "the television house", this property is a Canadian regional variant of the 1950s modernist style. The building uses existing topography and landscaping to create a smooth transition between house and environment and utilizes earth-tone materials.

Historical or Associative Value – This property is part of the post-World War II inventory of custom designed homes in the modernist style that were constructed in Vaughan. It is also has associative value due through its association with its designer Jerome Markson.

Contextual Value - The subject property is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the mid-Century modernist Seneca Heights development, envisioned and realized by builder and land developer Jack Grant in the early 1950s, a time of post-war growth for the Woodbridge Community. Furthermore, the house and property is physically and visually linked to its location on the Humber River ravine.

2) <u>82 Monsheen Drive</u> (Attachment #2)

Design Value or Physical Value - This property is a Canadian regional variant of the 1950s modern style, built in 1958, and is associated with the work of Stanley Bennett Barclay. Barclay was a partner in practice of Eric Arthur in their firm Fleury, Arthur, Barclay and Stern (1949-1965). The architectural design of the house represents a fluid relationship between interior, exterior and interior spaces, and an uncluttered flow of interior spaces, where clarity of structural elements and non-load-bearing partitions is discerned.

Historical or Associative Value – This property is part of the post-World War II inventory of custom designed homes in the modernist style that were constructed in Vaughan.

Contextual Value - The subject property is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the mid-Century modernist Seneca Heights development, envisioned and realized by builder and land developer Jack Grant in the early 1950s, a time of post-war growth for the Woodbridge Community. Furthermore, the house and property is physically and visually linked to its location on the Humber River ravine.

3) <u>2720 King-Vaughan Road</u> (Attachment #3)

Design Value or Physical Value - This property is an excellent example of an 1890s Ontario Farmhouse but with wider proportions than other Vaughan examples. It is constructed of brick with a side-gable roof and 2 over 2 and 1 over 1 hung windows with a central front gable and hipped-roof verandah.

Historical or Associative Value - It is known as the McBride House, due to its longstanding association with the McBride family, an early settler family of Vaughan and King Township. David McBride is listed as the owner in the 1860 Tremaine Map.

Contextual Value - The property also contains several farm buildings from different periods creating a significant context as a rural cultural heritage landscape.

4) <u>8811 Huntington Road</u> (Attachment #4)

Design Value or Physical Value - The building associated with this property is known as the Henry Burton House and was constructed in 1832 in the Georgian Cottage style. The building is a one and a half storey (likely log construction) building with a one storey rear

tail with horizontal wood siding and board and batten siding on a rubble stone foundation. This property was evaluated by staff and received a grade of 74/100. According to the Built Heritage Evaluation, which is based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 (Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest) but includes additional information, properties ranging from 60-79 are "Significant" while properties 80-100 are deemed as "Very Significant" (Attachment #4).

Historical or Associative Value – Henry Burton was a stone mason and one of the original European settlers in this area Vaughan. Burton came from Hawick, Roxburghshire, Scotland, in 1830.

Contextual Value – The house is a typical farmhouse type property with a series of buildings on a large rural lot setback far from the main road.

5) <u>10980 Jane Street</u> (Attachment #5)

Design Value or Physical Value - The subject property is an archetypical example of the Ontario Farmhouse, also referred to as Ontario Gothic, architectural style. This one and a half storey side gable brick building with a front facing dormer is a highly popular architectural style in farm properties in Vaughan and Ontario. The building is a wood-frame construction with a brick veneer laid out in stretcher bond on a coursed rubble stone foundation. The building contains 2/2 hung windows with detailed frames on both the windows and doors. On the exterior, the windows are detailed with substantial arches. The front porch is an Edwardian style porch, so this was likely a later construction or replacement in the 1920s.

This property was evaluated by Cultural Heritage staff and it received a grade of 76/100. According to the Built Heritage Evaluation, which is based on Ontario Regulation 9/06 (Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest) but includes additional information, properties ranging from 60-79 are "Significant" while properties 80-100 are deemed as "Very Significant" (Attachment #5).

Historical or Associative Value – The house was constructed circa 1880 in a style that was common in the 1860s and the porch was replaced or added in the 1920s.

The property is associated with Thomas Armstrong who was a labourer from Ireland and likely continued farming practices on the subject property in Vaughan.

Contextual Value – The subject property is located in Teston Village, formerly known as Thamesville, on the west side of Jane Street. The area known as Teston Village occupies the area of Jane and Teston and is comprised of both commercial properties and farmland properties. The east side of this portion of Jane Street contains commercial-type buildings that were built close to the road to create a street presence to cater to pedestrian traffic. 10980 Jane Street is located on the west side of Jane and set farther back into the property as this building functioned as a farmhouse and provides a contrast to the historical type of development on the east side of Jane Street.

6) <u>10533 Keele Street</u> (Attachment #6)

Design Value or Physical Value - This property is a unique example of a wood-clad board and batten1890s Ontario Farmhouse. It is a 1 ½ storey side-gable building with 1 over 1 hung windows and a central gable on the front elevation (Attachment #6).

Historical or Associative Value – This house on this property was constructed in the 1890s. According to the 1878 Historical Atlas of the County of York, the south half of

Concession 3, Lot 24 was owned by Archibald McQuarrie while the north half was owned by T. Watson. 10533 Keele Street appears to fall within the south half. Archibald McQuarrie, sat on Vaughan Township Council as a Councillor in 1872 and 1873. He was also a Trustee of Hope School S.S. No. 5 and helped with the purchasing of land for the new school. Archibald married Emma Pickering and together they had ten children (Reaman).

Contextual Value – The subject property is located outside the official boundaries of the Maple Heritage Conservation District but, historically, was associated with the Village of Maple.

7) <u>9151 Huntington Road</u> (Attachment #7)

Design Value or Physical Value - This property is a 2 storey brick and stone foundation Georgian house, constructed circa 1850.

Historical or Associative Value - It is known as the John Fleming House and is associated with the Fleming family who arrived in Vaughan Township in the 1830's and was a significant family within the area.

Contextual Value - the property is associated with the hamlet of Elder's Mills.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

• Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff have evaluated these seven properties to determine that they contain sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to be included on the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value. These recommendations fulfil specific policies in Section 6 of the City of Vaughan's Official Plan. Should the Committee concur, the staff recommendation can be adopted.

Attachments

- 1. Photograph of 46 Monsheen Drive
- 2. Photographs of 82 Monsheen Drive
- 3. Photograph of 2720 King-Vaughan Road
- 4. Photographs of 8811 Huntington Road
- 5. Photographs of 10980 Jane Street
- 6. Photograph of 10533 Keele Street
- 7. Photograph of 9151 Huntington Road
- 8. Context Location Map

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112 Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115 Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

3

DELEGATED HERITAGE PERMITS WARD 1

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated June 15, 2016, was approved.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

1. THAT this report respecting delegated heritage permits as per By-law 193-2015, BE RECEIVED for information.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within Green Directions Vaughan, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City of Vaughan website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Cultural Heritage staff to inform Heritage Vaughan of the delegated permits that were recently issued by staff under the delegated heritage permit process as outlined in By-law 193-2015.

Background - Analysis and Options

Cultural Heritage staff within the Vaughan Development Planning Department received heritage permit applications pertaining to new signage for the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and the Maple Heritage Conservation District.

Three of the permit applications were for new signage for commercial businesses in the Kleinburg Commercial Core area. All applications were within the criteria outlined in the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan.

The fourth permit application was located in the Maple Heritage Conservation District and was a replacement of the Maple Plaza sign that was severely damaged last year. As the owner was simply replacing a sign of the same design and materials as the original sign, there were no concerns.

Heritage Permits Issued

- HP.2016.013.00 10423 Islington Avenue new signage for Immanuel Florist Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District
- HP.2016.014.00 10425 Islington Avenue, Unit #4 new signage for Kleinburg Wellness Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District
- HP.2016.015.00 10425 Islington Avenue, Unit #3 new signage for White Cherry Boutique Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District
- HP.2016.016.00 10200 Keele Street replacement of damaged sign for Maple Plaza Maple Heritage Conservation District

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report supports the following priority set forth in the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018):

• Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff has reviewed and approved the above-noted heritage permit applications for new and replacement signage in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and the Maple Heritage Conservation District. The applications were considered to meet the criteria for delegated approval as outlined in By-law 193-2015, and the Heritage Vaughan Committee is being informed thereof.

Attachments

N/A

Report Prepared By

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115 Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

BUILDING ADDITION TO 10 MILL STREET THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT WARD 5 - VICINITY OF YONGE STREET AND CENTRE STREET

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning, dated June 15, 2016, was approved;
- 2) That the Committee did not approve of the 3D renderings identified as Attachment 5; and
- 3) That the following deputations were received:
 - 1. Mr. Corey Bakocs, Netthaus Design-Build, Cartier Crescent, Richmond Hill; and
 - 2. Mr. Eric Hemdon, Netthaus Design-Build, Cartier Crescent, Richmond Hill.

Recommendation

4

The Director of Development Planning recommends:

- 1. THAT Council approve the proposed addition to a single detached house and new construction of a detached garage at 10 Mill Street under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
 - b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's

website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for the Heritage Vaughan Committee to consider the proposed addition to an existing building at 10 Mill Street and new construction of a detached garage to a Part V Designated property located in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

Location, Heritage Status, and Policies

The property municipally known as 10 Mill Street is located on the north side of Mill Street, a street that runs perpendicular to Yonge Street and is access by Old Yonge Street off of Centre Street. The subject property is located in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD) and is therefore Designated Part V under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The existing building on the subject property is a Modernist bunker-style single detached residence constructed in 1969. The house is clad in cedar shingles and only one storey is visible to the Mill Street as the rest of the house scales back into the valley lands to the rear of the property.

The subject property is a contributing property to the Heritage Conservation District and the building on the property is identified as a non-contributing style that does not relate to one of the heritage styles noted in Section 9.1. As a result, policies that pertain to existing non-heritage style building – Sections 4.3 and 9.4 – shall apply.

Proposed Addition

The proposal includes the retention of the existing bungalow in addition to increasing the height to 2 storeys and generally enlarging the entire building. A detached single storey garage and deck are also proposed for the property. All new construction is proposed in the same architectural style with the addition clad in a similar siding material to match the existing portion and will have a shed roof sloping back.

The proposal conforms to the policies noted above regarding non-heritage style buildings as the additions and new construction enlarges the building while respecting the existing modernist architectural style of the building.

Variance Proposed

The applicant will be applying for relief from the City of Vaughan Zoning By-law 1-88 for a reduced front yard setback of 5.5 metres. The current City of Vaughan Zoning By-law 1-88 requires a minimum 9 metre front yard setback. As a Committee of Adjustment application has not been officially submitted to the City yet, this variance is not yet confirmed and additional variances may be identified. Additional variances may require this application to return to the Heritage Vaughan Committee at the discretion of City staff.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

• Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage staff in the Development Planning Department recommends approval of the proposed addition, deck and detached garage as it complies with the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.

Attachments

- 1. Location Map
- 2. Subject Property and Context Photos
- 3. Existing Site Plan and Elevations
- 4. Proposed Site Plan and Elevations
- 5. 3D Rendering of Proposed House

Report prepared by:

Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8112 Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353 Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

4

NEW BUSINESS – UPDATED DRAWINGS

The Heritage Vaughan Committee requested that any revised drawings and relevant recommendations be provided for their review prior to the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 8:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator