



**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

- 1) That the deputation of Mr. Paul Oberst, Paul Oberst Architect, Rusholme Park Crescent, Toronto, representing the applicant, was received.

**Recommendation**

The Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage recommend:

1. THAT Heritage Vaughan recommend approval to Council for the proposed demolition of the three outbuildings located at 872 Nashville Road under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
2. THAT Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed alterations to 872 Nashville Road under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
3. THAT the above recommendations are subject to the following conditions:
  - a) Any significant changes to the proposal by the Owner may require reconsideration by the Heritage Vaughan Committee, which shall be determined at the discretion of the Director of Development Planning and the Manager of Urban Design and Cultural Heritage;
  - b) That the applicant submit Building Permit stage architectural drawings and building material specifications to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division;
  - c) That the applicant submit a conservation plan to restore the north elevation on completion of the removal of the kitchen tail, to the satisfaction of the Vaughan Development Planning Department, Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division.
  - d) That Heritage Vaughan Committee approval or recommended approval to Council does not constitute specific support for any development application under the Ontario Planning Act or permits or requirements currently under review or to be submitted in the future by the Owner, as it relates to the subject application.

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is to seek the following:

- i) Heritage Vaughan approval for the proposed alterations to the existing vernacular Victorian house; and
- ii) A Heritage Vaughan recommendation for consideration by Council regarding the demolition of three outbuildings in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

**Timeline**

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on December 15, 2017. The proposal for the proposed alterations must be deliberated upon by Heritage Vaughan by March 15, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline. The proposal for demolition must be deliberated upon by Council by March 15, 2018, to meet the 90 day timeline.

**Background**

The subject property is known municipally as 872 Nashville Road, and is located on the north side of Nashville Road, west of the rail line, as shown on Attachment #1. The subject property contains a two-storey brick Victorian house, built circa 1890, with an enclosed front verandah and a rear kitchen tail. The subject property contains three outbuildings, with a mix of rooflines, materials and massing.

**Property History**

The Heritage Impact Assessment and Ownership Chronology (Attachment #3), identified that the brick house was built by John Train for his son Robert James Train and his wife Ester (Card). The property was previously owned by the Somerville family, local farmers that had originated from Scotland, with James Somerville arriving in Vaughan Township in 1836.

**Proposed Alterations**

The applicant is proposing the following work to be undertaken, in accordance with the submitted Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA):

- 1) Demolition of the following three outbuildings:
  - a. One-storey frame outbuilding (approximately 29 m<sup>2</sup> in size)
  - b. One- to two-storey barn (approximately 67 m<sup>2</sup> in size)
  - c. One-storey steel shed (approximately 50 m<sup>2</sup> in size)
- 2) Conservation of the Victorian brick house, including:
  - a. Remove the existing altered kitchen tail;

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

- b. Replace all roofing, including main house, verandah, and bay window, including the flat roof portions;
- c. Remove enclosure of the verandah, restoring its original appearance. It appears that all but one of the original columns are in place, and the replacement column will replicate the originals;
- d. Renew or repair all flashings and rainware;
- e. Remove paint from the existing masonry within the enclosed verandah using non-abrasive methods. Work to be performed by a qualified restoration contractor;
- f. Clean all masonry using gentlest methods—detergent and water with hand brushing;
- g. Replace any damaged masonry units using salvaged material from the tail;
- h. Repoint masonry where joints are eroded, using historic lime mortar to match original;
- i. Insulate the roof, and provide ventilation as required;
- j. Replace the existing windows with modern wood-framed thermal units matching original design, and
- k. Restore the masonry on the north elevation, where the tail is to be removed. Until the removal, it's not possible to specify the extent of the work. A plan for this work will be provided by the applicant once the area is visible. Historic masonry units from the tail should be kept on site for re-use in this work.

Analysis

The following is an examination of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines relevant to the proposal to remove the existing outbuildings and alter the existing Victorian dwelling.

5.2.2 Heritage Buildings

*“To retain and conserve the buildings identified in the Heritage District Plan as having heritage importance in the District.”*

- The property (872 Nashville Road) is considered to be a contributing property to the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District; however, the contributing heritage resource applies to the brick residence and not the outbuildings. The HIA reviewed the potential cultural heritage value of the three outbuildings and found that these buildings do not contain any heritage value that would warrant retention. The brick residence at 872 Nashville Road will be retained and conserved.

*“To conserve distinguishing original features, qualities and character of heritage buildings and to avoid the removal or alteration of any such features.”*

- The HIA identifies that the enclosed verandah appears to have been originally open with the post brackets visible on the exterior. This open verandah will be brought back to its original configuration. The tail to be removed was originally a kitchen tail

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

that has since been altered with subsequent additions. There is only one remaining arched window of the dwelling and the other windows have been altered to larger square configurations. The tail has been altered to such an extent that removal of this feature can be supported by Cultural heritage staff.

*“To encourage the corrections of unsympathetic alterations made over the years to heritage buildings.”*

- The unsympathetic closed verandah and altered kitchen tail addition will be corrected and removed, respectively.

*“To encourage restoration of heritage buildings based on historical, archival, and pictorial evidence.”*

- The applicant has provided an aerial photo of the house (predating 1942) that shows the open verandah and the smaller, original kitchen-tail. Additionally, the proposed restoration is based on neighbouring examples and architectural evidence visible through the differing materials of the kitchen tail and the visible post brackets on the closed verandah.

Section 6.2 Policies for Heritage Buildings

*“The original construction and detail on heritage buildings should be retained and repaired whenever possible.”*

- The verandah will be repaired to what appears to be its original open configuration. The later kitchen tail addition will be removed as it not longer represents its original configuration due to significant alterations.

*“Alterations to heritage buildings should include removal of later unsympathetic work and restoration of original features and detail.”*

- The later unsympathetic, heavily-altered kitchen tail will be removed and the north elevation masonry will be restored. It is noted that the plan for this work cannot be provided until such time the kitchen tail is removed.

*“Work on heritage buildings should be consistent with the Guidelines in Section 9.3”*

- The following is an analysis of the consistency of the proposal with Section 9.3 of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Section 9.3.4 Building Maintenance – Masonry

*“Clean masonry using detergents and a stiff natural bristle brush. If this doesn’t produce satisfactory cleaning, use only professional water-borne chemical agents for further cleaning.”*

- All masonry will be cleaned using the “gentlest methods – detergent and water with hand brushing”, as identified in the Conservation Plan.

*“Do not use sand-blasting or high pressure water for masonry cleaning.”*

- As per the above note, high pressure water will not be used for masonry cleaning.

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

Section 9.3.5.1 Brickwork

*“Repair structural damage before repointing.”*

- Repointing of masonry will only occur where joints are eroded.

*“Use matching bricks for repairs, either salvaged old material, or the best modern match in size and colour.”*

- Damaged masonry units will be replaced using salvaged material from the tail.

*“Use lime mortar for repairs and repointing to historic brick. Match the original in formulation, with a cement content no greater than one-twelfth of the dry volume of the mix; the cement must be white portland cement and not grey.”*

- The Conservation Plan provides for the use of *“historic lime mortar to match original”* for the repointing of masonry joints where eroded.

Section 9.3.5.3 Roofing

*“In re-roofing heritage buildings, care should be taken to choose a material that relates to the original roofing. If asphalt shingles are selected, colours should be black or a dark grey, like slate or weathered cedar.”*

- The current roofing is black asphalt, and the proposed new roofing will match the existing material.

Section 9.3.5.6 Windows

*“Repair material should be of the same species and profile as the originals. If replacement is necessary, wood should normally be used, and window design should match the original in type, glazing pattern, and detail.”*

- The existing windows are to be replaced with modern wood-framed thermal units to match the original design.

Section 9.3.6 Renovations

*“When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, it should be part of the renovation to remove later work that conceals the original design, or is unsympathetic to it. Research, as described in Section 9.3.2, should be undertaken, and the design of new work should restore the principal architectural features of the original building.”*

- Based on the research undertaken in the HIA, it has been found through historic aerial photography and the visible post brackets on the exterior of the closed in verandah that the closed-in verandah was once open and that the original kitchen tail has since been altered significantly. The verandah will be restored to an open design. The tail addition will be removed and the north wall of the dwelling restored.

*“Use authentic original materials and methods. For example, when replacing aluminum siding, use wood siding or board and batten.”*

- All materials being proposed for the restoration will be authentic including the asphalt shingles to match the original condition. The use of salvaged masonry from the

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

removal of the kitchen tail. The windows will be replaced with thermal windows to match the appearance of the existing 2 over 2 double hung windows.

*“Replace missing or broken elements, such as gingerbread, spindles, or door and window trims.”*

- The roofing will be replaced and all flashings and rainware will be repaired or replaced if necessary.

*“Remove items, such as metal fascia and soffit that conceal original architectural detail.”*

- The original details of the open porch and north elevation will be restored.

Section 9.9.2 The Village Forests – Character

*“Site buildings and additions to preserve suitable mature trees.”*

- The proposed alterations to the existing Victorian house and the demolition of the kitchen tail and outbuildings will not require the removal of any of the existing trees, as confirmed by the submitted Arborist Report.

Conclusion

Based on the above analysis, the proposed demolition of the outbuildings and the alterations to the existing Victorian house on 872 Nashville Road are in conformity with the policies of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

**Regional Implications**

N/A

**Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the application and is satisfied that the proposed alterations to the Victorian building and demolition of the outbuildings at 872 Nashville Road are consistent with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed demolitions and alterations under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the conditions in this report.

**Attachments**

1. Location Map
2. Site Map and Site Photos
3. Heritage Impact Statement – 872 Nashville Road
4. Architectural Drawing Set





**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

**Contribution to Sustainability**

This report is consistent with the goals and objectives within *Green Directions Vaughan*, the City's Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan, specifically:

Goal 4: To create a vibrant community where citizens, business and visitors thrive

*Objective 4.1: "To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage"*

**Economic Impact**

There are no requirements for new funding associated with this report.

**Communications Plan**

All materials related to the Heritage Vaughan Committee are posted on the City's website.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this report is for Heritage Vaughan to seek approval for application to alter an existing contributing structure in the Maple Heritage Conservation District.

**Timeline**

This application is subject to the 90 day review under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This application was declared complete on January 4, 2018 and must be deliberated upon by Heritage Vaughan by April 4, 2018 to meet the 90 day timeline.

**Background**

The subject property is known municipally as 10020 Keele Street. It is located on the west side of Keele Street, north of Major Mackenzie Drive West as shown in Attachment #1. Although the Maple HCD Inventory places its potential construction to be circa 1910, subsequent research has demonstrated that the building was constructed in 1941.

**Property History**

The subject building is located on the lot formerly occupied by the Dack's Hotel (renamed Jone's Hotel after 1910), an 19th century board-and-batten tavern. It was replaced in 1941 with the current building built by Howard Knight in 1941 as a purpose built 'modern' restaurant but has subsequently been adapted to various uses as shown in Attachment 3. The property was converted to office space in 1951 and occupied by the Woodbridge and Vaughan Telephone Company, and the Maple Post Office. In 1968 a new Maple Post Office opened, at which time the building was adapted for residential use. The property has significant associative heritage value regarding Maple's commercial core development. The building design is a two-storey yellow brick commercial building built in the Georgian revival style and is a sympathetic and contributing property to the Maple HCD Commercial Core streetscape.

In 2010, a Heritage Permit was granted to the previous owner to generally restore the property. This permit included the repair and preservation of existing wood doors, storm and windows, frames, sash and trim, the masonry was repointed as needed and the wood fascia and soffit were also repaired and restored. During this period, the front steps at the

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

main front entrance and the secondary front entrance were both removed as shown in Attachment 4 and the lot was paved over. The existing landscape condition consists of weeds and asphalt.

Proposed Alterations

The current owner is proposing the following work to be undertaken as shown in Attachment 5, as part of Site Development File DA.13.104 to allow the property to be redeveloped into a spa. As the front steps of the building are missing, replacements that meet the Ontario Building Code are required:

**CONCRETE STAIRS**

Standard reinforced concrete blocks with rough edges at landing slabs.

Finish: Veneer Stone Finish

Color: Grey

**RAILINGS**

Material: Prefinished Metal

Color: Black

Railing Height: 1070mm

Posts Dimension: 50mm x 50mm

Pickets: 13mm x 13mm

Top Rail: 50mm x 38mm

Bottom Rail: 50mm x 19mm

As part of the York Region's road widening plan, the front yard of the property has been significantly reduced, limiting opportunities for replanting of trees or significant soft landscaping. The Owner proposes to install sidewalk pavers along the Keele Street entrances in accordance to the Maple Streetscape Plan for the Commercial Core. Planter boxes will be installed to incorporate elements of soft landscaping as shown in Attachment 6.

Other changes required for the property and adjacent roadway include the modification of the existing sidewalk and curb and the slight relocation of the stop sign, as required. None of these proposed changes would further alter the existing heritage attributes of the property.

Analysis

The following is an examination of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines relevant to the proposal to remove the existing outbuildings and alter the existing Victorian dwelling.

4.2.2 Heritage Buildings

- a) *Conserve the heritage value and heritage attributes of a heritage resource when creating any new addition or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the heritage resource.*
- b) *Ensure that any new addition, alteration, or related new construction will not detrimentally impact the heritage resource if the new work is removed in future.*

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

- The replacement stairs at the main entrance are similar to the original cement stairs present in 1941 and accommodate the new property line after road widening by York Region.
- The replacement stairs for the secondary entrance at Keele Street will be oriented to be parallel to the entry to accommodate the new property line. Although the original steps were likely wood, they were replaced at an unspecified time (possibly between 1978 – 1988) with the cement stairs that were present in 2009. Both sets of stairs extended further than what is permissible today.
- The wrought iron railings, although not generally seen in historic properties in Maple, are similar to the railings that were previously installed at the main entrance in 1941 and therefore is a compatible material.

**Section 9.3.6 Renovations**

*“When a renovation on a heritage building is undertaken, it should be part of the renovation to remove later work that conceals the original design, or is unsympathetic to it. Research, as described in Section 9.3.2, should be undertaken, and the design of new work should restore the principal architectural features of the original building.”*

The proposed stairs and railings to the front entrances of 10020 Keele Street are sympathetic to the existing structure and does not significantly conceal original design elements of the building. Replicating the original stairs is not possible at this time due to the new property line and the requirements of the Ontario Building Code.

All other exterior work on the structure is minor in nature – i.e. repainting wood trim in existing colours, repairing a broken window pane and therefore, is considered to be ongoing maintenance.

The installation of pavers are in keeping with the Maple Streetscape plan and the installation of planter boxes will provide an element of soft landscaping to the property.

**Conclusion**

Based on the above analysis, the proposed alterations to 10020 Keele Street are in conformity with the policies and guidelines of the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.

**Relationship to Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018)**

This report relates to the Term of Council Service Excellence Strategy Map (2014-2018) by supporting the following initiatives:

- Support and promote arts, culture, heritage and sports in the community

**Regional Implications**

N/A

**Conclusion**

The Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division has reviewed the proposed application and is satisfied that the proposed alterations 10020 Keele Street are consistent with the

**REPORT NO. 1 OF THE HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE  
FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF  
THE CITY OF VAUGHAN ON MARCH 6, 2018**

---

Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan. Accordingly, the Urban Design and Cultural Heritage Division of the Development Planning Department can support the approval of the proposed alterations under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, subject to the conditions in the Recommendations of this report.

**Attachments**

1. Location Map
2. Maple HCD Inventory Entry
3. 10020 Keele Street from 1941 - 2010
4. Current Condition
5. Site Plan and Elevations
6. Landscape Plan

**Report prepared by:**

Katrina Guy, Cultural Heritage Coordinator, ext. 8115

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

---

The meeting adjourned at 7:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Christine Radewych, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Council / Committee Administrator