

CITY OF VAUGHAN
REPORT NO. 2 OF THE
HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

*For consideration by the Committee of the Whole
of the City of Vaughan
on April 14, 2015*

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:04 p.m., on March 11, 2015.

Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair
Christine Radewych, Vice Chair
Frank Alaimo
Sandra Colica
Lelio DeCicco
Councillor Rosanna DeFrancesca
Regional Councillor Michael Di Biase
David Grossman
Nick Pacione
Fadia Pahlawan
Giacomo Parisi
Pankaj Sandhu
Antoinell Strangis
Claudio Traverso
Howard Tuchman

Also Present: Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator
Moir Wilson, Senior Urban Designer
Angela Palermo, Manager of Cultural Services
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design & Cultural Heritage
Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk

The following items were dealt with:

**1 PROPOSED ADDITION AND RENOVATIONS TO PART V DESIGNATED BUILDING –
24 LESTER B. PEARSON
WARD 1 - VICINITY OF ISLINGTON AVENUE AND NASHVILLE ROAD**

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated March 11, 2015, was approved; and
- 2) That the following deputations were received:
 1. Mr. Philip Carter, Architect; and
 2. Mr. Paul Oberst, Architect.

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

Recommendation

The Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommends:

1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed additions and renovations to 24 Lester B. Pearson Street.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed additions and renovations to the existing building at 24 Lester B. Pearson Street.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Status	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Designated Part V, Ontario Heritage Act, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District• Listed on Vaughan's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value, Section 27 OHA.
Heritage style and Building Info	<p>Constructed between 1865-1875 in brick in the Georgian style with a replacement or added porch in the Victorian/Regency style. A larger board and batten addition was constructed in the 1980s and soon after the original portion of house was covered with the same board and batten siding.</p> <p>The building is known as the Lester B. Pearson house, however, Lester was born after his parents had already moved from the building to North York. The building is therefore only associated with the Pearson family.</p>
Proposal	<p>The applicant is proposing to renovate and restore the existing heritage home, add dormers to the second storey, and construct a two car garage, a deck, and a sunroom. The applicant is also proposing to create skylights on the back portion of the roof of</p>

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

	<p>the original house, add two new window openings on the north side of the original house, and replace existing unsympathetic windows and doors. The unsympathetic windows and doors were likely put into the house in the 1990s when the entire building was re-clad in aluminum siding.</p> <p>The proposed additions are in keeping with the 1860s Georgian style of the existing building while the proposed dormers are derived more from the 1920 Georgian Revival style. Photos of 1920s Georgian Revival buildings from Burlington, provided by the applicant, are attached to the agenda.</p> <p>The proposal conforms to the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Guidelines.</p>
Conservation Plan required	The applicant has submitted a Conservation Plan for this proposal which is attached to the agenda.
Variances	The applicant has indicated that no variances will be required for this proposal.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture –
 - i) The rehabilitation and additions to the existing heritage house will ensure its longevity and importance as a contributing heritage asset in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District
- Lead & Promote Environmental Sustainability –
 - i) Rehabilitation of existing buildings in place of demolition diverts waste from a landfill, eliminates the energy required for demolition, and reduces the amount of energy required to produce new materials

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Cultural Heritage Staff recommends Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed additions and renovations to the existing building at 24 Lester B. Pearson. The proposed changes are in conformity with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines and respect the style and fabric of the existing building.

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

require review by the Heritage Vaughan Committee and any previous approvals granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan's approval for the proposed new construction at 21 Mill Street.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Status of Property

The property is Designated Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, as part of Thornhill Heritage Conservation District. The Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan applies to the subject lands and a Heritage Permit approval is required for the proposal.

Background

The subject property lot, now known as 21 Mill Street, is the result of a severance application that underwent Committee of Adjustment Review in 2013 pertaining to 15 Mill Street, the property now located next door to the east (**A121/13 and B006/13**). The Heritage Vaughan Committee reviewed the proposal to sever 15 Mill Street at the May 22, 2013 Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting. The following is an extract of the recommendation approved at that meeting:

1. *That Heritage Vaughan support the proposed Committee of Adjustment Applications for the severance of the existing property at 15 Mill Street into two lots, resulting in a variance for additional coverage to the allowable for the lot retained with the existing structure, subject to the following conditions:*
 - i. *That the lot coverage for the portion containing the existing structure at 15 Mill street not exceed the 24.2% lot coverage pending approval of the claim for adverse possession; and,*

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

- ii. *That in order to protect the rural and vegetation-rich streetscape of Mill Street, in the event that a structure is proposed on the newly created lot as a result of a severance of 15 Mill Street, that the future lot coverage should not exceed the allowable within the current zoning by-law; and,*
- iii. *That the applicant work with Cultural Services in the design of a new structure for the newly created lot and the future owner/applicant return for approval of a Heritage Permit for the same at a later Heritage Vaughan Committee meeting, and;*
- iv. *That any future new building be in accordance with the Heritage District Guidelines and the applicant return to Heritage Vaughan for final approval of the infill structure, and;*

At their April 23, 2014 meeting, the Heritage Vaughan Committee reviewed a proposal for a new single family dwelling at 21 Mill Street. The proposal included the following variances as reflected on Committee of Adjustment application **A 008/14**:

Minimum front yard setback = 8.0 m

Minimum interior side yard setback: 2.06m and 1.96m

The total of both side yards shall not be less than 4.06m.

Maximum lot coverage: 23.06% (23% house and 0.6% covered porch).

At the April 23, 2014 meeting, the Heritage Vaughan Committee approved the following decision:

Heritage Vaughan advises Council:

- 1) *That Heritage Vaughan requested that the applicant resubmit a revised proposal that is within the current guidelines of 20% lot coverage;*
- 2) *That the applicant was also requested to take into consideration the following conditions in the revised proposal:*
 - 1. *That the applicant work with cultural services in order to comply with the zoning-bylaw for the side yard and front yard setbacks;*
 - 2. *That the large window at the rear elevation be revised in accordance with the historic precedent;*
 - 3. *That the applicant submit material samples for review and approval by Cultural Services staff when these are available;*
 - 4. *That the applicant submit two copies of a finalized set of architectural permit drawings for review and approval by Cultural Services staff, including site plan, plans elevations;*
 - 5. *That the applicant be advised that should the design change as a result of addressing issues from review by other departments, (eg. variance requirements, etc) the applicant will be required to contact Cultural Services in order to obtain approval of a revised Heritage Permit. The new submittal may require review by the Heritage Vaughan Committee and any previous approvals granted may be deemed invalid based on the new information provided.*

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

- 3) *That the report of Cultural Services, dated April 23, 2014, was received; and*
- 4) *That the deputation of Mr. Jay Barmi, JS Barmi Architect, was received.*

The Committee of Adjustment hearing for the proposed variance was held on May 1, 2014 and refused approval of the variances. This decision was appealed at the Ontario Municipal Board and an oral decision was rendered by the Board, with conditions which are set out below. The Board has not yet issued its Order. The applicant worked towards fulfilling the conditions of the Board decision, which resulted in the revised drawings shown on attachments 5 to 14. These revisions resulted in the requirement for an additional variance; that being a variance for front yard grading. This is required in order to permit the mitigation of the amount of exposed basement wall noted in condition 1.ii. The request for the approval of the new variance will need to be sought by the applicant. The City expects that the applicant will seek to have the OMB consider and revise its decision of May 1, 2014.

VARIANCES REQUESTED

1. *Front yard of 8.38 metres to the front porch and 6.87 metres to the front steps, whereas the minimum front yard is 9.0 metres;*
2. *Lot coverage of 22.6% including a lot coverage of 0.31% for the front porch, whereas the maximum lot coverage is 20%;*
3. *Retaining walls to be permitted alongside the east and north sides of the patio to the east of the dwelling and alongside the front steps and landing whereas no retaining walls are permitted; and*
4. *A gradient of 10.45% is permitted in the front yard within 6 metres of the dwelling, whereas the maximum is 5%.*

AGREED CONDITIONS

The above variances be approved with the following conditions:

1. *Prior to the issuance of building permit, the owner shall:*
 - i) *fulfill the requirements of the Heritage Permit Review process to obtain a Heritage Permit for the proposed new construction, including approval for the exterior materials, with the review and approval by the Heritage Vaughan Committee: and*
 - ii) *prepare and implement a landscape plan showing the foundation planting to mitigate the exposed basement elevation to the satisfaction of the City of Vaughan, Commissioner of Planning.*
2. *In the event that archeological resources are found on the property during any construction activities, all work must cease and the both the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport and the City of Vaughan's Planning Department must be notified.*
3. *In the event that human remains have or appear to have been encountered during construction activities, all construction activities must immediately cease on the site, the owner must immediately contact the York Regional Police Department, the Regional Coroner and the Registrar of Cemeteries Regulation Unit of the Ministry of*

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

Consumer and Business Services and advise the City of Vaughan's Planning Department.

Analysis

Design of Proposed Home

The proposed design of the home is subject to Heritage Review and approval of a Heritage Permit, as required in the conditions of approval of the OMB decision. Therefore the Heritage Conservation District Plan applies in this regard. The Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines for the area require that proposed new construction adhere by one heritage style as defined within the document. The applicant has chosen to follow the neoclassical style, which is a heritage style for residential buildings which satisfies the noted requirement. This style is also sometimes referred to as Georgian/Neoclassical due to influences from the Georgian style.

The proposed design clearly exhibits the following characteristics of the neoclassical style:

- Rectangular plan
- Side gable roof with moderate slope
- Symmetrical front elevation
- Punched windows with proportions nearing 1:2
- Double hung windows, often 6 over 6 or 12 over 12
- Brick cladding (material specification to be determined)
- Classical details (usually understated in village communities)

Staff finds that the design influences on the proposed as based on historic precedent complies with the Heritage District Plan.

The applicant has worked to mitigate the impact of the variances through landscape design, building design and material choices. The material palette will include: Ontario sized brick, limestone base, limestone portico columns, header and detailing, cedar shingles, hardi-board horizontal siding, and a natural stone look for landscape walls inspired in traditional low stalked slate walls that are visible from the street. Other materials will include: reinforced plaster cornice at below the soffit to match limestone detailing, prefinished metal gutters, fascia and soffits, steel railings. All material samples will be required to be submitted for final review and approval by cultural heritage staff.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

This report is consistent with the priorities set forth in Vaughan Vision 2020 / Strategic Plan, through the following initiatives, specifically:

Service Excellence:

- Preserve our Heritage & Support Diversity, Arts & Culture -
 - ii) The rehabilitation and additions to the existing heritage house will ensure its longevity and importance as a contributing heritage asset in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District

Regional Implications

N/A

**REPORT NO. 2 OF HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON APRIL 14, 2015**

Conclusion

Based on the analysis, staff can support the overall design and recommend that Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed new construction at 21 Mill Street with the conditions outlined in the recommendation section of this report.

Attachments

1. Aerial Photo, Location of 21 Mill Street within Thornhill Heritage Conservation District boundary
- 2 - 4. Site context photos
- 5 -13. Proposed architectural drawings
14. Front elevation coloured rendering

Report prepared by:

Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115
Moiria Wilson, Senior Urban Designer, ext. 8353

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

3

OTHER ITEMS CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

3.1 ELECTION OF THE CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

**Tony Marziliano was elected Chair and Christine Radewych was elected
Vice-Chair of the Heritage Vaughan Committee.**

The meeting adjourned at 8:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk