

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on May 23, 2017***

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

- a) That an Arborist Report be submitted to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to the approval of a Heritage Permit.
- b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- c) That Heritage Vaughan Committee approval does not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed addition to the existing one-storey commercial building, located at 10473 Islington Avenue. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, alteration of heritage resources located on Registered and Designated properties require Heritage Vaughan approval.

Associated Site Development File DA.16.093 has been submitted for the subject property and is currently under review by the Development Planning Department.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on March 24, 2017, and must be deliberated upon by June 22, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background - Analysis

The subject property is known municipally as 10473 Islington Avenue. It is located on the east side of Islington Avenue, between Kellam Street to the north and Stegman's Mill Road to the south. The subject property is identified as a contributing heritage property in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan (Section 2.6.2).

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

The original heritage building is identified as a 1½ storey wood frame, aluminum-clad building dating back to circa 1890. The architectural style of the building is identified as a Vernacular “Loyalist Cottage” style. The one-storey addition at the rear of the existing building is likely a later addition, with a further extension added between 2002 and 2005.

Proposed Alterations

The Owner has submitted a Site Development Application for the alteration to the existing building for a proposed addition. The proposed addition will be located at the rear of the building and placed on the existing one-storey rear-addition, making the total height of the rear portion of the building two-storeys in height, as shown in Attachments #3 to #7.

The windows and doors of the existing heritage building and one-storey rear addition will remain, with the exception of one window located at the rear of the building (east elevation). This window will be removed to allow for the interior staircase to access the proposed second-storey.

The following are relevant Goals, Policies, and Guidelines from the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan with which this proposal is considered to be consistent:

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives, Heritage Buildings:

- *“To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities, and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.”*

Section 6.2 Policies for Heritage Buildings:

- *“Alterations to heritage buildings should include removal of later unsympathetic work and restoration of original features and detail.”*
- *“Work on heritage buildings should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.3.”*

Section 9.3.7 New Additions to Heritage Buildings, speaks to new additions being designed to:

- *“...complement the design of the original building” and to “not overwhelm the heritage character of the original building”.*

Section 9.3.7 New Additions to Heritage Buildings:

- *“Don’t design additions to a greater height or scale than the original building.”*
- *“Don’t design additions to predominate over the original building. Usually, additions should be located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building.”*
- *“Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.10.”*

Analysis - Materials

The proposed addition would be constructed with building materials consistent with the existing building, including asphalt shingles and aluminum-siding. The proposed windows to be located on the second-storey addition will be a 6 over 6 configuration, in keeping with the majority of the existing windows on the original heritage building.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Analysis – Height and Massing

The proposed addition will result in a building height of two-storeys at the rear of the building. This increase in height will not obstruct or overshadow the existing heritage building, as this addition will be located at the rear of the building, on top of the existing one-storey rear addition. As per the Coloured Context Images provided by the applicant (Attachment #7), the second-storey portion will not be within the line of sight from the street-level on Islington Avenue. The proposed addition will have a hipped-roof, which mirrors the existing roofline of the current one-storey rear addition.

The massing of the addition is set back from the original building and does not increase the footprint of the existing one-storey rear addition.

Analysis – Architectural Style

The proposed rear-addition will be built on top of the existing one-storey addition. The existing one-storey addition is not being proposed for removal as it is sympathetic to the original building. The proposed rear-addition will have a hipped roof, with peaked-gables cut into the roof line along the north, south and east elevations to complement the gable dormers located on the original front façade of the building. The centrally placed windows along the upper floor creates a symmetrical façade that is consistent with the original building's Vernacular "Loyalist" Cottage style. The second-storey addition improves on and harmonizes the existing one-storey addition by providing balance in the facades.

For the above noted reasons, the proposed alteration complements the design of the original building and does not overwhelm the heritage character of the original building

Cultural Landscape

An Arborist Report must be submitted to the satisfaction of Cultural Heritage staff to ensure the tree canopy is not being affected by the second storey addition. The report shall inventory, assess and provide tree protection measures to protect existing trees. An additional landscape strip is proposed at the rear of the property. Urban Design has requested improvements to the streetscape interface along Islington Avenue. These plans must be submitted to Cultural Heritage Staff for review and approval.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed alteration of the building at 10473 Islington Avenue conforms to the policies and guidelines noted above. Accordingly, staff can support the approval of the proposed alteration under the Ontario Heritage Act.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Map
3. Site Plan
4. Floor Plans
5. Elevations
6. Cross Section
7. Coloured Context Images
8. Photos of Subject Property - April 11, 2017

Report prepared by:

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2

**ALTERATION
10515 HIGHWAY 27 - KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE
HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT,
DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
WARD 1 - VICINITY OF HIGHWAY 27 AND NASHVILLE ROAD**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated April 26, 2017, was approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Nicole Rogano, SOSCIA Professional Engineers Inc., Yonge Street, Richmond Hill, representing the applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT the proposed alterations to the existing Montessori School of Kleinburg, 10515 Highway 27, BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - b) That Heritage Vaughan Committee approval does not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval for two proposed additions to the Montessori School of Kleinburg, located at 10515 Highway 27. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, alteration of a heritage resource located on a Registered and Designated property requires Heritage Vaughan and Council approval.

The Owner has submitted an associated Site Development File DA.16.037 for the subject property that is currently under review by the Development Planning Department.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on March 21, 2017 and must be deliberated upon by June 19, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background - Analysis

The subject property is known municipally as 10515 Highway 27. It is located on the east side of Highway 27, south of Nashville Road, as shown in Attachment #1.

The original heritage structure is a two-storey frame building dated circa 1870 and features finely spaced clapboard between narrow, beaded corner-boards, and has a gable facing towards Highway 27. The proposed second floor (west elevation), facing Highway 27 includes two windows and above them a smaller window placed in the gable and located directly between the lower two windows, as shown in Attachment #4. There is an existing one-storey entry at the front elevation with a gable roofline in keeping with the second-storey roofline of the original building. The existing one-storey entry has a triangular pediment style porch and creates a distinct vernacular rendering of the Classical Greek Revival style. Although this one-storey addition was likely built in the early 1970's, it replaced an earlier, smaller porch that was similarly centered.

In 2001/2002, the Owner added a stone, one-storey, 169.8 m² addition to the existing heritage resource, including a stone octagonal tower. The addition covered up the former main entrance alongside the north façade.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Proposed Alterations

The Owner has submitted a Site Development Application for the demolition of the existing front vestibule that was a later addition to the existing building, and the construction of the following one-storey additions to the front and rear of the main building, as shown in Attachments #3 and #4.

- 1) A rear addition on the north façade attached to the 2001/2002 stone addition. Stone veneer, window and door openings are proposed to match the existing cladding and openings. The proposed roofline is consistent with the existing roofline, complements the heritage structure and does not obscure the original building.
- 2) A new front addition on the west façade comprised of wood siding to match the existing building. The proposed roofline is consistent with the existing roofline, complements the heritage structure and does not obscure the original building.

The following are relevant Goals, Policies, and Guidelines with which this proposal is found to be consistent:

Section 5.2.2 District Goals and Objectives, Heritage Buildings:

- *“To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities, and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.”*

Section 6.2 Policies for Heritage Buildings:

- *“Alterations to heritage buildings should include removal of later unsympathetic work and restoration of original features and detail.”*
- *“Work on heritage buildings should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.3.”*

Section 9.3.7 New Additions to Heritage Buildings, speaks to new additions being designed to:

- *“...complement the design of the original building” and to “not overwhelm the heritage character of the original building”.*

Section 9.3.7 New Additions to Heritage Buildings:

- *“Don’t design additions to a greater height or scale than the original building.”*
- *“Don’t design additions to predominate over the original building. Usually, additions should be located to the side, be set back from the street frontage of the original building.”*
- *“Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.10.”*

Analysis

The proposed additions will be constructed using the materials consistent with the existing building materials, and are designed to complement the building and to not obstruct the original heritage features of the existing building.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

The proposed one-storey additions match the existing north and west portions of the building that are currently one-storey in height. Both of the one-storey additions are consistent with the gable roof line that exists on the original two-storey portion of the building. The proposed additions do not dominate the original building, and are located at the front and rear of the existing building. The location of the proposed front (west façade) addition is appropriate as it does not obstruct the original building and the proposed matching roofline compliments the original building. The location of the rear (north façade) addition is appropriate as it is set-off to the rear-side of the building and does not obstruct the original building or the 2001-2002 stone addition. Both additions include appropriate materials that are consistent and complement the existing materials of both the original building (wood siding) and the 2001/2002 addition (stone veneer).

The Building Standards Department has indicated that they have no concerns with the application and that no Minor Variances are required for the proposed construction.

Cultural Landscape

A Landscape Plan was submitted as part of the Heritage Permit Application, and the Owner does not propose any significant grading or impact to existing trees as the two proposed additions are located on existing asphalt areas. The proposed Landscape Plan includes additional plantings that are noted as suitable species in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District guidelines (Section 9.7.7 and Section 9.9) along both sides of the existing vehicular access to the property. The proposed plantings are in keeping with Section 9.7.2 of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District, which states that redevelopment in the Valley Lands should “*screen modern installations, such as parking lots and fenced playing fields, by suitable planting consistent with existing valley vegetation*”.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed alterations to the building at 10515 Highway 27 conforms to the policies and guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support approval of the proposed alterations under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Map
3. Site Plan
4. Elevations
5. Coloured Renderings
6. Photos of Subject Property March 23, 2017

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Report prepared by:

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Maira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**3 LOT LINE ADJUSTMENT AND DEMOLITION OF GARAGE
 376 STEGMAN'S MILL ROAD - KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE
 HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT,
 DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
 WARD 1 - VICINITY OF ISLINGTON AVENUE AND STEGMAN'S MILL ROAD**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended that the following recommendation be forwarded to Council for approval:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated April 26, 2017, be approved.

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the deputation of Nadia Zuccaro, EMC Group Limited, Keele Street, Vaughan, representing the applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan Committee support the proposed lot line adjustment and recommend to Council approval for the demolition of the existing garage under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) That an Arborist Report be submitted to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division prior to the approval of a Heritage Permit.
 - b) Any significant changes to the proposal may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - c) That Heritage Vaughan Committee approval does not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within Green Directions Vaughan, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan Committee support for the proposed lot line adjustment and recommend to Council approval for the demolition of the existing garage, located at 376 Stegman's Mill Road, in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Timing

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the Ontario Heritage Act. This application was declared complete on March 31, 2017, and must be deliberated upon by June 29, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background - Analysis

The subject property, municipally known as 376 Stegman's Mill Road, is located on the northwest corner of Stegman's Mill Road and Napier Street in the Residential Village area of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District. The property was previously the subject of Consent Application B008/13 and Minor Variance Applications A135/16 and A136/15, which were reviewed at the June 11, 2013, Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting. Subsequently, the Committee of Adjustment approved the consent application which resulted in the creation of 6 Napier Street.

376 Stegman's Mill Road is considered to be a contributing property to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District; however, the contributing heritage resource applies to the brick residence and not the existing two car garage, which was constructed in the 1980's.

Proposed Works

The Owner is proposing a lot line adjustment (Consent Application B016/17) to facilitate additional rear yard space to the existing property known as 6 Napier Street. The Owner has noted that the lot line is being shifted on an angle to maintain an unobstructed sight line to the existing Victorian home from Stegman's Mill Road, as shown in Attachment #3.

The proposed works require the disassembly of the existing garage and therefore is considered a demolition. A demolition in a heritage conservation district is not one of the delegated powers under the delegation by-law, therefore this application must be approved by the City of Vaughan Council.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

As part of the proposed lot line adjustment application, the proposed property line between 376 Stegman's Mill Road and 6 Napier Street is located directly underneath the existing garage. Therefore, the garage must be removed to ensure that 6 Napier Street (Site Development File DA.14.097) is prepared for the construction of the house and underground garage, which was approved at the April 15th, 2015, Heritage Vaughan meeting.

Cultural Heritage staff require that an Arborist Report be submitted by the Owner to ensure that no existing trees will be impacted by the proposed demolition of the garage prior to the issuance of the Heritage Permit.

Analysis

The following is an examination of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines that support the proposal to remove the existing garage and adjust the lot line.

Section 5.2.1 Townscape

"To preserve and reinforce existing vistas of significant features and buildings, and to open new vistas where this can be done without detriment to the heritage character of the District."

- The vistas to the significant building are being maintained, as the boundary line is not being adjusted at the frontage of the property along Stegman's Mill Road. The lot line adjustment affects the mid and rear portions of the property, allowing the view of the building from Stegman's Mill Road to be maintained. The proposal does not contemplate any adjustments to the approved building to be located at 6 Napier Street (as per Site Development File DA.14.097); therefore Staff has determined that the proposal will not be to the detriment of the existing heritage character of the District.

5.2.2 Heritage Buildings

"To retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance in the District."

- The property 376 Stegman's Mill Road is considered to be a contributing property to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District; however, the contributing heritage resource applies to the brick residence and not the existing two car garage, which was constructed in the 1980's. The brick residence at 376 Stegman's Mill Road will be retained and conserved.

Section 7.2.7 Severances and Minor Variances

"City Staff, in reviewing applications for severances and minor variances in the District, should give due consideration to the District Plan. The City should only support applications that demonstrate compatibility with the Objectives and Policies of the Plan."

- This application is being presented to Heritage Vaughan for these reasons.

9.5.3 Residential Villages

9.5.3.1 Site Planning

"Elements that define the heritage character of the residential village include:

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

- *Generous lot sizes and modest house sizes, compared to historic urban development or recent suburban development.”*
- The lot to be retained, 376 Stegman’s Mill Road, will be 835.83 m² in area, with 138.72 m² being proposed for severance. This represents 14.23% of the original lot area being conveyed to 6 Napier Street.
- The resulting lot, 6 Napier Street, will be 811.39 m² in size. The lot was originally 672.65 m² in size.
- Both lots, 376 Stegman’s Mill Road and 6 Napier Street, will be of a size that is in keeping with the lot sizes of the District.
- The lot line adjustment is requested by the Owner to create additional rear-yard area for the approved building at 6 Napier Street, while preserving the view of the building at 376 Stegman’s Mill Road.
- There are no policies in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District that would not support the proposed lot configuration resulting from the lot line adjustment.
- The existing lot frontage for 376 Stegman’s Mill Road will not change as part of this application, and therefore will not affect the existing character of the lot.
- The lot adjustment will occur towards the rear of both properties, and not be immediately visible from either the Stegman’s Mill Road or the Napier Street frontages.

Based on the above analysis, the proposed demolition of the detached garage and proposed lot line adjustment is in conformity with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application and is satisfied the proposed works conform to the policies and guidelines within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed lot line adjustment and the proposed demolition of the garage under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Maps
3. Letter from EMC Group Limited
4. Site Plan
5. Photos of Subject Property April 3, 2017

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage
Division for the approval of a Heritage Permit.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval of the recommendations to Vaughan Council for a proposed fire hall located at 835 Nashville Road. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, all new construction within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District requires Heritage Vaughan and Council approval.

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the Ontario Heritage Act. This application was declared complete on April 19, 2017, and must be deliberated upon by July 18, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background

The subject property is known municipally as 835 Nashville Road. It is located on the south side of Nashville Road, directly west of the rail line and east of Huntington Road, as shown in Attachment #1. The Nashville Village is comprised of predominantly of street-related residential development. The immediate area surrounding the subject property is characterized by the rail line intersection and commercial/agricultural uses.

The heritage character of Nashville Road is based on its historic role as a link between the villages, mills and railway, and the fact that it mostly lies on its original alignment. That alignment was established by the topography of the Humber River.

A Heritage Permit was issued by the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division in 2016 (File HP.2016-027-00) for the demolition of the two sheds on the subject property as part of the clean-up and preparation of the lot, which will be the location of the new fire hall. One of the two sheds was captured as part of the 2001 Built Heritage Inventory and its condition has continued to decline and is currently in a state of collapse.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Proposed New Construction

The Owner is proposing a new 538 m² fire hall on the subject property. The proposed development consists of a central apparatus bay, a circulation atrium and associated office and fire hall uses, as shown on Attachment #3.

A Minor Variance application (File A091/17) has been submitted to increase the maximum permitted lot coverage on the subject lands from 20% to 25% and reduced building setbacks on the north, east and west sides of the property. This application is currently under review by the Development Planning Department.

Analysis

The proposal is consistent with the following relevant Goals, Policies, and Guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan:

Section 5.2.5 Future Development in the District

To encourage new development that will enhance the heritage character of the District as infill construction on vacant lands and replacement construction or alterations to non-heritage buildings.

- The proposed development is located on a lot that is located adjacent to the rail line and surrounding commercial/agricultural activities. The proposed development will enhance the character of the District, by introducing a community use that will improve the Nashville Road streetscape on vacant lands that are otherwise limited by the surrounding commercial/agricultural uses and the adjacent rail line.

To guide new development so it can provide for contemporary needs, and to ensure its design will be compatible with and complementary to the character of the District and the heritage resources within.

- The proposed fire hall will be located on vacant land that will provide a use for the contemporary needs to service the surrounding community.

Section 6.3 Policies for New Development

New development should be limited to vacant sites or to sites currently occupied by unsympathetic buildings. Even the most skillfully executed heritage-friendly building cannot replace the value of a real heritage building.

- The proposed new development will be located on a vacant site.

New development within the District should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.5.

- This is discussed under Section 9.5 – Architectural Style of this report.

The Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District does not include applicable policies for proposed new institutional buildings. However, an analysis of related policies for new construction has been provided below for reference purposes.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

9.5.3.1 Residential Villages - Site Planning

Site new houses to provide setbacks that contrast with adjacent properties, in order to create the variety characteristics of the village.

- The proposed front yard setback is 6 metres. The adjacent property located to the west does not have any buildings located on this site, and therefore does not have a building front yard setback to compare and contrast with the proposed development setbacks. The rail line right-of-way is located directly east of the subject property, and therefore does not have a building front yard setback to compare and contrast with the proposed development setbacks. The front yard setbacks on Nashville Road from the rail line to Huntington Road vary in distances, from approximately 0 metres (the Nashville Post Office) to 26 metres (975 Nashville Road), with a variety of different setbacks in between.

9.5.3.2 Architectural Styles

Design houses to reflect one of the local heritage Architectural Styles.

Hybrid designs that mix elements from different historical styles are not appropriate. Historical styles that are not indigenous to the area, such as Tudor or French Manor, are not appropriate.

Use authentic detail, consistent with the Architectural Style. See Section 9.2.1.

Research the chosen Architectural Style. See Section 10 for useful research sources.

- The proposed design (see Attachment #3) is contemporary in style and does not reflect a specific historical architectural style, as per Section 9.2.1. The proposed design is a result of the function of the fire hall and its internal layout. Due to the function of the proposed fire hall, there are limited precedents for the design to follow in terms of institutional buildings. Section 9.2.1 of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan references residential, agricultural and commercial buildings but does not make reference to institutional buildings. The proposed design is acceptable to Cultural Heritage Staff as it is designed to accommodate the function of a use that is unique to the District.

Use appropriate materials. See Section 9.10.

- The proposed red brick is in keeping with the appropriate materials palette as per Section 9.10.1.
- The following proposed materials are required for the function of the fire hall for the following reasons, as provided by the Owner:
 - Olive Arriscraft Renaissance Masonry Stone (at main entrance, apparatus bay and first three courses): creates two identifying locations for the building, particularly the apparatus bay that houses the response vehicles. This treatment is intended to give prominence and importance to this location.
 - Standing Seam Metal Roof (Regent Grey): as a post-disaster building, the standing seam metal roof is required due to its longevity and durability, which increases the durability of the overall structure. The

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

lighter colour is required to minimize the heat island effect and increase the recycled material content.

Cultural Landscape

A Landscape Plan and Details, prepared by a Landscape Architect, and an Arborist Report, prepared by a Certified Arborist, in conformity with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District guidelines will be required as a condition of approval.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Invest, renew and manage infrastructure and assets
- Continue to ensure the safety and well-being of citizens
- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied that the proposed fire hall at 835 Nashville Road conforms to the policies and guidelines of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Heritage Vaughan approval of the recommendations to Vaughan Council for the proposed new construction under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Site Map
3. Architectural Drawings Package
4. Photos of Subject Property April 11, 2017

Report prepared by:

Shelby Blundell, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8813
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**5 SHUTTERS AND CARPORT ADDITION TO A CONTRIBUTING HERITAGE BUILDING
DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT
25 ELIZABETH STREET, THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
WARD 5 - VICINITY OF CENTRE STREET AND ELIZABETH STREET**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated April 26, 2017, was approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Grvjica Ilic, Elizabeth Street, Thornhill, applicant, was received.

Recommendation

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT the proposed alterations of a carport and additional shutters at 25 Elizabeth Street BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:
 - a) The final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
 - b) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning in consultation with the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
 - c) That Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Vaughan Council do not constitute specific support for any further variances, permits or requirements that may be sought in the future by the Owner as it relates to the subject application.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is for the Heritage Vaughan Committee to consider the proposed alterations of a carport and additional shutters to a single detached residence at 25 Elizabeth Street within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Timeline

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on March 31, 2017, and must be deliberated upon by June 29, 2017, to meet the 90 day timeline.

Background - Analysis and Options

The subject property, known municipally as 25 Elizabeth Street as shown in Attachment #1, is located in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District. It is a unique site with two heritage buildings, both single detached homes, and is a contributing property to the HCD. The proposed alterations are to the main house fronting Elizabeth Street. This house, constructed circa 1900, was originally located at Yonge Street and Centre Street and was relocated to its present site in 1929. The dwelling is designed in an understated Queen Anne Revival style with an L-shaped, two storey plan and front porch.

On September 21, 2011, the Heritage Vaughan Committee recommended approval for a number of alterations to the property, including the addition of new shutters to the house, as shown on Attachment #2. The approved and constructed shutters are operable and made of painted wood. The Owner is proposing three additional sets of shutters to match those existing for the windows that are located in the projecting two storey portion of the front façade, as shown on Attachment #3, #4 and #5.

The second proposed alteration to the property is the addition of a carport to the side of the house, located over the existing driveway. The carport utilizes the design and materials of the existing house, as shown on Attachment #4. The posts for the proposed carport are located on the existing driveway pavement. The roof line of the house porch is carried over to the carport for visual balance. The proposed carport is open and unenclosed with a minimal rise that will not significantly block the view of the rear cottage from the streetscape.

Should the proposal for the carport be approved by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, the Owner will need to apply for Minor Variances to Zoning By-law 1-88 to permit a reduced side yard setback and an increase to the permitted lot coverage. The proposed carport setback is a distance of 0.61m from the south property line, whereas Zoning By-law 1-88 requires a minimum of 1.5m. It should be noted that the built form at 23 Elizabeth Street is located several meters south of the shared property line and the visual separation between the two lots is maintained.

The existing lot coverage, including both heritage houses, is 35.3%. The proposed 24.55m² carport footprint increases the proposed lot coverage by 3.6% to 38.9% (267.03 m² total). In the Thornhill HCD area a 20% lot coverage is the maximum allowed by Zoning By-law 1-88. A previous Committee of Adjustment application (A192/11) recognized the existing lot coverage of 35.3% and the existing side and rear setbacks on the property as a unique circumstance of two separate heritage house structures on the property since 1929.

Regarding the increased lot coverage, the carport is supported by Cultural Heritage staff as there is no existing garage on the property and the design is open and unenclosed, with no new paving required.

The proposed carport alteration will not alter existing heritage attributes of the property, is designed to be in keeping with the existing features of the house and the carport may be

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

reversed in the future if desired. Therefore, Cultural Heritage staff support the proposed alterations as they meet the Thornhill HCD Plan and Guidelines as outlined in Section 9.3.7.

This application meets the City's Delegation By-law criteria and therefore, does not need to be advanced to Vaughan Council for deliberation unless the Committee advises against the approval of the proposed changes.

Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)

The application supports the following priorities set forth in the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018):

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The proposed alterations to the property at 25 Elizabeth Street are consistent with the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of Development Planning support approval of the proposed new shutters and carport addition under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Approved Architectural Elevations (2011)
3. Photomontage of Existing Residence and Proposed Alterations (Shutters and Carport)
4. Architectural Elevations
5. Photo illustration of all proposed changes

Report prepared by:

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Moira Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

6 NEW BUSINESS – CANADA 150 CELEBRATION TASK FORCE

Giacomo Parisi provided an update on the Canada 150 Celebration Task Force of which he is a member.

The foregoing matter was brought to the attention of the Committee by Giacomo Parisi.

The meeting adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

**REPORT NO. 3 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MAY 23, 2017**

Christine Radewych, Vice - Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator