

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 3 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on May 31, 2016***

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:10 p.m., on May 18, 2016.

Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair
 Christine Radewych, Vice-Chair
 Frank Alaimo
 Robert Brown
 Sandra Colica
 David Grossman
 Nick Pacione
 Giacomo Parisi
 Claudio Travierso
 Henry Xu

Staff present: Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
 Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
 Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer
 John Britto, Council / Committee Administrator

The following item was dealt with:

**1 NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A SINGLE DETACHED RESIDENTIAL BUILDING
 (DEFERRED FROM APRIL 20, 2016)
 DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
 54 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
 WARD 1 – VICINITY OF NAPIER STREET AND KELLAM STREET**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That Council approve the proposed new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for a single detached dwelling at 54 Napier Street, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
 - b) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning; and

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 31, 2016**

- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application; and
- 2) That Attachments 3 c), d) and e), Attachments 4 a) and b) and Attachment 5 be replaced with the revised drawings to reflect the 3D renderings presented at the Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting on May 18, 2016.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

That the deputation by Mr. Fausto Cortese, Fausto Cortese Architect Inc., Bloor Street West, Toronto, on behalf of the applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

- 1. That Council approve the proposed new construction under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for a single detached dwelling at 54 Napier Street, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) further minor refinements to building design including material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
 - b) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning;
 - c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within Green Directions Vaughan, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 31, 2016**

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to consider the revised drawings for a proposed new construction of a single family detached residence at 54 Napier Street within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

In 2011, the previous Owner of the property applied for and received permission from Heritage Vaughan and the City of Vaughan Council to demolish the existing structure on the property and subsequently received approval to build a new dwelling on the lot in April 2012. However, the property was acquired by the current owner and the approved new building was not built.

The existing 1957 dwelling still remains on the property and the approval to demolish the existing dwelling remains in effect.

The applicant proposes a single detached dwelling in the modern style, specifically in the style of the Windrush Development. The Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan identifies the Windrush Co-operative properties as being worthy of Part IV designation, therefore making this specific iteration of modern style a possible heritage style in the district.

The Modern/Windrush Style is alluded to in two places in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Study and Plan. In the heritage character assessment of Windrush, the Study states the following:

"Windrush was something of an "artist's colony", and the members were among those few who took their modern architecture straight up. Many of the original houses are quite faithful to the example of Frank Lloyd Wright's "Usonian" houses, with flat roofs jutting over one another, large areas of glass, wood siding, and massive stone chimneys." (P. 46)

In Section 9 (9.2.2), the Modern style elements are listed:

- *One-storey, very informal plan. Each area of the house expressed in plan and elevation.*
- *Fits into landscape, with floor levels following contours of the lot.*
- *Main entrance often on the side.*
- *Strong horizontal emphasis.*
- *Flat roofs with large overhangs, sometimes extremely so. Roofs overlap and vary in height.*
- *Very large chimney.*
- *Natural materials: fieldstone, brick and wood.*
- *Large glass areas: inside and outside 'flow together'.*

In the first circulation of Site Plan file DA.16.002, Cultural Heritage staff identified concerns with the proposed cladding materials, chimney design, glazing style and landscaping. The applicant addressed all comments. The applicant also provided a streetscape view rendering to provide context for the height and scale of the proposed new residence.

The design proposal was reviewed at the April 20, 2016 Heritage Vaughan meeting. The Committee requested that the proposed design be further refined to better reflect the character of the Usonian style. The applicant was requested to prepare an alternative based on comments of the Committee and to present at the scheduled May 18, 2016

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 31, 2016**

Heritage Vaughan Committee.

On May 4, 2016, staff received revised drawings with the following revisions to the architecture:

- i. flat roofs of the Usonian style
- ii. windows extended vertically along front façade and added to the garage

Cultural Heritage staff reviewed the revised drawings submitted on May 4, 2016 and, in consultation with staff from Urban Design, the following further refinements are recommended:

1. Fascia
Reduce the vertical height of the wood fascia. Consider extending the wood overhangs.
2. Glazing
Extend windows up to the soffit. Reduce the horizontal mullions wherever possible. Extend windows down to the ground plane wherever possible. This will emphasize the verticality of windows against the horizontality of the roof in the Usonian style.
3. Materials
Reduce the number of materials on the elevations to one or two materials plus glazing, such as Long Board Wood Siding and Brick Brampton Contempo Dover. Note: The chimney should remain as stone.

Staff notes that the drawings and renderings show slight discrepancies in the description and/or placement of materials. This is likely due to the turnaround of design changes within the two week revision period for Heritage Vaughan Committee. Staff will require that the full colour rendering(s) match the elevation drawings and proposed materials for final heritage permit issuance.

Materials

Materials and methods will be reviewed and confirmed at the staff level prior to issuance of the Heritage Permit.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on April 13, 2016 and must be deliberated upon by Council by July 12, 2016 to meet the 90 day timeline.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 31, 2016**

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the proposed application and determines that the proposed new construction of a single detached dwelling at 54 Napier Street is consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan, subject to further minor refinements to the building design as identified in the report. Should the Committee concur, the recommendations in this report may be adjusted.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Current Condition
3. Site Plan & Elevations
 - a) Landscape/Site Plan
 - b) Topographical Site Plan
 - c) Front Elevation
 - d) Right Side Elevation
 - e) Left Side Elevation
4. Renderings
 - a) Front view
 - b) Contextual streetscape
5. Proposed Materials

Report prepared by:

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

The meeting adjourned at 7:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: John Britto, Council / Committee Administrator