

**CITY OF VAUGHAN**  
**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE**  
**HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE**

***For consideration by the Committee of the Whole  
of the City of Vaughan  
on March 7, 2017***

---

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:05 p.m., on February 15, 2017.

Present: Tony Marziliano, Chair  
Christine Radewych, Vice - Chair  
Frank Alaimo  
Sandra Colica  
David Grossman  
Fadia Pahlawan  
Giacomo Parisi  
Pankaj Sandhu  
Antonella Strangis  
Claudio Travierso  
Howard Tuchman  
Henry Xu

Staff present: Daniel Rende, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator  
Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator  
Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator

The following items were dealt with:

**1                    ADDITION TO NEW CONSTRUCTION OF A SINGLE DETACHED  
RESIDENTIAL BUILDING  
DESIGNATED UNDER PART V, ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT  
54 NAPIER STREET, KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT  
WARD 1 – VICINITY OF NAPIER STREET AND KELLAM STREET**

The Heritage Vaughan Committee advises Council:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of the Interim Director of Development Planning and Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, dated February 15, 2017, was approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. Fausto Cortese, Fausto Cortese Architects, Rutherford Road, Vaughan, was received.

**Recommendation**

The Interim Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. That the proposed new addition to a single detached dwelling at 54 Napier Street BE APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

- a) the final building material specifications shall be approved to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
- b) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning in consultation with the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
- c) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Vaughan Council do not constitute specific support for any further variances, permits or requirements that may be sought in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is for the Heritage Vaughan Committee to consider a proposed addition and stair roof to a single detached residence at 54 Napier Street within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

**Timeline**

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on **January 27, 2017** and must be deliberated upon by **April 28, 2017** to meet the 90 day timeline.

**Background - Analysis and Options**

On April 20, 2016, Heritage Vaughan Committee considered a proposed new construction for a detached dwelling at 54 Napier Street. The Committee requested changes to the proposed design to further establish the Usonian style of the dwelling. This resulted in revised drawings being presented at the May 18, 2016, Heritage Vaughan meeting, and the Committee recommended to Vaughan Council that the proposed new construction be approved.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

On June 7, 2016, Item 22, Report No. 24 entitled - **New Construction Of A Single Detached Residential Building, 54 Napier Street, Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District** of the Committee of the Whole, and was adopted without amendment by Vaughan Council.

The applicant submitted the Building Permit drawings for review by the Cultural Heritage staff in late July 2016, and staff determined them to be in accordance with the drawings approved by Council. This resulted in Heritage Permit number HP.2016.021.00 being assigned.

During construction in the fall, the applicant requested to alter the approved design to include a “three season room” and to add a roof over the open exterior staircase to the basement located in the rear yard. The proposed expansion of the footprint for the the season room would also create a new cold storage room as part of the basement.

Upon consultation with Development Planning Department and Cultural Heritage Division staff, it was determined that the proposed changes to the approved Site Plan and Heritage Permit would require an amendment to the approved Site Development application (File DA.16.113), a Minor Variance and the review by the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

The proposed three season room is designed to be in keeping with and complementary to the approved design of 54 Napier Street in materials and scale. The proposed rear wall is comprised of 6 glass panel folding bi-fold doors, creating a large glass wall in keeping with the Usonian style. The proposed roof cover over the stairs features a wood post anchored to a stair wall below and the railing across the exterior stairway will feature glass in keeping with the Usonian style and not interrupt the lines of the existing rear elevation.

The proposed three season room and stair roof over the exterior stairway will add 32.05m<sup>2</sup> to the footprint of the building, thereby increasing the lot coverage from 29.78% to 33.28%, which requires the applicant to apply for a Minor Variance. At this time, the applicant has not applied for the Minor Variance, as Heritage Vaughan advice will inform the Minor Variance application. Cultural Heritage staff does not have a concern with the proposed increase in lot coverage as the changes are located at the rear of the building and will not impact the streetscape further, nor will it impact existing trees.

All of the proposed changes are located to the rear of the house and do not impact the front façade or the existing streetscape and no additional trees would need to be removed as a result of this addition. The proposed alterations to the approved design of the house are in keeping with guidelines in the Kleinburg-Nashville HCD Plan and Guidelines regarding Contemporary Alterations in Section 9.4.

Since the proposal alteration is to an existing new construction that is currently under construction, the application meets the City's Delegation By-law criteria and does not need to be advanced to Vaughan Council for deliberation unless the Committee advises against the approval of the proposed changes.

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

The application supports the following priorities set forth in the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018):

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community



**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

**Recommendation**

The Interim Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend that Vaughan Council approve the proposed new construction at 7994 Yonge Street under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the following conditions:
  - a) any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner, may require reconsideration by Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Interim Director of Development Planning in consultation with the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
  - b) that Heritage Vaughan Committee recommendations to Council do not constitute specific support for any Development Application under the *Ontario Planning Act* or permits/requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the applicant as it relates to the subject application;
  - c) the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division for the approval of a Heritage Permit.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to seek Heritage Vaughan approval of the recommendations to Vaughan Council for the proposed construction of a pool cabana within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD). In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, all new construction within an HCD requires Heritage Vaughan and Council approval.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

**Background - Analysis and Options**

**Location, Heritage Status, and Policies**

The subject property, municipally known as 7994 Yonge Street, is located on the west side of Yonge Street, north of Centre Street, in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (HCD) as shown on Attachment #1. The subject property is Designated under Part V and Registered under Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is an expansive property that extends 1.5 kilometres west of Yonge Street, however, only the portion fronting on Yonge Street is included within the Thornhill HCD boundaries as shown on Attachment #1. The proposed construction is located entirely within the HCD portion of the subject property, and therefore, the policies and guidelines pertaining to new construction in Thornhill HCD apply.

The subject property is surrounded by a cemetery and church to the north, valley lands to the south, low rise residential to the west, and high rise buildings to the east in Markham-Thornhill. This proposal is focused in the area of the property located closer to Yonge Street, west of the Mortimer House and north of the main clubhouse and parking lot. The Mortimer House is a 2-storey wood-clapboard Neo-Classical style building constructed in 1834 with later renovations. The Mortimer House fronts on Yonge Street and is used as an office building. It is not connected to the remainder of the golf and country club. The main clubhouse was constructed in 1972 in a modernist style with a short mansard roof with wood shingles and dark earth tone materials. An addition to the clubhouse was reviewed by Heritage Vaughan in 2014, which continued the horizontal modernist design of the building and introduced more contemporary glazing.

**Notice of Receipt – Complete Application**

On January 20, 2017, the applicant submitted a heritage permit application under Section 42 (2.1) of the Ontario Heritage Act. Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division received all required studies, drawings, and materials required for a full review of the heritage permit application and the application was deemed complete on February 2, 2017. A notice of receipt of a complete heritage permit application was issued to the applicant in accordance with Section 42 (3) of the Ontario Heritage Act.

According to Section 42 (4) of the Ontario Heritage Act, Vaughan Council has 90 days from the day the notice of receipt is issued, which is May 3, 2017, to render one of the following 3 decisions:

- (a) Approval;
- (b) Refusal; or
- (c) Approval with conditions.

If Vaughan Council fails to make a decision within 90 days, the application is deemed approved in accordance with Section 42 (5) of the Ontario Heritage Act.

**Proposed New Construction**

The applicant is proposing to construct a one-storey pool cabana in the northern area of the subject property where existing tennis courts are currently located as shown on Attachment #2.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

**Archaeological Assessment Completed and Satisfactory**

Stage 1-3 and Stage 4 archaeological assessments were completed (dated October 27, 2015 and June 22, 2016) on the subject property in the area where excavation will occur for the construction of the cabana and excavation for the proposed pool. The proposed pool is not subject to the Heritage Permit review process. The reports were submitted to the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, as is standard procedure and the reports were deemed satisfactory and accepted into the register of archaeological reports by way of letter provided to the City (dated January 6, 2016 and July 20, 2016).

**Arborist Report Submitted**

An arborist report was submitted to the City dated November 10, 2015. The report concluded that no trees will be removed to accommodate the proposed new construction on the subject property. Furthermore, 19 trees were inventoried as part of the arborist report and tree protection zones have been identified to protect these trees throughout construction with tree protection fencing and hoarding to the satisfaction of the City.

**Analysis**

The subject property is located on Yonge Street, however, the policies and guidelines respecting Yonge Street are intended to guide low-rise and mid-rise mixed-use development, not a golf and country club. As such, the policies and guidelines of the Thornhill HCD that best fit this scenario are considered, including:

*Section 9, page 53 – The intent of the Guidelines is to preserve and enhance the existing character of Thornhill*

*Section 9.1, page 55 – Additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original building. New developments should be designed in a style that is consistent with the vernacular heritage of the community. All construction should be of a particular style, rather than a hybrid of many styles.*

*Section 9.4.1.1 – Existing Non-heritage style buildings – Contemporary Alteration Approach*

*Additions and alterations using the Contemporary Alteration approach should respect, and be consistent with, the original design of the building.*

*9.5 New Development, page 105, - New buildings should reflect a suitable local heritage style. Use of a style should be consistent in materials, scale, detail, and ornament.*

The subject property currently contains the Mortimer House, a heritage style home, and the clubhouse, which is considered a contributing non-heritage style building. While the building is a non-heritage style (refer to 9.1.4 of the HCD Plan) its massing and relation to the cultural heritage landscape of the property contribute to the overall identity of the Thornhill HCD.

The applicant is proposing a ranch style cabana building with a flat roof that relates to the modernist clubhouse. The cabana can be considered an “addition” to the clubhouse as it is a separate building, but forms part of the overall golf and country club campus.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiative:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

**Regional Implications**

N/A

**Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department is satisfied the proposed new construction conforms to the policies and guidelines within the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, staff can support Council approval of the proposed demolition and new construction under the Ontario Heritage Act.

**Attachments**

1. Location Map
2. Site Map
3. Site Plan
4. a-d Elevations
5. a-g Renderings

**Report prepared by:**

Daniel Rende, Planner I, ext. 8112  
Moir Wilson, Senior Urban Design, ext. 8353  
Rob Bayley, Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage, ext. 8254

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

**2 NEW BUSINESS – INFORMATION WITH RESPECT TO CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

The Council / Committee Administrator was directed to provide information with respect to:

- 1) Determining Conflict of Interest; and
- 2) The City of Vaughan's position should legal action be taken on a Committee member resulting from a decision made in performing their duties as a member of the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

The foregoing matter was brought to the attention of the Committee by Claudio Traverso.

---

The meeting adjourned at 7:56 p.m.



**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
OF THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 7, 2017**

---

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Marziliano, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator